

Development in Indo-Israel Defence Relations Since 9/11: Pakistan's Security Concern and Policy Options

Zahid Ali Khan

University of Balochistan, Quetta

ABSTRACT

In the post 9/11 scenario, bilateral relations between India and Israel in general, and, their defense relations in particular, have strengthened tremendously. The most striking commonality is their perception of Pakistan as their common enemy and a main obstacle, impeding the realization of their ambitions. India needs the friendship and cooperation of Israel in maintaining qualitative and quantitative superiority of defence capabilities over its enemy, Pakistan. For India, friendship of Israel would make her more powerful and strong to play an effective and significant role in the South Asia, Central Asia, and West Asia with a sole object to undermine the rising influence of Pakistan in these regions. Israel is primarily interested in a meaningful and constructive relations with India not because of its huge market for Israel's defense industry, but to suppress Pakistan's strong commitment to help the Middle Eastern states against Tel Aviv. It apprehends that Pakistan's nuclear program can be a source of strength for the Arab world, and Iran (Israel's worse and bitter adversaries). The emerging Delhi-Jerusalem- defence collaboration poses major challenges to the security and territorial integrity of Pakistan. Such relationship has the potential to make a significant impact on global politics by altering the balance of power, not only in South Asia but also in the entire Asian continent.

KEY WORDS: Israel, India, Defence Relations, Nuclear Deal, Pakistan's Concerns.

Introduction

Since its independence, India's relations with Israel were not good and friendly. Two factors were mainly responsible for divergence in their relations: India's pro-Arab attitude and its strong commitment to the Non-Aligned Movement (NAM) which created rift and division between these two countries. In 1992 a significant diplomatic change occurred, when India and Israel established full diplomatic relations which reached new heights under the successive Indian governments headed by BJP (1998-2004). Since India and Israel have established enduring and exemplenary partnership, for furthering their defense and security cooperation, the two states are also making concerted attempts to diversify this relationship. The

South Asian Studies 26 (1)

emergence of India and Israel, as industrialized and technologically-advanced states, especially, in the post 9/11 period makes their cooperation more meaningful, positive and productive. Both are pursuing their common hegemonic agendas of 'Greater Israel' and 'Akhand Bharat', since their inception. Both the countries have an oppressive attitude and hostility towards their neighbors and, both have forcibly occupied areas beyond their geographical borders. The importance of friendly relationship between Israel and India emanates from the nature of Israeli foreign policy, which seeks consistently to invest in an international climate and conditions that serve Israel's national goals, especially, those concerning the Arab-Israel conflict. India, on the other hand, desires to update its military technology, but more importantly, to enhance its military capabilities towards Indian national goals, especially, in the view of tackling Indian tensions with Pakistan. For India, the growing nuclear arsenal of Pakistan and its support to the people of Kashmir and different parts of India pose serious challenges. Israel, on the other hand is uncomfortable with the idea of a nuclear Pakistan. In the case of Israel, the nuclear capability of Pakistan and its support to Palestinian extremists poses a threat to its security. Moreover, Indo-Israel Joint military exercises and their Joint ventures in the field of defense and security would provide further strength and strategic depth to their relationship.

Therefore, it is important for policy makers of Pakistan to come out of illusion and acknowledge that the triad is developing against its security perspectives. The emerging Indo-Israel nexus is a matter of serious concern for Pakistan, despite of Pakistan's present status of non-NATO ally and close US partner of war against terrorism. Pakistan must understand the gravity of the situation and emerging security constraints to its sovereignty and survival. It has a full potential to disturb and threaten regional and global peace and security, if left unchecked.

Against this background, the paper examines those factors which are bringing the two nations (India and Israel) closer to each other. The paper primarily focuses on the growing multi-dimensional Indo-Israel nexus with special attention to their defense collaboration in the post 9/11 period. At last, the study will also explore and reveal the policy options of Pakistan and its future strategy to deal with emerging nexus of Indo-Israel India in the by making suitable recommendations and suggestions.

The Historical Background

The Republic of India and the State of Israel, both territories formerly administered by Great Britain, were established less than a year apart (India in August 1947 and Israel in May 1948). From the beginning, relations between the two new states proved rather arduous. The leaders of the Indian liberation movement Mahatma Gandhi and Jawaharlal Nehru had fervently opposed the partition of Palestine and the creation of a Jewish state on this territory. Although,

in September 1950, India officially recognized the Jewish State, but, the two states did not establish full diplomatic relations. Gandhi's attempts to woo Indian Muslims for the sake of Hindu-Muslim unity and Nehru's negative assessment of the Zionist movement, which he considered the child of imperialism, led the Indian National Congress to adopt a pro-Arab policy in the Arab-Jewish conflict. However, it is important to stress that India's negative attitude to the Zionist movement was not tainted by anti-Semitism.¹ Gandhi was not ready to recognize the Jewish nationalism, which was artificially created in Palestine at the cost of indigenous Arab population (Gordon, 1975). Nehru indicted Zionism for fostering Jewish settlement in Palestine at the expense of the Arab population. Nehru's dream of leading a non-aligned bloc made Delhi to think any positive gesture towards Israel as harmful to its vital interests. While the Indian rejection of the partition of Palestine and the anti-Western, anti-imperialist worldview of Indian leaders certainly played a role in the country's stance toward Israel during the entire period of the Cold War. India's support for Arab against Israel in the three Arab-Israeli wars of 1956, 1967, and 1973, and her full commitment and support for Palestine Liberation Organization (PLO) led by Yasser Arafat was the clear reflection of its pro-Arab attitude. Moreover, the friendly attitude of Indira Gandhi, her diplomatic recognition to the Office of PLO in New Delhi, and above, the frequent visits of Yasser Arafat to India in 1980 and 1982, was the another proof of India's anti-Israeli policy. (Hindustan Times, 27 March, 1980.)

But, despite of India's unfriendly attitude Israel extended full diplomatic and military support to India against Pakistan in the two Indo-Pak wars of 1965, and 1971. It may be noted that in the critical hour of need of the 1971 war with Pakistan, India had sought Israel's help to supply it with the devastating artillery weapon, 160 mm mortars and ammunition, exclusively manufactured in Israel. Israel's support to India against Pakistan was due to many factors. Besides of India's strong commitment for Arab cause, she established secret military and intelligence links with Israel as early as 1960. (Saint, Isabella: 2010). India was moving closer to Israel because the Arab states, who met in Casablanca in September, firmly supported Pakistan's cause in the Indo-Pak war of 1965. (Wolpert:1993). While, Israel's support for India was to neutralize Indian attitude towards Arab and Palestinian and to achieve its long-standing objectives in South-West Asian region. And above, Israel's whole-hearted support and cooperation to India in its wars against Pakistan was due its hatred and enmity towards Pakistan by considering as its bitter rival and foe. It is because of the ideological and religious cause which made Israel as a strong enemy of Pakistan. On the other hand, anti-Zionism is the hallmark of Pakistan's foreign policy since its independence in 1947. Pakistan considers Zionism as a threat to the entire Muslim world. Pakistan always offered itself to be the main source of opposition to any activity detrimental to Muslims anywhere. It is due of this factor which created hatred in the hearts and minds of Pakistani leadership towards Israel, especially, Quaid-e-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah who did not pay any response to

South Asian Studies 26 (1)

the request of Israeli Prime Minister, David Ben Cursion when he asked for the recognition of the State of Israel in 1948.

The beginning of India's relation with Israel since the disintegration of the Soviet Union (India's strong ally and partner) in 1992 has been viewed as an outcome of the post-cold war scenario. India's close collaboration with Israel is to build a new strategic relation vis-à-vis Pakistan. Full diplomatic relations were established and ambassadors were appointed in both countries on January 29, 1992. (Halim, 2003)

India had two objectives in promoting its relation with the Israel. Firstly, to overcome the propaganda unleashed by Pakistan on Kashmir situation. Secondly, India required strategic cooperation with the Israel due to the demise of the Soviet Union, the leading exporter of arms to India. It became imperative for India to modernize Indian weaponry. In this context India found Israel as a best option which emerged India's largest supplier of military equipment after Russia in the Post cold war period, (Nasser, 2007) while, India became the biggest market for Israeli arms (Koshy, 2008, <http://www.fpip.org/fpiftxt/4959>).

Indo-Israel Defence and Military Cooperation

The convergence of interests, common approaches and strategies in the changing global environment became the basis for the extensive development in Indo-Israeli military relations Since Soviet's disintegration (India's Principal military partner and friend) Israel became an alternate military supplier to India. The need for sufficient resources for the development of new weapons systems and advanced technologies, and, also the country's limited domestic armed market compel Israel to generate more revenues through the export of military products. India with its large domestic market and growing defense budget became an attractive partner for Israel since 9/11.

India's quest for technological predominance over Pakistan and Israeli's ambition to establish military superiority over its Arab neighbors and Iran accorded an opportunity for both the countries to strengthen their defence cooperation. Moreover, India's substantial difficulties with upgrading and modernizing its armed forces compelled it to seek long-term collaboration with Israel. For Israel, arms exports have been an integral part of its security policy since 9/11. Israeli defence industries cannot depend on the home market alone and about three-fourth of its production has to be exported. India presents an attractive market for Israel's defence industry.

The Afghanistan war, the Iraq war (the second Gulf War), and the Kargil crises of 1999, the 9/11 evets, the terror attack on the Indian parliament in New Delhi in December 2001, and the Mumbai terror attack in November 2008 all proved key elements in India's military collaboration with Israel. Israel is also helping India to fight freedom movement in Kashmir by providing important

logistical support such as specialized surveillance equipment, cooperation in intelligence gathering, joint exercises, and cooperation to stop money laundering and terror funding. India wanted to employ the similar Israeli techniques and tactics of guerilla warfare against Kashmiris and to counter insurgent movements. These tactics have also been adopted by the U.S. forces in Iraq which found useful and effective strategy to tackle growing insurgency there. (Dudkevitch, 2003)

The exchange of visits of military officials took place two countries from time to time which further strengthened the military ties between the two countries. As a result, demand for Israeli-military equipment has increased which made the latter the second largest weapons supplier to India after Hongkong.

The ultimate objective of Israel's inclination towards strengthening defence ties with India is to secure its defence industry and to start a proxy war² against Pakistan in Balochistan and in FATA. India and Israel are operating 17 camps in Taliban controlled area along Pak-Afghan border for the purpose of providing training to terrorists. The Taliban in FATA are now in close collaboration with Israel and India for carrying terrorist and subversive activities within Pakistan". (Ishfaq, 2010) The Nation, Pakistan's leading newspaper, reported on 18 June 2010 about the India's invitation to the group of Israeli activists to come to Kabul and to actively participate in anti-Pakistani activities. India's main objective was to intensify propaganda war against Pakistan in order to create mistrust and misunderstanding between NATO and Pakistani security forces. This was a pre-planned strategy to suppress Pakistan's role as a frontline state in the war on terror. (The Nation, 18 June 2010). Moreover, the change in the government both countries in 2004 did not affect the level of military cooperation. The Indian Defence Minister, Pranab Mukherjee, declared publicly: "There will be no change in the existing defense ties between India and Israel". (Indian Express, 1 July 2004).

After a resumption of four-year strategic talks between India and Israel on December 2005 (Indian Express, 12 December 2005), a Joint Defense Ministerial Committee was convened for the purpose of joint military cooperation and mutual military concern. Israeli-Indian military cooperation is, undoubtedly, a key strategic interest in the bilateral defence relations. Since the mutual exchange of visits of military high commands were increased. In June 2006 two Indian warships paid goodwill visit to Israel. In June 2007 Israel's Deputy Chief of General Staff, Maj.-Gen. Moshe Kolinsky led an Israeli military delegation to India, and in January 2008 Admiral Shureesh Mehta, Chairman of the Indian Chiefs of Staff Committee, visited Israel and on 6 December 2009 Israeli army chief of staff Lt. Gen. Gabi Ashkenazy paid a reciprocal visit to India. (Defense News 6 December, 2009).

It is due to their mutual trust, similar views and opinion, and common security interests that military collaboration between them has rapidly expanded over the last years. According to experts report, from 2002 to 2007 India received more than \$5 billion (including \$1.6 billion in 2006) arms from Israel, thus, making it

South Asian Studies 26 (1)

one of the main arms suppliers for India's armed forces. (Desai, 2008). By 2009, bilateral Military trade between two countries has touched US\$9 billion. Currently India is the largest customer of Israeli military hardware and second largest economic partner. Both are undertaking joint military exercises, training and cooperating in space technology. With over 150 defence firms, including three major state's owned firms (Israeli Arms Industry (IAI), Israel Military Industries (IMI) and the Rafael Arms Development Authority) Israeli defence economy generate 3.5 billion \$ as annual revenue. (Raja, 2010)

As India and Israel are eager to improve their defence capabilities in order to face similar challenges and threats, therefore, military cooperation between them became imperative for their defence industries to manufacture modern sophisticated weapons systems and technologies. The convergence of interests between them i.e. their fight against terrorism and radical Islam, their mutual concern over proliferation of weapons of mass destruction and long-range missile technology, and their growing coordination in Indian Ocean became the strong basis of their defence and military relations. (Kandel, 2010)

The Israeli Prime Minister, Ariel Sharon's four-day visit to India in September 2003 greatly signified the importance of Indo-Israeli defense relations it is the most significant event and a landmark in the Indo-Israeli defence relationship. In fact, the visit was made in the wake of the assassination of Palestinian leader by Israeli military forces. There were protests and disturbance in different parts of India against the visit of Israeli Prime Minister. However, the Indian government adopted a cautious policy of either to displease Sharon or to honor the public sentiments. (Pradhan, 2008:296-97) Many agreements were signed between the two countries. During his visit as Sharon was accompanied by a large delegation of about 30 influential businessmen, eager to forge new contracts and open new markets in India (Pant, 2004).

This visit had two important aspects. One, it signified the growing understanding between them to fight jointly against the forces of Islamic jihad and terrorism; second, it also acknowledged the important part played by Israel to assist India at critical junctures, by providing weapons, ammunition and sharing of intelligence, even in the face of strong international pressure. According to analysts, for India and Israel the common potential enemy has always been Pakistan – a Muslim nation with its firm commitment to help the Arab countries and Iran against Israel. "Israel had been proposing a surgical strike against Pakistan's nuclear assets since Morarji Desai was the prime minister of India, but, the real breakthrough only came during Ariel Sharon's recent visit to India in September, 2003.(Jayachandran, 2003).

Any analysis of Indo-Israeli relations needs to take these significant aspects into an account. In contextual terms, the importance of Indo-Israeli defence relations was outlined by national security advisor Brijesh Mishra in his recent address to the American Jewish Committee, when he argued that "the democratic countries that are the prime targets of international terrorism should form an

alliance and develop multilateral mechanisms to counter that menace. He identified India, the US and Israel as countries to form an alliance for this purpose. Such an alliance would have strong political will and moral authority to take bold decisions in the cases of terrorist provocation" (Sahgal, 2003).

Israel has two basic objectives in meaningful defense relations with India. First, India became a huge market for Israel's defense industry, and second, to contain Pakistan for helping the Middle Eastern states, especially, Saudi Arab and Iran against Tel Aviv. Mr Sharon's visit will consolidate this budding relationship by expanding defense relations.

The importance of modernizing and qualitative improvement in Indian military capabilities cannot be overstated. India's current perspective of modernization and up gradation of weapons is to maintain its elusive combat edge vis-à-vis Pakistan. Pakistan, on the other hand, has been able to maintain a dissuasive strategic balance by low to medium technology at reasonable prices. The contextual relevance of Indo-Israeli ties lies in Tel Aviv being able to assist India in achieving this objective (Sahgal, 2003).

The main advantage of the Indo-Israeli relationship lies in diversification of sources of supplies and in enhancing Indian defense, research and development and manufacturing capabilities through importing high technology through 'buy and make approach'. Such an approach will assist the Indian private sector in defense manufacture. In this regard, Hindustan Aeronautics Ltd's outsourcing program is significant. It is aimed at helping private Indian companies chose foreign partners who will help them with such high-tech projects as avionics and weapons system integration.

Space Cooperation

Israel's space program efforts centre on its high imaging capabilities, while, on the other hand, India's space program, which is one of the country's successful programme, covers a wide range of activities in launch vehicles, satellites and space applications. India builds a wide variety of remote sensing, meteorological, and communications satellites, which it launches with its own rockets.

The heads of the two countries' space organizations exchanged visits in December 2004 to finalize the space agreement between them. In September 2007 India launched Israel's TecSAR³, (India Defence, and 17 July 2007) and the two countries are collaborating on India's next generation satellite, RISAT-2⁴. On 20 April 2009 India launched an Israeli border-control imaging satellite that enables it to monitor its borders with Bangladesh, China, and Pakistan. India also launched an Israeli-made spy satellite from Sriharikota near Bangalore city in the southern State of Karnataka on April 20, 2009. It is in a bid to keep a twenty-four-hour surveillance on its international borders, news agencies quoted Indian defence officials. The 300 kg radar-imaging Israeli satellite was launched via India's

indigenous Polar Satellite Launch Vehicle (PSLV)⁵ and it will be positioned 500 km above the Earth. The satellite will help India track infiltration of militant movements on its borders with Pakistan and inside the country. It could capture the images even under clouds and transmit them to the country (Mainstream, 2009).

Israel: A Major Contender for Upgrading India's Security Technology

Israel is a major contender for the upgrading and modernizing India's 125 MiG-21 BIS aircraft. According to the sources of Indian defense headquarters India needs urgently the upgradation of almost whole of its MiG-21 BIS, MiG-27ML, and MiG-29 aircraft fleet and indigenous T-72 tanks. In this regard, Israeli company ELBIT has emerged as one of the favourite contenders. Another Israeli company, Soltam is already involved in upgrading one hundred and eighty 130 artillery guns to 155 artillery guns. Moreover, the joint cooperation between IAI (Israel air industry) and the Indian aircraft industry for upgrading Indian assault helicopters Mi-8 is also a remarkable achievement between the two countries. India has shown a keen interest in Israel's internal security technological program, equipments, and methods to meet the threat of cross-border terrorism in Kashmir, and the challenge posed by the extreme leftist groups which advocate Maoist methods to eliminate the class differences in many states. (Kumar, 2006)

In May 1998, Gen. V. P. Malik Chief of the Indian Army visited Israel. By this time India had already appointed an Air Force officer as Defense Attaché to Tel Aviv, and vice versa. All the weapon deals were finalized with Israel before the May 1998 clashes in Kashmir (The News, 11 March, 1998). More important, the visit of Indian Internal Security (Home) Minister L. K. Advani to Israel (May 2000) was a constructive step towards strengthening the Indo-Israeli defence cooperation. During his visit, Israel agreed to provide India with modern security equipments as well as training. The most important deal signed by the two countries during this visit was on the purchase of three airborne warning and control systems (AWACS) ⁶ planes, which Israel was willing to sell to the Indians (Singh, 2001).

Advani's visit to Israel was followed by that of India's Foreign Minister Jaswant Singh, the first ever Foreign Minister of India to pay a visit to Israel. The priority agenda during discussion was to expand security cooperation between the two countries. Israel desired Indian cooperation for its maritime security in Indian Ocean. India, which has the largest navy in the Ocean, can provide better security to Israel's commercial ships. Thus, India became Israel's key partner in safeguarding its vital strategic interests in Indian Ocean.

The Defence Research and Development Organization (DRDO)⁷ provides meaningful long-term opportunity and challenge for Israel. It can exploit the

opportunities provided by India's unprecedented quest for technology and modernization. Israeli anti-terrorism experts are training their Indian counterparts in checking infiltration along the borders, tracking movements of militants within the country, detecting explosives, defusing bombs and the use of many other devices and tactics developed by Israel. In the words of Prof. Cheema, "as far as India is concerned the cooperation with Israel has pronouncedly manifested in the state of Jammu and Kashmir. Not only the Israeli intelligence community has been assisting the Indian authorities in this region in terms of procuring essential information but the Israeli are now training and helping the Indians how to contain the freedom movement of the Kashmiris. (Cheema:2003<http://ipripak.org/article/newspaper//growing-indo-israel-nexus.shtml>).

Israel: Principal Supporter of Indian Missile Program

India's arms procurement from Israel has enabled it to become one of the world's five top most arms exporters. Some of the major Indian arms purchases from Israel include: Phalcon Advanced Airborne Early Warning Systems; Heron Unmanned Aerial Vehicles; Green Pine early-warning and fire-control radars; Barak Naval anti-missile defence system; Upgradation of 130 mm M-46 field guns by Israeli firm Soltam; Super-Dvora Mk II fast attack craft and Star Night Technologies Night Vision Goggles. Besides this, both countries have US\$2.5 billion joint collaboration in Spider quick-reaction surface to air missile (55 km range). In 2006, Indian Defence Research and Development Organization (DRDO) and Israel Aerospace Industries (IAI) concluded a five years contract of US\$480 million for the development of missiles. This deal was later enhanced to 2.5 billion \$ and included in its scope the missile development cooperation, which includes both air, and land based missile system. The deal also includes; unmanned aerial vehicles (UAV) ⁸, and satellites. (Raja, 2010) In August 2008 the two countries agreed to jointly develop a new version of the Spyder surface-to-air missile system (Asia Times, 2 April, 2009).

In March 2009 IAI signed a \$1.4 billion contract with India for air defence systems, including seaborne and shore-based systems against missile attack. The first of the three AWACS was delivered to India on 25 May 2009 (India Defence, 22 May 2009).

From the point of view of the ABM (Anti-ballistic missile) technologies, the Green Pine radar system.⁹ According to press report of Indian Defence Department that India is trying to acquire other components of Arrow technology from Israel in order to upgrade its Akash missiles with an advanced ABM capability (Twing, 1999:54). It is expected that both India and Israel may merge their ABM technologies in the future, depending upon the American approval. (Hartz, 25 December, 2001). India and Israel are also currently negotiating the possible sale of

South Asian Studies 26 (1)

the Arrow-2¹⁰ anti-ballistic missile defense system to India, which wants to strengthen its air defense capabilities (Feickert & Kronstadt, 2003).

The ELTA, (Electronics Industries Limited subsidiary of Israel Aircraft Industries), which has developed active, phased array radar technologies and modified early warning and control systems, has proposed further co-development of this technology with the India's Defence Research and Development Organization (DRDO)'s state-owned Electronics & Radar Research and Development establishment. In an ABM system, radars play the most crucial role and if the deal goes as planned, India would be able to upgrade its ground-based and ship-borne versions of the precision phased array radars and would be in a position to modify them for an ABM role.

Since 9/11, Indian defence links with the Israelis have grown considerably, especially, in the field of missiles, space technology, multi-mode radars, electronic warfare, stand-off guided missiles, unmanned aerial vehicles (UAVs), avionics upgrades for 400 existing IAF fighters, anti-tank missiles called Spikes, Barak missiles and most importantly the Arrow system.

Indo-Israel Nuclear Deal

Israel is the World's largest stockpiles of nuclear war-heads; it has 400 to 500 war-heads. Israel's nuclear capabilities is in most accounts quite sophisticated and include international range, fractional orbit delivered, thermo-nuclear weapons, solid fuel, intermediate range ballistic missiles with a range of 3000km with a payload of 1000kg, older less accurate nuclear armed, theatre range, boosted nuclear bombs, artillery delivered enhanced radiation, tactical weapons and small and small nuclear charges. (Rodan, 1997).

Israel has been a major contributor to India's defence profile, including cooperation in nuclear field. Israel is helping India to acquire missile capable of carrying nuclear war-heads. In this regard, Indo-Israel military agreement of \$1.1 billion for an upgradation of an air defence system for India. The system, produced by Israel, is designed for naval use, aboard ships, and can shoot down incoming missiles, planes and drones. This will add to India's missile nuclear capability, thereby further destabilizing the nuclear balance in South Asia. It helped India to develop a second strike capability.¹¹ Indo-Israeli deal has also severe repercussions for the neighborhood. For instance, through this deal Israel will get more naval access through India in the immediate vicinity of Pakistan. Hence, Pakistan will have to add to its nuclear delivery systems and warheads if it wants to keep its deterrence credible. (Mazari, 2009)

As both Israel and India have not signed the NPT and CTBT in 1996, therefore, they have common ground for formulating a coordinated defence policy. India and Israel have officially denied the existence of any nuclear cooperation between them. However, both countries share concern over Pakistan's nuclear

capability and Israel has always been concerned over the transfer of nuclear technologies to Iran, and Arab countries. Israel cannot rule out the possibility of nuclear technology spilling over to the Middle East, in particular after the publication of A. Q. Khan's sales of nuclear technology to Iran, Libya and North Korea. (Dawn, 25 January, 2009). Thus, Pakistani nuclear capability constitutes a security challenge for both countries. The Indo-US nuclear deal of 18 July 2005 is of great significance it would enable Israel to build a civilian nuclear reactor for energy supplying purposes in southern Israel.

Naval Cooperation

For Israel, the naval cooperation with India is of great strategic significance because of the latter predominant position in Indian Ocean. It is presumed that India's own perception cannot be otherwise as the credibility of its second strike capability would largely depend on the sea-borne leg of its nuclear triad (Koshy, 2003, www.ruthfullyyours.com/2010/11).

As Israel does not achieve its ambitions in Mediterranean due to presence of Arab and European that is hostile to the Israeli navy in varying degrees, it desires to acquire the potential of establishing a logistical infrastructure in the Indian Ocean with the cooperation of the Indian Navy. In 2000, Israeli submarines also conducted test launches of cruise missiles capable of carrying nuclear warheads in the waters of the Indian Ocean off the Sri Lanka coast. India purchased 50 Israeli drones for \$220 million in 2005. India is also in the process of obtaining missile-firing Hermes 450s. In August 2007, India proposed defence collaboration with Israel in developing sophisticated unmanned combat helicopters for the Navy, which would need 40-50 such helicopters. India had earlier bought 14 Barak-I anti-missile defence systems for the Navy followed by the Python air-to-air missiles, Crystal Maze PGMs, Derby air-to-air missiles, Delilah-II air-launched cruise missiles and Gabriel-III sea-skimming anti-ship missiles. (Rabb, 2007)

From an Israeli perspective, India can assist Israel in offering the naval and other facilities that it does not possess. A similar proposition was made by Professor Martin Sherman in an article published in the Jerusalem Post on February 28 entitled "From Conflict to Convergence: India and Israel Forge a Solid Strategic Alliance". The author argues that the naval alliance with India is important for Israel as it intends to develop a sea-borne defense capability. In view of the miniscule territorial dimension of Israel, its defense planners are increasingly aware of the crucial significance of the marine and sub-marine theaters. The vulnerability of Israel's land-based military installations grows with the acquisition of modern weaponry by other countries in the region (Sherman, 2003).

IAI is developing the Barak-8 missile for the Indian Navy and Air Force which is capable of protecting sea vessels and ground facilities from aircraft and

cruise missiles. The missile has a range of over 70 kilometers. On November 10, 2008, Indian military officials visited Israel to discuss joint weapons development projects, additional sales of Israeli equipment to the Indian military, and counter-terrorism strategies. The main issue of talks was expansion in Indian-Israeli naval cooperation (Shahnaz, 2010).

Cooperation in the naval sphere would help India to develop its blue water navy¹² and Israel's increasingly challenging geo-strategic needs. After its withdrawal from Gaza in a quest for peace and, due to the growing Iranian nuclear threat, Israel is compelled to turn to the marine theater for second-strike capability. Such capacity is essential for nations upholding a no-first-use policy (not to use nuclear weapons as a means of warfare unless first attacked by an adversary utilizing nuclear, chemical, or biological warfare). Thus, both Israel and India are potential targets for first-use nuclear strikes by their adversaries—in each case. The seaborne second-strike capability has to be operative from the Indian Ocean, and hence strategic cooperation with the Indian Navy is an imperative (Sherman, 2008, www.ruthfullyyour.com/2010/11/08-martin-sherman-strategic-bedfellow).

Joint Research Production

The growing Indo-Israeli friendship in the military sphere since 9/11 is the direct outcome of their joint - production and research relationship. In this regard, India and Israel have decided to work together in the field of electronic warfare. Joint production of defence equipment is possible because of “the quality of India's hi-tech manpower, its considerably lower production costs, high industrial capability and its solid and reliable experience”. Because of our close strategic understanding, a formal agreement or a memorandum of understanding is unnecessary and actual co-production can be decided between India and Israeli military industries on an item by item basis. (Singh, 2001). If properly pursued, these joint ventures may burgeon into a partnership for the co production of armaments for sale to Third World countries and both countries will gain considerably from such collaboration. Similarly, joint military exercises by the Indian and Israeli armed forces would provide further strategic depth for their bilateral mutual relationship. (Niazi, 2006).

India's drive for technological expertise and independence, its financial constraints and Israel's operational deficiencies are the three considerations which make joint research and development an attractive proposition. Facing similar challenges in a number of fields, both countries can coordinate and compliment their experience, expertise and demands. A number of on-going programs in India are not different from their Israeli counterparts including LCA (light Combat Aircraft), (Lavi), Arjun (Merkava), Prithvi (Jericho-1) and Agni (Jericho-11). Irrespective of the ability of the DRDO to deliver the LCA by 2005, India would

not be able to replace its entire fleet overnight and would have to upgrade the existing MiG fleet including MiG-21 as well as MiG-27 and MiG-29. Israel, a joint venture with the HAL Hindustan Aeronautics Limited would significantly reduce cost thereby making the offer financially attractive and competitive. (Meria Journal, 1998).

Furthermore, in the military sphere, India and Israel are working to upgrade their existing weapons technologies and development of new technologies. For instance, report in the 'Times of India' states that Indian and Israeli defence officials have initiated work on an unmanned helicopter. Being developed by Hindustan Aeronautics Ltd (HAL) and Israel Aerospace Industries' unmanned air vehicle division, Malat, this helicopter will have dual automated sophisticated operating systems for enhanced safety. (Times of India, 2 April 2008). Israel will also be installing a set of three wide-field ultra-violet telescopes on India's GSAT-4 satellite. India and Israel have also decided to set up a joint fund for research and development, with the aim of promoting technology-based trade and collaboration that will help them tap into the global market together.

Pakistan's security Concern

Pakistan is highly apprehended over the emerging Indo-Israel strategic and defence relations. The close defense cooperation between India and Israel has worried Pakistan which brought about quick response from Islamabad. President Pervez Musharaff, Prime Minister, Zafarullah Jamali and other senior officials held a meeting to discuss and examine Sharon's visit to India and its negative impact on the security of Pakistan. Gen.Musharraf said that there would be no compromise on his country's defense and all available resources would be allocated for this purpose. The sale of Phalcon systems by Israel to India was a matter of grave concern for Pakistan. Foreign Minister Khurshid Kasuri said that Israel's sale of weapons to India could disturb the balance of power in South Asia. Visits of such nature in which the primary purpose is the sale of ultra-modern and strategic weaponry aimed at disturbing the balance of power in South Asia, ultimately, it will be the people of Pakistan who will pay the price. We do not have any aggressive intention against any country. But we have taken all possible precautionary measures in all fields to defend every inch of our country (www.mtholyoke.edu/org/cwp/project/us_armscontrol/xinhau_Pak_concern.htm).

While commenting on Sharon's visit to India, Pakistani Foreign Office Spokesman Masood Khan at his weekly press briefing on 3 September 2003 said "The growing Indo-Israeli defence cooperation will destabilise the region and we have warned of the dangerous consequences of such collaboration. Indian plans to buy anti-ballistic missiles and other sophisticated weapons from Israel would disturb the strategic balance in South Asia. If this axis is directed against Pakistan

South Asian Studies 26 (1)

and Pakistani Muslims, we would be most concerned as this would be a very negative development. We have warned against the dangerous consequences of such a collaboration between India and Israel and I think such a collaboration should be avoided at all costs, the defense cooperation particularly" (Munir Ahmad: www.highbeam.com/doc/IPI_79363901).

India's advanced nuclear and missile capabilities, its operational and deployment capabilities, its modern and sophisticated weapons, its effective air, naval, and satellite program has already provided India with the strategic advantage over Pakistan. India's missile superiority and its intention to destroy Pakistan's nuclear and missile program by establishing its own hegemony over the countries of South-Asia became the matter of grave concern for Pakistan. As far as the Israel is concerned, it would be a real gainer from the strategic partnership with India. For Pakistan, the Indo-Israeli deal presents further complications to its security parameters. Already, we are confronted with a two-front war: one at home with extremists in our midst; and a second through the covert low intensity conflict being waged by India in Pakistan's sensitive provinces of Balochistan and KPK as well as FATA. The flow of weapons and money coming in from Afghanistan for this purpose has now been established without a shadow of doubt, by our government but for some strange reason it merely makes declaratory accusations while taking no action..

If these relations continue with the same speed and vigor it will be more difficult for Pakistan to match the joint Indo-Israel conventional military capability. (Haroon Habib) Pakistan has also to be conscious of the fact that the growing defence and security relationship between India and Israel has largely been nurtured with the help of the US. These concerns are further strengthened by the Indo-America nuclear deal and other agreements that would lift U.S. restrictions on high-technology trade with India. This agreement covers cutting-edge technology pertaining to civilian nuclear energy, space, missile defense, and hi-tech commerce.

Pakistan has the following grave concerns of the growing Indo-Israel military and defence collaboration.

- Indo-Israel collaboration poses serious challenges to Pakistan's nuclear deterrence capability by eroding strategic equilibrium and shifting the balance of power in India's favor. Pakistan has committed of maintaining a credible deterrent in both conventional and non conventional weapon systems.
- Collaboration between New Delhi and Israel, particularly in the nuclear and space fields might enlarge the irregularity in the conventional and non-conventional balance of power between India and Pakistan.
- Israel's state-of-the-art weapon systems will help India in restructuring its armed forces to meet the defense requirements of the twenty-first century.
- The acquisition of Phalcon early-warning system will enable India to look deep into Pakistan and detect Pakistani warplanes at the start of their move.

- India's close association with Israel in the shape of Patriot Advanced Capability (PAC), and Green Pine Radar system not only provides India with the surveillance of Pakistan's nuclear centers and missile sites, all Pakistan's military command centers, cantonments, and air bases, but would provide India with the missile defence cover over the key parts of the territory against Pakistan.
- Deployment of missile defence systems by India, like Arrow II (Israel's system), combined with the India's superiority in nuclear warheads and missile numbers, could neutralize Pakistan's Ghauri and Shaheen missiles. Since these missiles also have the capability to intercept aircrafts and cruise missiles, these would seriously affect Pakistan's Air Force's ability to act as first strike force. More significantly, BMD capability would allow India to launch pre-emptive strikes, rendering Pakistan's limited ballistic missile capability ineffective.
- The Israeli Barak anti-missile system will protect the Indian Navy ships from Pakistan's missiles, giving the Indian Navy huge maneuver advantages vis-à-vis Pakistan.
- Collaboration between the Indian intelligence agency, RAW (Research and Analysis Wing), and Mossad is a dangerous move against Muslim World in general and Pakistan in particular.
- Israeli setting up of its naval bases in Indian Ocean along with India will seriously aggravate the chances of Pakistan to preserve its life line along Indian Ocean and put its fragile security situation in fix.
- An alliance between India and Israel, openly endorsed by the US, would create a potent destabilizing force in the region, and India is likely to switch the focus of this alliance towards Pakistan on the pretext of facing down the forces of radical extremism so hostile to American interests in south, western and central Asia and beyond. Israel has even gone to the extent of saying that an "unwritten and abstract" axis with India and the United States has been created to combat international terrorism.

Policy Options for Pakistan

On the other hand, Pakistan's ability to produce its own missile defence systems is extremely limited both from the technological point of view as well from the economic one. Its prospects of acquiring the modern and effective missile system like India is also not very bright. The lack of support from the Great Powers left Pakistan so far behind India in missile capability. Moreover, the specific size, configuration, disposition, and possible deployment of Pakistan's ballistic missile force are not entirely known at present. Pakistan does not have a large and vertically integrated research, development, and manufacturing infrastructure to build long-range rockets. Furthermore, there is poor coordination and integration

South Asian Studies 26 (1)

between government-controlled research and development labs, public sector firms, and private sector companies. In addition, Pakistan does not as yet produce basic strategic materials, such as aerospace-grade specialty steels, alloys, and composites, for which it is entirely dependent on imports. This deficiency also extends to missile guidance, control and navigation systems, and components such as gyroscopes, missile computers, and accelerometers. Finally, Pakistan lacks the requisite human capital--a large and dedicated pool of aerospace scientists and engineers from which to draw on for a large-scale ballistic or cruise missile program. Accordingly, India's superiority over Pakistan is 3:1 to 1 ratio in ballistic missiles, 4:1 in nuclear arsenals. The Indo-Israel coordination will further placed Pakistan in a worse and awkward position.

Security has been the overriding and foremost concern of Pakistan—both internal and external. It goes without saying that Pakistan is a peaceful country: it seeks actively a peaceful international order. It has always sought and upheld peaceful settlement of regional and international disputes. National security is a prime objective of international politics and the hallmark of states' foreign policy. National security is a primary and permanent national interest, taking into consideration as a focal point of 'high politics' or 'politics among nations'. This is particularly true in the case of Pakistan's national security. Pakistan's national security agenda has been fluctuating with every major and minor international event.'

In case the India-Israel strategic partnership becomes institutionalized, Pakistan's threat perception regarding India's heightened military proficiency—stemming from military-to-military contacts and joint exercises between India, Israel US air forces and navies - , thereby further widening the gap between the armed forces of the two South Asian rivals. In such circumstances, the best option for Pakistan is to turn to the East, that is, China for the quest for security: Moreover, Pakistan would be in a better and advantageous position if it gets full membership of Shanghai Cooperation Organization, which would prove to be a best platform from the point of view of security vis-à-vis the notorious and evil designs of these two rivals.

There is a much greater level of alarm in Pakistan, which perceives the Israel-India linkage as being a direct threat to its own security. To meet the growing challenge Indo-Israel defence collaboration and its adverse effect on its security perspective, Pakistan has two options. First, to establish diplomatic relations with Israel. In this regard, In July, the President of Pakistani Gen. Pervez Musharaff said that "in view of Israeli-Palestinian rapprochement - the peace process - Pakistan needs to reconsider its relationship with Israel". There have been reports that a well-connected Pakistani businessman visited Israel in recent months in order to improve the prospects of diplomatic and commercial relations between the two countries. In addition, Pakistani foreign policy strategists believe that, by building up a relationship with Israel, Islamabad would have access to high-tech weapons systems and other arms from the latter, Israel. The Pakistani leadership

also calculated that, through a relationship with Israel, it could prevent the powerful Jewish and Indian lobbies in the US from launching efforts to isolate Pakistan. But, this option will not succeed in a long run due to a strong protest from the people, particularly, the religious circles in Pakistan.

The other option for Pakistan is to look towards China. Like Pakistan China is equally affected by Indo- Israel military nexus as detrimental to its long-standing geo-political and strategic objectives in South Asia, and she desired to sabotage Indo- Israel nexus owing to its strained relation with India. In order to prevent India to establish its hegemony in South Asia following the conclusion of Indo-Israel military and strategic friendship, China wanted to improve relations with Israel .Israel is apparently keen on reviving its bilateral relations with China after they suffered a major setback when Israel cancelled the Phalcon spy plane deal with China under U.S. pressure. Counter-terror cooperation and defense trade seem to be driving Sino-Israel relations just as in the case of Indo-Israel relations. (Opall-Rome, 2003) Israel sees China not only as another huge market for its defense products, but also as a significant global player that can play a constructive role in favor of Israel in multilateral forums like the UN. Though Israel's relations with China will indubitably be conducted under the watchful eyes of the United States, India will have to be concerned about the ramifications of close defense cooperation between Israel and China, especially in light of China's close defense ties with Pakistan.

Conclusion

Bilateral relations between India and Israel have strengthened significantly since 9/11. Common views and opinions, mutual trust and understanding and the convergence of interests on most of the regional and global of issues brought these two countries close to each other. Defense ties and recognition of Pakistan as a common foe became the solid basis of their relationship in contemporary World. In the current international environment, both need each other than before How far the two sides are willing to make use of this opportunity depends ultimately on the political will in the two states. At the beginning of the 21st century, South Asia and the Middle East pose major challenges to international peace and security. The emerging Delhi-Jerusalem strategic alliance is creating much concern in the Pakistan, but could become one of the crucial factors maintaining global security.

To meet its growing military needs of upgradation and modernization of its defense muscles India has determined to achieve self-reliance in its surveillance capabilities, missiles, and air fleet. Due to heavy cost of conducting research and development, India is relying on import of components and collaboration. India's attempts to improve its defense system with the aim to counter its nuclear-armed adversary, Pakistan, have been actively supported by Israeli weapon system that includes surface-to-air missiles, avionics, and sophisticated sensors to monitor

cross-border infiltration, remotely piloted drones, and artillery. India's huge and lucrative defense market is offering a golden opportunity for Israel to exploit it for economic gains as well as political benefits. Israel has been forthcoming in supplying India with state-of-the-art defense related equipment and technologies. Israel's provision of equipment and technology in the areas of electronics, missile technology and intelligence has been hallmark in their bilateral relations so far. India is also determined to benefit from Israel's expertise in fighting against insurgency and freedom movement. In essence, Indo-Israel relations have assumed tremendous importance because it is based on very security considerations. Any meaningful and constructive relationship between India and Israel is more likely to cover joint research, joint production and the transfer of technology.

The Indian-Israeli defence relations continue to grow stronger, irrespective of the strong opposition from traditional Arab Islamic States and Iran. From Intelligence sharing, to counter-terrorism discussions, a number of aspects of this relationship continue to be cloaked in secrecy. India is one of the 39 countries with whom Israel has signed "secret cooperative agreements" to prevent information leaks from joint security projects. The Indian-Israeli relationship has evolved over the years and it can be safely assumed that the current positive trends will stay.

India-Israel military cooperation made India more strong geo- strategically in South Asia, thus undermining Pakistan's strategic depth in the region. For Pakistan, the growing India-Israel relation has come no surprise, but the convergence of interests between the two countries. Any kind of cooperation between India and Israel always created apprehensions in the Pakistan. However, with the Indo-Israeli strategic collaboration gaining momentum in recent years, Pakistan is becoming more vocal and critical of it. Since 9/11 Pakistani leadership and government openly warned against the danger of growing India-Israel military cooperation. The growing Indo-Israeli strategic ties, especially, the possibility of cooperation in the missiles and nuclear fields, have provided Pakistan a fresh opportunity to gain support China, the Arab world, and Iran. For Pakistan, any kind of nuclear cooperation between India and Israel as a serious threat to its security.

More important, the current regional and global imperatives have created a consensus in Delhi and Jerusalem that their security and defence collaboration will be mutually beneficial in the short term as well as in the long term. Their special relationship has gone beyond the institutional framework and is gradually becoming stronger as their interaction multiplies. The future of the Indo-Israeli strategic alliance is tied up with domestic issues, regional security and the global strategic environment. The two countries still need to develop a common security threat. Similarly, joint military exercises by the Indian and Israeli armed forces would provide further strategic depth for their relationship. India as the emerging power of the 21st century, Jerusalem must take into account India's overall strategic objectives in the Middle East, which always coincide with Jerusalem's objectives Israel whole-hatred's support to India at the United Nations, where

India is a strong contender for a permanent seat in the Security Council. Similarly, India can play a constructive role in further legitimizing Israel's role in South and Central-Asia.

Notes

1. Anti-Semitism is prejudice against or hostility towards Jews often rooted in hatred of their ethnic background, culture, and religion. In its extreme form, it attributes to the Jews an exceptional position among all other civilizations, defames them as an inferior group and denies their being part of the nation in which they reside. A person who holds such views is called an anti-Semite.
2. It refers to situation where the nation States are engaged in cold war, propaganda, or even the deployment of troops and skirmishing, but do not intend to go for hot war. The adoption of proxy war is also a strategy in international relations.
3. It is an Israeli reconnaissance satellite, equipped with synthetic aperture radar developed by Elta Systems. The satellite is fitted with a large dish-like antenna to transmit and receive radar signals that can penetrate darkness and thick clouds. Built by Israel Aerospace Industries, TecSAR ranks among the world's most advanced space systems.
4. It is India's first satellite with synthetic aperture radar. It has a day-night, all-weather monitoring capability. Potential applications include tracking hostile ships at sea that could pose a military threat.
5. It is commonly known by its abbreviation PSLV, is an expendable launch system developed and operated by the Indian Space Research Organisation (ISRO). It was developed to allow India to launch its Indian Remote Sensing (IRS) satellites into sun synchronous orbits, a service that was, until the advent of the PSLV, commercially viable only from Russia. PSLV can also launch small size satellites into geostationary transfer orbit (GTO). The PSLV has launched 41 satellites (19 Indian and 22 from other countries) into a variety of orbits till date.
6. An airborne early warning and control (AWACS) system is an airborne radar system designed to detect aircraft. Used at a high altitude, the radars allow the operators to distinguish between friendly and hostile aircraft hundreds of miles away. AEW&C aircraft are used for defensive and offensive air operations. The system is used offensively to direct fighters to their target locations, and defensively to counter attacks. It can also be used to carry out surveillance, and C2BM (command and control, battle management) functions.
7. It is an agency of the Republic of India, responsible for the development of technology for use by the military, headquartered in New Delhi, India. DRDO has a network of 52 laboratories which are deeply engaged in developing defence technologies covering various fields, like aeronautics, armaments, electronic and computer sciences, human resource development, life sciences, materials, missiles, combat vehicles development and naval research and development. The organization includes more than 5,000 scientists and about 25,000 other scientific, technical and supporting personnel.
8. It is as a powered, aerial vehicle that does not carry a human operator, uses aerodynamic forces to provide vehicle lift, can fly autonomously or be piloted remotely, can be expendable or recoverable, and can carry a lethal or no lethal payload
9. It is the most crucial component as it provides an early-warning alert, impact point prediction and launch point location of incoming threats. Furthermore, it is

South Asian Studies 26 (1)

- designed to handle simultaneous interceptions of 14 ballistic missiles with a typical range of 1500 km, and also be able to discriminate between real threats and decoys.
10. It is anti-tactical ballistic missile. It is the advanced version of arrow-1 is designed to intercepts short and medium range missiles at the distance of 500 km. Each battery of arrow-2 can equipped with at 50 missiles. Israel has a plan to deploy three batteries of arrow, which will cover up to 85% of its population.
 11. A country's assured ability to respond to an attack with a counterattack that will inflict unacceptable damage on the aggressor). Such capacity is essential for nations upholding a no-first-use policy (not to use nuclear weapons as a means of warfare unless first attacked by an adversary utilizing nuclear, chemical, or biological warfare.
 12. A maritime force capable of operating on the "high seas" outside the territorial waters of the home nation

References

- Budding Israel-India relationship bad for Pakistan. (2003, May 21). *Daily Times*.
- Cheema, Pervaiz Iqbal. "Growing Indo-IsraeliNexus.<http://ipripak.org/article/newspaper/growing-indo-israel-nexus.shtml>.
- Desai, Ronak D. (2008, July 10).Xenia Dormandy, "Indo-Israeli Relations: Key Security Implications. *Policy Brief*.
- Dudkevitch, Margot. (2003, December 8).US force in Iraq adopt IDF Strategy. *Jerusalem Post*.
- Feickert, Andrew & Kronstadt, K.Alan. (2003, October 17).Missile Profile and Strategic Balance in South Asia. *CRS Report for congress*.
- Gordon, Leonard A. (1975).Indian Nationalist Ideas about Palestine and Israel. *Jewish Social Studies*. 37, Summer-Fall.
- Habib, Haroon. (2003, September 11). Defence Deal aims at Upsetting the Balance of Power. *The Hindu*.
- Halim, Ahmed Abdel. (2003, November 23). The Indo-Israel military relationship and its Impact on the Arab world. *TheMonitors*.
- <http://www.amin.org/look/amin/en.tpl?IdLanguage=1&IdPublication=7&NrArticle=41334&NrIs sue=1&NrSection=3>.
- India interested in buying Arrow anti missile system. (2001, December 25).*Haretz*.
- Indian army Chief Visits Israeli Military Installations. (1998, March 11).*The News*.
- Ishfaq, Shamsa. (2010, August 29).Indo-Israel nexus is a threat to regional peace. *Pakistan. Daily News*.
- Jayachandran, C.R. (2003, Oct 14).Pak fears joint Indo-Israeli Strike. *Times of India*.
- Kandel, Arielle.Indo-Israeli relations in the post-cold war period. (2010 April 21)*Blitz*, Vol.5, No.17.
- Koshy, Ninan. (2003, September 10).The India-Israel-US Nexus.*The News*.
- Kumar, Dinesh. (2006) "India and Israel: Dawn of a New Era. <http://pakistanthinktank.org/v2/Categoryblog/233-india-and-israel-dawn-of-a-new-era?Format=pdf>
- Koshy, Ninan. (2008).India and Israel Eye on Iran. <http://www.fpiif.org/fpifixt/4959>
- Mainstream*. (2009 May) Vol., XLVII. No 20.The Journal of Africans in Mainstream America.
- Mazari, Shireen M. (2009, November 11).Indo-Israeli military Nexus. *Meria Journal*. (1998, May) Vol.2,No.2. Middle-East Review of International affairs.
- Muhammad, Raja. (2010, April 12) Yet another Angle of Indo-Israel Collaboration. *Kashmir Watch*.

- Nasser, Nicola. (2007). Indian-Israeli Ties Could Neutralize Delhi's Palestinian Policy.
- Niazi, Muhammad Zulfikar Khan. Indo-Israel-US Nexus. (2006)*The Dialogu* Vol. 2, No, 3.
- Opall-Rome, Barbara. Israel. (2003, December 15). China to Revive Ties.*Defence News*.
- Pant Harsh V. (2004, December) .India-Israel Partnership: Convergence and Constraints. *The Middle East Review of International Affair*. Vol .8, No.4.
- Pradhan, Bansidhar. (2008). *Globalisation and the Shift in India's Palestine Policy*, in Anwar Alam (Ed.), *India and West Asia in the Era of Globalisation*.New Delhi: New Century Publications.
- Rodan, Steve "Better Choices: Israel Chemical Dilemma", Jerusalem Post, August 18, 1997.
- Sahgal, Arun. (2003, September 19). Israel and India join forces. *Asia Times*.
- Saint, Isabella. (2010, October 31). India and Israel Unlikely Alliance. Available at <http://intellibriefs.blogspot.com/2010/10/india-and-israel-unlikely-alliance.html>.
- Shahnaz, Sobia. (2010, November 30).Indo-Israeli relations & its effects on Pakistan. Pakistan Observer.
- Shamsur Rabb.(2010)Indo-Israel Defence Cooperation, Step in the right direction. www.ipcs.org/article/military/indo-israel-defence-cooperation-a-step-in-the-right-direction.
- Sherman, Martin. (2003, February 28). From Conflict to Convergence: India and Israel forge a Solid Strategic Alliance. *Jerusalem Post*.
- Sherman, Martin. (2010). Strategic Bedfellows.www.ruthfullyyours.com/2010/11/08-martin-sherman-strategic-bedfellow.
- Singh, Jasjit. 'How can Israel Help in Kashmir', The Times of India, July 9, 2000.
- Singh, S. R. (2001). India and Israel: Towards greater cooperation. *India Quarterly*, 57/4.
- Strengthening relations. Israel-India bonds. (2005, January 6).www.f-net/index.php?name=PN.php&BBZand file=wiewtopic&P=23192.
- Twing, Shawn I. (1999, January/February) 'Special Report, US, Israel at Odds over Israel Defence Sales and Technology Transfers to India and China', Washington Report on Middle Eastern Affairs. p. 54.
- US Trying to Stop Arrow Sale to India', The Jerusalem Post, January 16, 2002.
- US-India-Israel Axis to Fight Terror. (2003, September 11).*Indian Express*.
- Wolpert, Stanley. (1993). *Zulfi Bhatto of Pakistan*. New Dehli: Oxford University Press.

Biographical Note

Dr. Zahid Ali Khan is Assistant Professor in the Department of International Relations at University of Balochistan, Quetta.
