Journal of Elementary Education
December 2020, Volume 30, No. 2, pp. 67-81

Provision of Physical Facilities for Early Childhood Education in Punjab (Pakistan)

Saima Malik[*] and Muhammad Zaheer Asghar[**]

Abstract

Early Childhood Education (ECE) is an emerging field worldwide as well as in Pakistan. The School Education Department, Government of Punjab is making substantial efforts to spread ECE in its territory through Quaid-e-Azam Academy for Educational Development (QAED). This study was aimed to evaluate the physical facilities of the Early Childhood Education (ECE) program in public schools of province Punjab. It was a quantitative study in nature. A multistage sampling technique was applied for the selection of the sample. District Lahore, Okara, and Toba teksingh were selected purposively. These districts were divided into two strata based on the area (urban and rural). Meanwhile, each strat a was further divided into two sub-stratum, i.e., boys schools and girls schools. Thus 50 schools from urban and 50 schools from rural were selected from each district by the application of a simple random sampling technique. The self-made checklist was applied for measuring the physical facilities of ECE in public schools. The reliability of the checklist was measured through the pilot study with the Cronbach alpha value of 0.78. Quantitative data were analyzed through descriptive and inferential statistical techniques. Results of this study indicated that there was the presence of boundary wall, toilet, one ECE room, one ECE trained teacher, blackboard, chair per child in almost all schools but there were absence of three ECE rooms, three trained ECE teachers, presence of Care-giver, facility of first aid box, presence of ECE kit (provided by QAED) and standard decorated ECE rooms as per criteria of QAED. The results of comparison among districts show that Toba teksingh has good physical facilities of ECE as compared to Lahore and Lahore has more physical facilities of ECE as compared to Okara. Future researches can be conducted to compare the provision of ECE all over the districts of Punjab. School education department, policymakers, and other stakeholders of the school education can take measures to provide missing ECE facilities in the schools based on this study.

Keywords: Early Childhood Education, Quaid-e-Azam Academy for Educational Development, Physical Facilities

[*] Ph.D. (Candidate) Department of Education, University of Management and Technology, Lahore
E-mail: Saimamalik666@yahoo.com
[**]Assistant Professor, Department of Education, University of Management and Technology, Lahore
Research Fellow, University Oberta de Catalunya, Barcelona, Spain
Email: Chancellor.zaheer@gmail.com/ masghar@uoc.edu

Background

Pakistan like all other countries of the world is emphasizing to spread of ECE in its territory. Education for All (EFA), Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) and Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) are international commitments of the world towards ECE (Ahmed, Anjum & Rehman, 2015; Ghumman & Khalid. 2016; Ghazi, Ajmal & Saeed, 2018). As being a signatory to above mentioned international commitments, Pakistan is focusing on achieving settled targets by implementing Article 25-A of the 18th Amendment in April 2010, National Education Policy (NEP) 2009, National Education Policy (NEP) 2017 with the launching of the National ECE curriculum 2002 and 2007 (MoE, 2017). Early Childhood Education (ECE) has become a topical issue in Pakistan in the recent era. ECE is provided in the form of pre-primary education with the name of "Katchi class" for 3-5 years old children in public schools of Pakistan (Ahmed, Anjum & Rehman, 2015; Ghazi, Ajmal & Saeed, 2018; Khan, 2018; MoE, 2017).

Punjab, the largest province of Pakistan, is also making substantial efforts to spread ECE over its territory as a partner of the National Commitment regarding ECE (Farooq, 2018; Khan, 2018). Quaid-e-Azam Academy for Educational Development (QAED), School Education Department, Government of Punjab has launched the ECE program with the title "Introduction of ECE in Primary Schools in Punjab with High Enrollment and Improvement of Environment of Schools to convert them into Child-Friendly Schools (CFSs)" in its all 09 divisions and 36 districts since 2013 with the collaboration of UNICEF and Punjab Monitoring and Implementation Unit (PMIU) (QAED, 2019). According to Shami, Ahmad, and Khyzer (2014), there is a 40% more gross enrolment ratio (GER) in Punjab as compared to the national level, but it further requires hard efforts to meet the EFA targets. However, the prophesied targets for achieving 100% goals in enrolment of ECE and achieving targets of Universal Primary Education (UPE) are steadily underachieved all over Pakistan as well as in Punjab too (Farooq, 2013; Farooq, 2018; Ghazi, Ajmal & Saeed, 2018, GoP, 2017). The major problem in Punjab is the retention of drop-out ratios at the primary level which is 4.73% in the year 2018 (ASER, 2019). ECE has not proved a valuable source of bringing to an end this alarming situation in Punjab (Arshad & Zamir, 2018; Khan, 2018; Farooq, 2018). There is an enormous difference between policy and implementation of ECE in Punjab (GoP, 2017). The only four days ECE training program is being imparted to the in-Service teachers, head teachers, caregivers, school council members, and district management to run the program in Punjab by Govt. of Punjab through QAED (ASER, 2018; GoP, 2018; QAED, 2019). According to Arshad and Zamir, (2018), ECE in Punjab is not up to the satisfactory level because of poor coordination between the school education department and respective schools. Schools are lagging-behind to achieve settled targets of ECE because of having scarce resources.

Different donors are cooperating in spreading ECE in Punjab with QAED e.g. UNICEF and Program Monitoring and Implementation Unit (PMIU). Practically, UNICEF has donated 200 million to QAED in establishing ECE schools in Punjab. So, QAED has utilized this amount in developing a total of 225 schools of ECE in all 09 divisions of Punjab (with equal distribution of amount) in 2014-15. One thousand four hundred seventy-five schools were established with the support of the PMIU in the year 2016-17, while 1300 schools were formed in the year 2017 with the donation of UNICEF (in which 400 schools were formed in the district Rajanpur only). One thousand schools were also launched in the year 2018 with the support of UNICEF in district Toba teksingh. The government of Punjab has supported 5000 schools in PC-1 during the year 2017-2018 (QAED, 2019).

Statement of the Problem

There were 2,225 ECE classrooms across 36 districts of Punjab established at the total cost: Rs. 385 Million in the year 2016 with the support of donor agencies, i.e., UNICEF and PMIU. Due to these 2225 ECE classrooms, 80,583 new students were enrolled in these government schools (GoP, 2018). New ECE classrooms along with trained ECE teachers were established in 10,000 government schools till March 2018 at a total cost of Rs. 1.98 billion with the help of donor agencies (GoP, 2017). Training of 326 master trainers, 9648 teachers, 9594 head teachers, 19726 school council members, 6004 caregivers, and 1234 education manager has been imparted on ECE by QAED in the year 2017-18 (QAED, 2019).

Although, teachers, head teachers, and caregivers of the concerned ECE schools were trained about the use of learning resources for early year kids to get well their learning and promoting the power of invention. They were also trained on the working well use of low price and no price material for learning and doing activities (Ghazi, Ajmal & Saeed, 2018). The overall increasing demand for ECE but less enrollment in public ECE schools of Punjab as compared to private schools has placed question marks upon the given facilities of ECE in public schools (GoP, 2017). Therefore, it is the need of the hour to identify the provision of physical facilities in public ECE schools of Punjab.

Theoretical Foundation

Sen (1999) and Nussbuam (2000) approach to social justice and human capabilities consider education as a means to support the development of human capability which is perceived to achieve maximum individual functioning to value their society and communities. According to the concept of human capabilities and social justice by Sen (1999) and Nussbuam (2000), education is considered as a means to support the development of human capability which is perceived to achieve maximum

individual functioning to value their society and communities. The concept of capabilities is universal but it relates to the context of society and can contribute to political, cultural, environmental, social, and economic development. The valued capability and functioning are considered good for individual well-being itself. Most importantly, the capability approach stresses defining capability through public discussion and the democratic process. It is also worth mentioning that this democratic process of the public debate should serve to promote deprived groups with an ability to read cultural, structural, and institutional barriers that restrict the deprived groups to listen to their voices in the policymaking process.

Early Childhood Education (ECE) is universally considered as a core phase in the holistic development of a child (Ahmed, Anjum & Rehman, 2015; Arshad & Zamir, 2018; Khan, 2018; UNESCO, 2010). Educational research asserts ECE as the source of subsequent achievement in the schooling of a child's life (Ghumman & Khalid. 2016; Ghazi, Ajmal & Saeed, 2018). It is an excellent starter of a future educational career in the life of an individual. Children are more active in this phase of life as compare to the next stages of life. In this era, they want to explore the world at their end and remained a curiosity to solve the problems by themselves (Ahmed, 2011). Cognitive development theories illustrate the fastest cognitive development between the age of 0-8 years old. Gross motor skills are nurtured in this stage along with rapid cognitive development. In this period of life, children love to enhance their different skills e.g.catching a ball, running, hopping, and climbing, etc. They show a keen interest in the practice and play with the gadgets by cutting, painting, drawing, and writing with the help of different equipment under the supervision of a teacher. In-fact, exceptional performance is shown by those students who avail of early education in their childhood as compared to those who could not avail this facility. The environment of the ECE classroom made the learning effective for young kids. An interactive classroom environment leads to involve the children in fundamental educational activities (Ghazi, Ajmal & Saeed, 2018).

The objective of the Study

The objectives of this study were to;

1- Identify the provision of physical facilities for Early Childhood Education in public schools of Punjab.
2- Compare the provision of physical facilities for Early Childhood Education in public schools of the different districts of Punjab.

Methodology

This study was applied a survey design for the identification of physical facilities of ECE in public schools of districts Punjab, i.e., Lahore, Okara, and Toba teksingh. This study consisted of the population of all the ECE schools in Lahore, Okara, and Toba teksingh.

The sample was drawn from ECE public schools from the districts of Lahore, Okara, and Toba teksingh (as these districts were included in the pilot projects of QAED). However, these districts were divided into two strata based on the area (urban and rural). Meanwhile, each strata was further divided into two sub-stratum, i.e., boys schools and girls schools. Thus 50 schools from urban and 50 schools from rural were selected from each district by the application of a simple random sampling technique.

This study applied a self-made checklist, which was established with the consultation of interventions provided by QAED to measure the physical facilities of ECE in public schools. The checklist comprises a list of facilities-based on two categories, i.e., physical facilities and instructional facilities. Physical facilities include boundary walls, toilets, three ECE rooms, ventilated rooms, three ECE teachers, presence of care-giver, clean water, presence of First aid box, chair per child, blackboard, ECE kit, portfolio, decorated ECE classroom (as per QAED instructions), play area, play equipment while instructional facilities deal with the indoor play equipment, display of children's artwork, presence of Audiovisual aids (AV aids) and accessibility of AV aids to children.

Five experts from the relevant field measured the validity of the checklist. The reliability of the Checklist was measured through pilot tested in 100 schools of district Lahore only. The Cronbach Alpha value for the reliability of the checklist was found 0.78 through "Statistical Package for Social Sciences" (SPSS) version 22.

Findings

Data were tabulated and analyzed by using different statistical techniques. The analysis was run by using (SPSS) version 22.

Table 1
Physical facilities of ECE in districts

		N	%
DISTRICT	Lahore	100	33.3
	Okara	100	33.3
	TT Singh	100	33.3
Boundary Wall	yes	299	99.7
	no	1	.3

Toilets	yes	299	99.7
	no	1	.3
ECE Rooms	yes	18	6.0
	no	239	79.7
ECE Teachers	yes	76	25.3
	no	224	74.7
Lighting	yes	282	94.0
	no	18	6.0
Ventilation	yes	232	77.3
	no	67	22.3
Painting walls	yes	193	64.3
	no	107	35.7
Clean Water	yes	289	96.3
	no	11	3.7
Caregiver	yes	135	45.0
	no	165	55.0
First Aid Box	yes	206	68.7
	no	94	31.3
Chair per child	yes	254	84.7
	no	46	15.3
Black board	yes	286	95.3
	no	13	4.3
ECE KIT	yes	204	68.0
	no	96	32.0
Portfolio	yes	119	39.7
	no	181	60.3
Room décor	yes	231	77.0
	no	69	23.0
Language corner	yes	142	47.3
	no	157	52.3
Math corner	yes	154	51.3
	no	146	48.7
Reading corner	yes	151	50.3
	no	149	49.7
Art corner	yes	144	48.0
	no	156	52.0
Science corner	yes	68	22.7
	no	231	77.0
Outdoor play area	yes	251	83.7
	no	49	16.3
Play equipment	yes	35	11.7
	no	263	87.7

Note: ECE teachers= three ECE teachers; ECE rooms= three ECE rooms

Table 1 indicates the physical facilities of ECE in district Lahore, Okara, and Toba Tak Singh. It shows that there is a presence of boundary walls and toilets in 99.7 schools of respective districts. Whereas there were 6.0% of ECE schools which were having three separate ECE rooms and 79.7% of schools did not have three different ECE rooms. On the other hand, there were 25.3% of ECE schools had three trained teachers, and 74.7 schools were deprived of three ECE trained teachers. Schools had 94 % enough lighted ECE rooms along with 77.3% enough ventilation in those ECE rooms. Thematic based decor ECE rooms were lying in 64.3% of schools while 35.7% did not fulfill the standard of QAED. The presence of the caregiver was found in 45% of schools while 55% of schools did not have a separate caregiver for young children in the classrooms. Clean water for drinking was found in 96.3% of schools. First Aid box for the use in an emergency was found in 68.7 % of schools while the rest of the schools were missing the facility. 84.7 % of ECE classrooms were maintained with the chair per child. The presence of a board in the form of a blackboard/ whiteboard was found in 95.3% of schools. ECE kit given by QAED was distributed to 68 % of schools when 32% of schools had not received it yet. Maintenance of the portfolio per child by the teacher of ECE was found in 39.7% of schools only, while the rest of the 60.3 % of schools had not prepared it. Decored rooms with attractive wall colors were found in 77% of schools. ECE classrooms with different corners (as per instructions of QAED) were found as below: 47.3% of schools had language corner, 51.3% had Math corner, 50.3% classrooms had reading corner, 48% of classrooms had art corner while 22.7% of classrooms had science corner within the ECE classroom.

Table 2
One way analysis of variance by physical facilities among groups

	f	p
Boundary wall	1.000	.369
Toilet	1.000	.369
ECE rooms	65.992	.000
ECE teachers	27.353	.000
Lighting	1.239	.291
Ventilation	10.481	.000
Painting walls	13.784	.000
Water	4.129	.017
Caregiver	95.495	.000
First aid box	1.409	.246
Chair per child	32.803	.000
Board	3.675	.026
ECE kit	15.086	.000
Portfolio	51.647	.000
Room décor	50.386	.000

Language corner	41.053	.000
Math corner	91.569	.000
Reading corner	96.001	.000
Art corner	91.666	.000
Science corner	3.224	.041
Outdoor play area	2.981	.052
Play equipment	30.339	.000
Play material	59.907	.000
Children art work	81.876	.000
Teacher made toy	71.312	.000
Learning aids	20.614	.000

A one way between groups analysis of variance was conducted to find out the difference of physical facilities among districts. Table 2 indicates that there was a statistically no significant difference at the p>.05 of physical facilities of boundary walls and toilets [*F* (3) = 1.000, *p*=.369].

A statistically significant difference p< .05 was found in the presence of three ECE teachers and three ECE rooms [*F* (3) =65.992, *p*=.000].

No significance difference at the p> .05 was found on the facilities of lighting in present ECE rooms [*F* (3) = 1.239, *p*= .291].

There was statistically no significant difference p>.05 found in the presence of ventilation, painting walls, water, and caregiver in set ECE rooms among groups [*F* (3) = 10.481, 13.784, 4.129, 95.495, *p*= .000, .017].

Significance difference p>.05 was not found in the form of having first aid boxes in ECE rooms to be used in any emergency regarding young children [*F* (3) = 1.409, *p* =. 246].

Significant difference p<.05 was found in the following physical facilities i.e. chair per child, board, ECE kit, portfolio, room décor, language corner, math corner, reading corner, art corner, science corner, outdoor play area, play equipment, play material, children artwork, teacher made toys and learning aids [*F* (3) = 32.803, 3.675, 15.086, 50.386, 41.053, 91.569, 96.001, 3.2224, 2.981, 30.339, 59.907, 81.876, 71.312, 20.614 , *p*= .000, .026, .041, .052].

The post hoc test is attached in appendix (A).

Discussions and Conclusions

The present status of the provision of ECE in Punjab is not up to mark. ASER (2014, 2015 & 2018) reports have also endorsed the results of non uniform availability of the physical facilities of ECE in the country. The findings of the study of Kazi (2017) indicated that Punjab is struggling to cope with the provision of ECE despite launching ECE policy 2017 because of having scarce resources, lack of awareness, weakness in implementation of policy, untrained teachers and unwillingness of trained in-service ECE teachers to teach ECE level, low enrollment, out of school children and unawareness of parents about the importance of ECE. There is a need to encourage the administration of schools education department to provide better ECE facilities for young children in public schools (Arshad, Ahmed, &Tayyab, 2019; Qureshi, Bhutto & Nahar, 2019).

The results of this study indicate that almost all the schools have a boundary wall, clean water, and toilets. While there was the absence of three ECE trained teachers by QAED, allocated separate three ECE rooms, hiring of caregiver, presence of first aid box in the ECE classroom, maintenance of a portfolio of the children by the ECE teacher, decorated ECE rooms (as per QAED criteria), maintenance of learning corners within the classroom (as per QAED instructions), play equipment and well-furnished playground with different swings.

When we have a glance at the comparison of facilities in three districts, i.e., Lahore, okara, and Toba teksingh, the Post Hoc Test (Appendix A) depicts that more ECE schools have trained teachers in Lahore as compare to Okara while Toba teksingh has more trained ECE teachers than Lahore.Equal ventilated rooms are found in Lahore and Tobteksingh. Though less ventilated rooms are found in Okara. Maintenance of decorated ECE rooms is found better in Toba teksingh as compare with Lahore and Okara while Lahore is better than Okara. The facility of clean water for drinking is found suitable in all three districts. The presence of a caregiver is found more in ECE schools of Toba teksingh than in Lahore. Although more schools of Lahore have caregivers as compare with Okara. Chair per child is found more in ECE schools of Okara as compare to Lahore and Toba teksingh. While Toba teksingh has more chairs per child as compared to Lahore. The provision of ECE kit by QAED, is more in the schools of Toba teksingh as compared to Lahore and Okara. Though ECE schools of Lahore are more facilitated with ECE kits as compare to Okara. Portfolio per child is more prepared by ECE teachers of Toba teksingh as compare with Lahore and Okara. While teachers of Lahore have prepared more portfolios as compare to Okara. Okara has more decorated ECE rooms as compared to Lahore although Toba teksingh has a more decorated room as compare to Okara and Lahore. More ECE schools meet the prescribed criteria of QAED (i.e. Language corner, math corner, art corner, and science corner) in Toba teksingh as

compared to Lahore and Okara. The vast play area is available in more schools of Okara as compare with Lahore and Toba teksingh. Toba teksingh has more play equipment as compare with Lahore. While Lahore has more play equipment in comparison to Okara. Play material is more prepared by ECE teachers in Toba teksingh as compared to Lahore and Okara. However, Lahore has more schools as compare with Okara. The display of children's artwork is much better in Toba teksingh as a comparison of Lahore and Okara. More Learning aids are present in ECE rooms in Toba teksingh as compare with Lahore and Okara. While Okara is lagging to Lahore in this facility.

Recommendations

Different educational institutions (e.g. I.E.R Punjab University, Allama Iqbal Open University, University of Management & Technology, Lahore) of Punjab have introduced ECE degree programs of two years and four years. Annually hundreds of graduates are being trained in the field of ECE. So, trained teachers should be hired for ECE children to enhance the quality of the ECE program in Punjab. The recommendations given in the present paper may help to improve the standards of practice of ECE in Punjab. Serious and positive actions should be taken to raise the ECE standards in Punjab. Only launching policy is not a remedy in itself unless it is efficiently executed. It is the need of the hour to make a decision and take action seriously regarding the proper execution of early childhood education by understanding its importance. The government needs to invest in ECE on a priority basis to provide missing facilities in the schools. A special budget should be allocated for the provision of ECE in schools of Punjab. There should be equal educational infrastructure and opportunities available to provide equity of learning to students across the province. Educational leadership should aware of the government providing missing facilities in the public school of Punjab. More future researches should be conducted to identify the physical facilities among all districts of Punjab.

References

ASER (2014). *Summary of National Report.* Retrieved 3 January 2020, from http://aserpakistan.org/document/report_cards/2014/summary_report_cards/National_2014.pdf

ASER (2015*). Summary of National Report.* Retrieved 3 January 2020, from http://aserpakistan.org/document/report_cards/2015/summary_report_cards/National_2015.pdf

ASER (2018*). Scale and Scope: Summary of National Report.* Retrieved 3 January 2020, from http://aserpakistan.org/document/report_cards/2018/summary_report_cards/National_2018.pdf

Ahmad, M. (2011). Early childhood education in Pakistan: an international slogan waiting for national attention. *Contemporary Issues in Early Childhood*, *12*(1), 86-93.

Arshad, M., Ahmed, G., & Tayyab, M. (2019). Assessing the Effects of School Support Facilities on Academic Achievement at Punjab Education Foundation Partner Schools. *European Online Journal of Natural and Social Sciences: Proceedings*, *8*(2), 214-222.

Arshad, M., & Zamir, S. (2018). Situational analysis of Early Childhood Education in Pakistan: Challenges and Solutions. *Journal of Early Childhood Care and Education*, *2*(1), 135-149.

Bhatti, L. R. (2007). *Causes of primary school dropout from tehsil Lahore and Shariqpur*. (Unpublished Master Thesis).University of Punjab, Pakistan.

Farooq, M. S. (2018). Millennium development goals (MDGs) and quality education situation in Pakistan at primary level. *International Online Journal of Primary Education*, *7*(1), 1-23.

Farooq, M. S. (2013). An inclusive schooling model for the prevention of dropout in primary schools in Pakistan. *Bulletin of Education and Research*, *35*(1), 47-74.

Ghazi, S. R., Ajmal, M. & Saeed, A. (2018). Effectiveness of early childhood education: A case study from remote district of central Punjab. *Journal of Early Childhood Care and Education*, *2*(1), 75–86.

Ghumman, M. S., & Khalid, M. I. (2016). Effectiveness of teaching practices for student's competencies development at early childhood education (ece) level in Pakistan. *Journal of Research & Reflections in Education (JRRE)*, *10*(1), 93-103

Government of Pakistan (2017). *National Education Policy 2009.*Islamabad: Ministry of Education.

Kazi, A. (2017). *Deconstructing Pakistan's education policy within the Gender and Development Framework: The cases of Punjab and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa* (Doctoral dissertation) Columbia University.

Khan, M. A. (2018). The status of early childhood education in Pakistan: Inside stories. *Contemporary Issues in Early Childhood*, *19*(3), 310-317.

Nussbaum, M. (2000). *Women and Development: The Capability approach.* Cambridge, Cambridge University Press.

Qureshi, A. J., Bhutto, A., & Mahar, P. R. (2019). Implementation of Free Early Childhood Education and Economic Development: A Case Study of Government Schools in Pakistan. *Journal of Business Strategies*, *13*(1), 125-132.

Sen, A. (1999). *Development as Freedom*. Oxford, Oxford University Press.

Shami, P. A., Ahmad, M., & Khyizer, A. (2014). Management of early childhood care and education in Punjab, Pakistan. *Journal of Managerial Sciences 8*(2), 239-249.

UNESCO. (2015). *Primary education for all children*. Paris: UNESCO.

UNESCO. (2010). EFA global monitoring report: reaching the marginalized. Paris: UNESCO.

Appendix (A)

Post Hoc Tests

Dependent Variable	(I) District	(J) District	Mean Difference (I-J)	Std. Error	Sig.
ECE rooms	Lahore	Okara	.15000*	.05241	.005
		TT Singh	-.43000*	.05241	.000
	Okara	Lahore	-.15000*	.05241	.005
		TT Singh	-.58000*	.05241	.000
	TTSingh	Lahore	.43000*	.05241	.000
		Okara	.58000*	.05241	.000
ECE teachers	Lahore	Okara	.22000*	.05681	.000
		TTSingh	.42000*	.05681	.000
	Okara	Lahore	-.22000*	.05681	.000
		TT Singh	.20000*	.05681	.000
	TTSingh	Lahore	-.42000*	.05681	.000
		Okara	-.20000*	.05681	.000
Ventilation	Lahore	Okara	.04000	.09624	.678
		TTSingh	-.36000*	.09624	.000
	Okara	Lahore	-.04000	.09624	.678
		TTSingh	-.40000*	.09624	.000
	TTSingh	Lahore	.36000*	.09624	.000
		Okara	.40000*	.09624	.000
Painting walls	Lahore	Okara	.31000*	.06513	.000
		TTSingh	.03000	.06513	.645
	Okara	Lahore	-.31000*	.06513	.000
		TTSingh	-.28000*	.06513	.000
	TTSingh	Lahore	-.03000	.06513	.645
		Okara	.28000*	.06513	.000
Water	Lahore	Okara	.06000*	.02635	.023
		TTSingh	.07000*	.02635	.008
	Okara	Lahore	-.06000*	.02635	.023
		TTSingh	.01000	.02635	.705
	TTSingh	Lahore	-.07000*	.02635	.008
		Okara	-.01000	.02635	.705
Caregiver	Lahore	Okara	-.02000	.05516	.717
		TTSingh	.65000*	.05516	.000
	Okara	Lahore	.02000	.05516	.717
		TTSingh	.67000*	.05516	.000
	TTSingh	Lahore	-.65000*	.05516	.000
		Okara	-.67000*	.05516	.000
Chair per child	Lahore	Okara	.32000*	.04635	.000
		TTSingh	.33000*	.04635	.000
	Okara	Lahore	-.32000*	.04635	.000
		TTSingh	.01000	.04635	.829
	TTSingh	Lahore	-.33000*	.04635	.000
		Okara	-.01000	.04635	.829

Board	Lahore	Okara	.19000*	.08550	.027
		TTSingh	.21000*	.08550	.015
	Okara	Lahore	-.19000*	.08550	.027
		TTSingh	.02000	.08550	.815
	TTSingh	Lahore	-.21000*	.08550	.015
		Okara	-.02000	.08550	.815
ECE kit	Lahore	Okara	-.11000	.06317	.083
		TTSingh	.23000*	.06317	.000
	Okara	Lahore	.11000	.06317	.083
		TTSingh	.34000*	.06317	.000
	TTSingh	Lahore	-.23000*	.06317	.000
		Okara	-.34000*	.06317	.000
Portfolio	Lahore	Okara	-.13000*	.05989	.031
		TTSingh	.45000*	.05989	.000
	Okara	Lahore	.13000*	.05989	.031
		TTSingh	.58000*	.05989	.000
	TTSingh	Lahore	-.45000*	.05989	.000
		Okara	-.58000*	.05989	.000
Room décor	Lahore	Okara	.37000*	.05169	.000
		TTSingh	.50000*	.05169	.000
	Okara	Lahore	-.37000*	.05169	.000
		TTSingh	.13000*	.05169	.012
	TTSingh	Lahore	-.50000*	.05169	.000
		Okara	-.13000*	.05169	.012
Language corner	Lahore	Okara	.17000	.09303	.069
		TTSingh	.80000*	.09303	.000
	Okara	Lahore	-.17000	.09303	.069
		TTSingh	.63000*	.09303	.000
	TTSingh	Lahore	-.80000*	.09303	.000
		Okara	-.63000*	.09303	.000
Math corner	Lahore	Okara	.16000*	.05587	.004
		TTSingh	.72000*	.05587	.000
	Okara	Lahore	-.16000*	.05587	.004
		TTSingh	.56000*	.05587	.000
	TTSingh	Lahore	-.72000*	.05587	.000
		Okara	-.56000*	.05587	.000
Reading corner	Lahore	Okara	.13000*	.05538	.020
		TTSingh	.72000*	.05538	.000
	Okara	Lahore	-.13000*	.05538	.020
		TTSingh	.59000*	.05538	.000
	TTSingh	Lahore	-.72000*	.05538	.000
		Okara	-.59000*	.05538	.000
Art corner	Lahore	Okara	.13000*	.05584	.021
		TTSingh	.71000*	.05584	.000
	Okara	Lahore	-.13000*	.05584	.021
		TTSingh	.58000*	.05584	.000
	TTSingh	Lahore	-.71000*	.05584	.000
		Okara	-.58000*	.05584	.000

Science corner	Lahore	Okara	.09000	.17418	.606
		TTSingh	.42000*	.17418	.017
	Okara	Lahore	-.09000	.17418	.606
		TTSingh	.33000	.17418	.059
	TTSingh	Lahore	-.42000*	.17418	.017
		Okara	-.33000	.17418	.059
Outdoor play area	Lahore	Okara	-.11000*	.05202	.035
		TTSingh	-.11000*	.05202	.035
	Okara	Lahore	.11000*	.05202	.035
		TTSingh	.00000	.05202	1.000
	TTSingh	Lahore	.11000*	.05202	.035
		Okara	.00000	.05202	1.000
Play equipment	Lahore	Okara	.01000	.04523	.825
		TTSingh	.31000*	.04523	.000
	Okara	Lahore	-.01000	.04523	.825
		TTSingh	.30000*	.04523	.000
	TTSingh	Lahore	-.31000*	.04523	.000
		Okara	-.30000*	.04523	.000
Play material	Lahore	Okara	.08000	.12048	.507
		TTSingh	1.18000*	.12048	.000
	Okara	Lahore	-.08000	.12048	.507
		TTSingh	1.10000*	.12048	.000
	TTSingh	Lahore	-1.18000*	.12048	.000
		Okara	-1.10000*	.12048	.000
Chidren art work	Lahore	Okara	.06000	.10478	.567
		TTSingh	1.19000*	.10478	.000
	Okara	Lahore	-.06000	.10478	.567
		TTSingh	1.13000*	.10478	.000
	TTSingh	Lahore	-1.19000*	.10478	.000
		Okara	-1.13000*	.10478	.000
Teacher made toy	Lahore	Okara	.57000*	.11702	.000
		TTSingh	1.39000*	.11702	.000
	Okara	Lahore	-.57000*	.11702	.000
		TTSingh	.82000*	.11702	.000
	TTSingh	Lahore	-1.39000*	.11702	.000
		Okara	-.82000*	.11702	.000
Learning aids	Lahore	Okara	-.21000	.10845	.054
		TTSingh	.47000*	.10845	.000
	Okara	Lahore	.21000	.10845	.054
		TTSingh	.68000*	.10845	.000
	TTSingh	Lahore	-.47000*	.10845	.000
		Okara	-.68000*	.10845	.000