

A Comparative Analysis of India and Pakistan's Naval Strategy: (2001-2019)

Damiya Saghir

M.Phil Scholar, Political Science Department, Kinnaird College for Women, Lahore, Pakistan

Email: damiya.saghir.ds@gmail.com

Dr. Khushboo Ejaz

Assistant Professor, Political Science Department, Kinnaird College for Women, Lahore, Pakistan.

Email: khushboo.ejaz@kinnaird.edu.pk

ABSTRACT

Pakistan and India have remained to be foes with a fixture and their competitiveness continues to grow within the Indian Ocean Region as well. This research paper focuses on comparing the Maritime Strategy of India and Pakistan in terms of their capabilities, strengths, weaknesses, threats, and challenges. Further in the paper with the help of literature review and interviews it is discussed how both the countries differ majorly and have more or less similar threats to face from each other whereas the ultimate goal of maritime strategy remains to be different for both. As the growing importance of sea is realized by the world leaders, Pakistan still faces a sea blindness in terms of resources and equipment. With this paper an analysis of budget, fleet and a comparison of objectives of both the navies is presented with a clear conclusion of who is winning the battle in the Indian Ocean. Robust and Multifaceted Pakistan Navy still has a long way to go to reach competitiveness able to be compared with India and should focus more on research, coordination, and planning.

Key words: Maritime, Pakistan Navy, India, Indian Ocean & Military

Introduction

Just like land and air threats, navy has been engaging itself in imposing threats to one another. In the recent past, when the Pulwama attack took place, Indian Navy thwarts attempts to enter Pakistani waters stating they were hunting the lost PNS Saad. The Indian navy had deployed their best of all submarines, including the nuclear one, to find and attack the PNS if it was found to be propagating against the Indian Navy. However, it proved to be a false claim. This incident is a clear depiction of how tactful the relation between the navies is and that there is a dire need to come to terms and peace with one another. The Indian and Pakistani soldiers have continued to fire artilleries towards each other and have fought several wars. These wars and the current stringent interspace recall the loathed relationship between the divided states of the sub-continent due to which we

continuously experience a rise of rage through the buildup of security setups. Both the countries have their own reasons to justify their spending on the war equipment and nothing has stopped any of them, which is why an urgent assessment of the naval strategies and revising the status of the two navies is deemed to be necessary.

Peace has always remained to be a timed guest due to the constant squabble between the two neighboring foes. After the mightiest break down of the Indian sub-continent, Pakistan and India have been the determined foes with fixture. Both the states begin to progress together with whatever, more and less resources they were given. Today, following 72 years of freedom of the sub-continent from the Britishers, India has turned into an Asian leviathan in terms of economy, society and security whereas Pakistan still stays to be in its crude period of improvement. From time to time, both the nations keep the world chiefs occupied in examining who lost control.

It is witnessed that there is a huge development in the numbers and enhancement of Indian navy. They outnumber the Pakistan navy in terms of quantity and quality. This is of huge concern for Pakistan because among the percentage of budget which goes to the defense of this country, the amount which goes to the Pakistan navy equals the amount of salt in bread due to which Pakistan lacks behind in weaponry and technology.

Since both the states came into being, today the Indian navy has grown to become twice the size of the Pakistani navy, with better gear and progressively experienced and prepared naval staff. Be that as it may, saying the greater the better does not go along here. Because of Pakistan's long land fringe with India, the navy is probably not going to assume an essential job in the underlying threats. Nevertheless, its centrality and most noteworthy endeavors cannot be left aside. To further stress the influence of the navy in the Pakistani military, a few interviewees and a scope of sources alluded to the claim that in 1971 war, the naval force head found out about the episode of threats while tuning in to the radio. Nonetheless, the naval force would probably be significant in a drawn out clash so as to keep up Pakistan's entrance to essential ocean paths (Jalil, 2016).

Both the countries have been indulging in activities that help in enhancing and multiplying of forces in order to protect themselves. When we discuss of naval power, Pakistan and India both have come up with a maritime doctrine to help specify their purpose and need for protection and use of force.

Rationale

Pakistan has been inadequate with regards to the fundamental learning that should be comprehended regarding the presentation of the navy. With the assistance of this research comparison of India and Pakistan's naval forces will be studied in order to fully understand the Strengths, weaknesses, threats and challenges faced by both the navies.

Problem statement

There is a need to compare the naval capabilities, strengths, weakness, threats and challenges faced by India and Pakistan in the 21st century.

Research objectives

- To define the term Naval Strategy.
To compare the Indian and Pakistani Naval capabilities
To figuratively explaining the strengths and weaknesses of both the navies.
To study the role of regional and extra regional actors on development of these navies and its implications
- To suggest the options available for Pakistan navy to counter Indian Naval strategy.

Research methodology

It is a qualitative study. Historical, analytical and descriptive methods will be used to conduct the study. To complete the area that needs to be looked in mind will specifically be within Pakistan Naval Headquarters.

An in-depth analysis of strengths and weaknesses of both the navies will be carried out with the help of primary data, maritime data, interviews and official documents

Secondary data has been collected from existing interviews with the navy officers of India; the comparison will be based on the books, journals and existing research conducted by the Naval Colleges of India or by any naval officer.

Literature review

Ansari (2017) says that the maritime doctrine of Pakistan mentions that its points of need provide a fundamental basis of how the maritime strategy is supposed to be performed. The maritime strategy tends to focus all the traditional, non-traditional threats that exist in the IOR. It does not specify its principles in accordance with the naval strategy that tends to be indo-centric and focuses only on the military dimension of Pakistan which articulate and formalize the ideas and elements of a naval warfare so that they are more understandable to a larger community. Whereas the maritime doctrine covers both the economic as well as the military dimensions providing a stable framework within which development and employment of hardware, infrastructure and tactics are to be realized. However, when talking about the strategy, its foundation rest in a doctrine. While strategy steers development and employment of forces, a doctrine serves as a landmark in common understanding and translating beliefs into actions

If compared the advancements of the navy in India and Pakistan, the imbalance between the two nuclear armed neighbors is making many take notes. According to the latest figures from the International institute for strategic studies, there are some significant differences between the two countries. Pakistan spent more than \$11 billion while India allocates almost \$58 billion on defense. India's navy has one aircraft carrier, 16 submarines, 13 frigates, 14 destroyers, 106 patrol and coastal combatant vessels, and 75 combat-capable aircraft with 67,700 personnel. In comparison with Pakistan, the navy remains quite small comprising of 23,800 personnel, 8 submarines, 9 frigates, 17 patrol and coastal vessels and 8 combat-capable aircrafts.

Similar to Pakistan's Land centric approach, India's leaf from the past states that it has been focusing more on the land-based military rather than the sea. Habiba and Khan (2018), talk about how the Indian navy has grown from being the Seventh largest to the fifth largest navy of the world. The Indian Navy had to struggle in its initial years after the independence in terms of budget and capable officers. Before the 9/11 era, the Indian Navy was restricted to a few principal warships which gradually grew in the 1980s with the coming of submarines and Aircraft Carriers. Habiba and Khan (2018), mention that post 9/11 era brought a rise in the sea traffic in the Indian Ocean due to which, the Indian Navy was required to upgrade its security impeditive.

The Indian Maritime doctrine (IMD), the Indian Maritime Military Strategy (IMMS) and the Indian Maritime Security Strategy (IMSS) are three different extensional documents on how the Indian Navy prepares itself and tends to operate. It focuses on three clear objectives, "Relating ends to means, a significant tool in maritime planning and towards preparing for conflict."

Khan M.A (2019), also states that there are several other ports that India is making Way into. The Duqm Port of Oman has also helped India to connect with the Gulf of Aden and the Red Sea. The strategic alliance with Indonesia and acquiring their Sabang Port will help India gain strategic importance towards the Strait of Malacca. Further India has also reached and gained footholds in Africa. Khan M.A (2019), has identified the agreements and associations of India in Africa. The Asia-Africa Growth Corridor (AAGC) is considered to be an alternate to the Belt and Road Initiative (BRI) started by China with which CPEC is in the loop. This AAGC aims to first connect India, Africa and Japan together. Africa is rich in Uranium and this linkage might also help India with its nuclear development.

Baruah (2019), in her research focuses to highlight the Indian approach in the Indian Ocean Region. India is trying to set its foothold and in any case, it is not planning to do it all alone. In her research Baruah (2019), explains that India has two main concerns. One, which is to gain access to all the maritime choke points of Indian Ocean Region. These chokepoints provide access to the crucial sea lanes of communication (SLOC), critical transit, markets, partners and regions. These choke points are the Strait of Malacca and Singapore Strait, Indonesian strait, Strait of Hormuz, Bab el Mandeb, Suez Canal, Mozambique, Cape of Good Hope.

A Comparative Analysis of India and Pakistan's Naval Strategy: (2001-2019)

Although it is difficult to gain access to all these important points therefore, the second concern for Indian remains to strengthen the Partnerships in the IOR.

Findings and analysis

Comparing the maritime strategies

Although Indian Ocean has not been always of great importance as the Atlantic and Pacific oceans have always taken the lead in terms of routes, economic activity and ships but after the 9/11, the traffic in the Indian Ocean Region began to rise and thus there was more focus on the IOR than the other oceans. The effort to maintain dominance in the Indo-Pacific as it is known is not only done by the regional states to name India and Pakistan, but extra Regional actors have their eyes on the ocean as well.

Whereas, when discussed about the naval strategy of a state, it is more particular and specified compared to the Maritime Strategy. In his interview Khan said that, **“There are two things that are to be kept in mind. One is the employment and the second is the development. The framework always exists; you have to employ weapons and physical power to it for development to take place”**.

MARTIME INTERESTS OF INDIA AND PAKISTAN	
INDIA	PAKISTAN
To protect the Sovereignty and territorial integrity against the threat in the Maritime Environment.	To protect the coastline and the western Indian ocean region from threats.
Safety and security of the Indian citizens in terms of shipping, trade, supply, fishing, assets etc.	To guard the maritime zones and boundaries with neighboring states.
Peace, stability and security in the Indian maritime zones.	To protect the maritime transport, shipping, harbors and ports from threats like smuggling.
To preserve and project other national interests in the maritime dimensions.	To safeguard marine resources; living, non-living, industrial.
	To encourage coastal Tourism

The above data in the table has been taken from the Indian Maritime security strategy and Maritime Doctrine of Pakistan respectively

Strengths and weaknesses

In a country weathering an economic storm, the Pakistan Navy has emerged as a capable all-round force. According to Admiral Pervaiz, Pakistan Navy must forego unfavorable comparisons with the Indian Navy, as the Indian coastline as well as its string of ports needs greater naval capability to defend and to project power from. While PN's developmental plans in general do indeed tend to be Indo-centric, much of Indian naval spending, on projects like Aircraft Carriers, cruisers, nuclear powered ballistic missile submarines and even the sprawling base in the Andaman Islands towards the east, are designed to demonstrate the extent of its tentacles and assure its western backers of its preparedness to act as a bulwark against a domineering China. Admiral Pervaiz says that Pakistan's aims, being modest in nature, is because of adequately smaller though robust Navy, consisting of surface, subsurface, air, special services and marine elements. It must however be conceded that with the Indian Navy's acquisition of P3I Neptune LRMPs and Scorpene class conventional submarines, Pakistan Navy's edge in these areas have and is being eroded. One glaring weakness however is the PNS inability to ward off attacks by enemy aircraft firing from standoff ranges. While PN ships are equipped with self defence and point defence weapons, such defenses are likely to be swamped in the face of determined attacks, particularly when the adversary's weapons are being fired from ranges beyond the reach of PN platforms (Asghar, 2020).

Pakistan Navy is and will be reckonable force in IOR fully capable of safeguarding our maritime interests. However, the growing force differential is causing huge asymmetry and will leave certain areas vulnerable to Indian aggression. The major weakness is the lack of nuclear-powered submarine to mitigate the effects of Indian SSBNs. But superior tactics shall offset this weakness too, to a large extent (Nasir, 2020). (Khan C. A., 2020)

Naval strategy

The naval strategy of Pakistan focuses on protecting the maritime interests of the country; therefore, it completely relies on deterrence first and being defensive rather than offensive. With a limited strength of fleet, Pakistan chooses not to create or strike aggression or any war. The only idea is to protect the resources and other interests of the maritime and sea domain which come under the jurisdiction of Pakistan. To quote from the maritime doctrine of Pakistan, "The raison d'être of Pakistan's navy is to preserve the freedom of seas to support and advance the cause of national maritime Interests."

Although deterrence is what the navy relies on but in case the strategy to deter the enemy fails, sea denial is the war strategy to focus on to. Once the combat on sea begins to take place, the primary aim of the navy is protection and preservation of sea lines of communication (SLOC). Even if the conflict arises on land or air, the protection of SLOC remains crucial and inevitable. This is because the cargos,

A Comparative Analysis of India and Pakistan's Naval Strategy: (2001-2019)

shipments, oil and coal transports are very important for the economy of Pakistan and therefore it can be difficult to say that being a small state with a struggling economy, SLOC can be put second to some other priority (Pakistan N. , 2018).

While being at peace, there is nation building, exercises and naval diplomacy deemed necessary for Pakistan to be exercised. Right now, Pakistan navy is focusing on the relation building with china in terms of CPEC.

In contrast to the Indian naval strategy, it serves different interests in the IOR than that of Pakistan. Like that of Pakistan navy, the Indian Navy prefers to begin with deterrence. The primary aim is to deter conflict and coercion against India beginning with deterrence. What difference of Indian and Pakistani deterrence is that Pakistani naval deterrence is more likely to fail rather than that of India's and this is because of the nuclear deterrence capability of the later which will be discussed later.

Indian and Pakistan naval strategy might be to some extent like each other but the impact of both might be different. There are many reasons to this. One of which is the strength of fleet both navies have.

The Indian naval forces also focus on sea control followed by sea denial. To execute a n operational plan for the naval missions, there will be taskforces involved to maintain a certain control over the sea. This is not done by sea force in fact this is where the multidimensional force comes into existence. Indian sea control includes the carrier taskforce (CTF), WHICH CONSIST OF Carrier Battle groups (CBG), Anti-Air warfare (AAW), Anti-Surface warfare (ASuW), Anti-Submarine WARFARE (ASW) and many more.

The offensive measure comes in by sea denial which would be to prevent units of adversary from operating into the designated maritime space to thwart their purpose of deployment. In order to do that, certain aspects will be kept in mind such as how important is the maritime are for the adversary, what is the capability of the adversary to exercise sea control in that area, the vulnerability of the adversary in that area (India. Indian Navy. Directorate of Strategy, 2015).

Role of extra-regional actors in IOR

The Literature review clearly talks about the threat, challenges, strengths and weaknesses of the Indian and Pakistani Navies. Both the navies have come a long way from where they began from. But Indian advancements have been far more elaborate and extensive as there remain many reasons to support that development. The Indian naval expansion might not be a direct threat to Pakistan and vice versa but the nexus of US-Indian and Pakistan-China is quite a challenge for the neighboring foes.

United States and China are right now involved in a rush to take maximum control over the IOR and their race is what we see as an edge to both Pakistan and India in order to secure themselves and their interests in the sea. The important factor that remains to be a global democratic principle today is the

interdependency of states on each other. Be it land air or sea, the strategy more or less remains same which is not to have better employment but better relations. Both the navies have their specified strengths and weaknesses in terms of marine forces, marine weaponry, boundary, natural resources and all the interests that they intend to guard but what matters the most is the influence of global extra regional powers on these regional powers which is creating more and more competition in the IOR.

The future for Pakistan Navy

Given the geo-strategic, Geo-economic compulsions. Also keeping in mind limited resources available and what a small nation we are, it should not be very difficult to comprehend the future course of action for the Pakistan navy. It will be quite utopian if said to increase the equipment with high tech facilities. What the future course holds is a better understanding of the maritime domains and its knowledge as with the publication of the Maritime doctrine of Pakistan (Nasir, 2020).

With the publications, it will be a better understanding as to how the strategies and policies are to be shaped and functioned. Since Pakistan navy is smaller in size and number, it is not something to frown upon. This is simply as per the requirement and the size is what does not matter, what matters is the quality of the force. Enhancing the force capabilities and training is the best way forward. Pakistan Navy is supposed to protect and secure the maritime and naval interests of the country and that remains a priority for ever. To quote exactly what Pakistan Navy envisions:

“Pakistan Navy is envisioned to be a combat ready multi-dimensional force manned by highly motivated and professionally competent human resource imbued with unwavering faith in ALLAH SWT and the national cause; that contributes effectively to credible deterrence, national security and maritime economy; safeguarding Pakistan’s maritime interests while radiating influence in the region with global outlook.”

The future is not any different then today unless there exist some conflict. This way the futuristic approach of the navy remains to be based on review and reappraisal of the existing maritime policies. Only a few things to be noted are the nuclear expansion and the increasing security impeditive regarding the projects such as the CPEC on the Gwadar port and many other. These projects will require more vigilance and a better infrastructure which remains to be a priority for now for the maritime forces altogether (Pakistan N. , 2018).

Moving on the maritime doctrine also talks about the involvement of Non-state actors. The future of the navy and the maritime of Pakistan looks to be quite enlightening with the publications of articles and the launch of the Maritime doctrine of Pakistan. such writings will encourage the policies makers to examine

A Comparative Analysis of India and Pakistan's Naval Strategy: (2001-2019)

in a better way the much needed dynamics of the Indian Ocean region and the core mission of the Maritime forces of Pakistan which will remain to be of highest Priority now and forever. With everything mentioned, the Pakistan Navy also reveals to focus upon the capacity building for conventional and strategic deterrence (Pakistan Navy, 2018).

The most important aspect to remember in this year is that the world is now facing a pandemic. Nobody knows how long this pandemic of covid-19 will last but since the future remains unclear. In such times the naval priority keeps on changing. In current times the navy is making sure to help and aid the coastal communities. They have worked on opening new channels of communication in the coastal areas of Baluchistan and Sindh trying to facilitate people with food, clothing and many other necessities protecting the coastal communities from the spread of corona virus (Khan M. A., Daily Times , 2020).

Conclusion

The crisis of India and Pakistan go beyond seas, but sea is what now remains to be the focus of the world. As the Indian Ocean region is rising in importance, so are the threats that these two countries are likely to face. The difference of artillery and weapons and naval craft is way too much and thus stand nowhere in comparison to each other. Pakistan is a smaller state with sea blindness. The only thing which they rely on is their ally China. However, yet the US-India is stronger nexus to cope up with.

The Future for Pakistan navy can be a prosperous one, not exactly on a higher scale but it does have the potential to grow with the rising port activities of Gwadar. This is now enough. Having resources and developments does not highlight the growth of the sector but to effectively utilize the potential to its appropriate limits is what Pakistan needs to focus on.

In order to establish a greater naval force with better plan, it is important to always analyse what the enemy is doing and thus the activities which India is contributing to its naval sector are far better than those of Pakistan but there is rather more to learn and understand than to envy upon. The fact that Pakistan remains to be a struggling democratic states speaks a lot about where it stands today but with proper research, Planning and a long term strategy, a slow and steady growth in the maritime sector can become the future of the country.

Recommendations

There are a few things which should be highlighted upon for the future of the maritime sector to work in a better way, enhancing activity and performance. Although the primary setup should be Research, Coordination and Planning but it is about time that a few steps should be strategized to fill in the loopholes:

1. The Policymakers should follow the rulings and guidelines of the Royal Navy
2. The budget of the Pakistan Navy should be enhanced a bit approximately near to that of Pakistan Air force
3. Pakistan navy should utilize the generated profits from the sea to invest better in the equipment
4. The Stake holders should have a better say in the policymaking
5. The civilian leaders should sit and devise a country specific strategy for expanding the maritime sector of Pakistan.

References

- Anand, A. (2019, August 10). *Indian Today* . retrieved January 21, 2020, from <https://www.indiatoday.in: https://www.indiatoday.in/india/story/indian-navy-high-alert-seaborne-pak-based-terror-threat-1579553-2019-08-10>
- Asghar, P. (2020, March). Comparing Indian and Pakistan Navy in the 21st Century. (D. Saghir, interviewer)
- B, H. (2004, July 04). *Bharat Rakshak*. retrieved from www.bharat-rakshak.com: http://www.bharat-rakshak.com/navy/history/1971war/44-attacks-on-karachi.html
- B.Harry. (2004, July 4). *www.bharat-rakshak.com* . retrieved november 29, 2018 , from [bharat rakshak : https://web.archive.org/web/20090926174134/http://www.bharat-rakshak.com/navy/history/1971war/44-attacks-on-karachi.html](https://web.archive.org/web/20090926174134/http://www.bharat-rakshak.com/navy/history/1971war/44-attacks-on-karachi.html)
- Baruah, D. M. (2019). Strengthening Dehli's Strategic Partnerships In The Indian Ocean . Washington DC , United States: Center for a New American Security.

A Comparative Analysis of India and Pakistan's Naval Strategy: (2001-2019)

- Behera, L. K. (2019, July 08). *Manohar Parrikar Institute for Defence Studies and Analyses* . retrieved March 10th, 2020, from www.idsa.in: <https://idsa.in/issuebrief/indias-defence-budget-2019-20-1kbehera-080719>
- Gady, F. S. (2017, June 05). *The Diplomat* . retrieved April 12th , 2020, from www.thediplomat.com : <https://thediplomat.com/2017/06/pakistan-raises-defense-spending/>
- Habiba , U. E., & Khan, M. A. (2018). Examining India's Strategic Culture and The Maritime Doctrinal Growth: Indo-Pacific In Perspective. *Regional Studies*, 31-69.
- India. Indian Navy. Directorate of Strategy, C. A. (2015). *Ensuring Secure Seas: Indian Maritime Security Strategy*. Indian Navy.
- Jain, P. B. (2017, April 04). India's Security Concerns in The Indian Ocean Region, A Critical Analyses. *Future Directions International* .
- Jalil, G. Y. (2016, October 14). Analysis of Indian Naval Capabilities: Implications for Pakistan . *Researcher Fellow* . ISSI.
- Joshi, Y., & Mukherjee, A. (2018). From Denial to Punishment: the Security Dilemma and Changes in India's Military Strategy Towards China. *Asian Security* , 25-43.
- Khan, M. A. (2019). Growing India-China Competition in The Indian Ocean: Implications for Pakistan. *Strategic Studies*, vol 39, 77-89.
- Khan, M. A. (2019, March 26). *International The News* . retrieved Januray 27, 2020, from <https://www.thenews.com.pk/>: <https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/448863-pakistan-navy-in-era-of-globalisation-new-challenges>
- Khan, M. A. (2020, Feburary). Comparing the Indian and Pakistan Navy in 21st Century. (D. Saghir, interviewer)
- Khan, M. A. (2020, April 23). *Daily Times*. retrieved from www.dailytimes.com.pk: <https://dailytimes.com.pk/600860/military-duty-and-covid-19/>
- Lentin, S. (2016, August 11). *Gateway House, Indian Council on Global Relations* . retrieved from www.gatewayhouse.in: <https://www.gatewayhouse.in/partition-1947-part-didnt-see/>
- Lodhi, F. (2000, January). *Defence Journal* . retrieved from www.defencejournal.com: <http://www.defencejournal.com/2000/jan/agosta.htm>
- Lodhi, F. (2000, January). *www.defencejournal.com* . retrieved november 29, 2018, from www.defencejournal.com : <http://www.defencejournal.com/2000/jan/agosta.htm>
- Mitra, A. I. (2019, Feburary 04). *The Pioneer* . retrieved Januray 21, 2020, from <https://www.dailypioneer.com/>:

Damiya Saghir & Khushboo Ejaz

<https://www.dailypioneer.com/2014/columnists/challenges-before-indian-navy.html>

Nasir, I. (2020, April). Comparing Indian and Pakistan Navy in 21st Century. (D. Saghir, interviewer)

Pakistan, G. O. (n.d.). *Ministry of Finance*. retrieved march 20th, 2020, from www.finance.gov.pk: http://www.finance.gov.pk/fb_2019_20.html

Pakistan, N. (2018). *Maritime Doctrine of Pakistan*. Lahore.

Russell, D. A., Writz, D. J., Abenheim, D. D., Young, D. T.-D., & Wueger, M. D. (2015). *Navy Strategy Development: Strategy In The 21st Century*.

Shahzad, S. M. (2020, February). Comparing the Indian and Pakistan Navy in 21st Century. (D. Saghir, Interviewer)
