Media, Education and Voting Behaviour: A Comparative Study of Communication Channels' Impact on Voters having Elementary, Secondary and Higher Education in Punjab, Pakistan

Muhammad Shabbir Sarwar*, Waqar Ul Haq**, Mudassir Mukhtar***, and Khuram Shahzad****

Abstract

This study examines the relationship between education, media and voting behaviour with special focus on elementary education. The quantitative research method of survey (n=1704) was applied to gather data using multi-stage cluster sampling technique from the registered voters in all 10 divisions of Punjab province. Factor analysis and logistic regression were performed for data analysis. The study results revealed that there was a significant association between education and voting behaviour as $\chi 2$ (8) = 54.631, p < .0005. Similarly, the strength of association, the value of Cramer's V = 0.191 was also significant. Moreover, the respondents having the master's degree or higher education were more likely to cast vote with a proportion of 88.1% as compared to the voters having elementary and secondary education. Furthermore, the voters having elementary education were influenced more from the interpersonal communication as compared to the voters having higher education. The study recommends that the government must focus on education in general and the elementary education in particular for establishing true democratic norms in the country. It is recommended that awareness on democracy and political participation especially importance of vote casting should be included in the curricula of elementary education.

Keywords: Voters education, democracy, Pakistan general elections, Punjab, voting behaviour, elementary education, communication channels

^{*}Assistant Professor, Institute of Communication Studies, University of the Punjab, Pakistan Email: drsarwar@ymail.com

^{**}Assistant Professor, Institute of Communication Studies, University of the Punjab, Pakistan ***Assistant Professor at the Department of Mass Communication, National University of Modern Languages, Islamabad, Pakistan

^{****}Public Relations Officer, PR Department, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan

1. Background and Introduction

Education and democracy have strong relationship as the countries where literacy rate is higher are experiencing better democracies because people exercise their right to vote in selecting able leadership. Across countries, education multiplies the benefits of civic engagement and political participation raising the required support for democracy. Education also increases the likelihood of democratic revolutions against dictatorial regimes (Glaeser, Ponzetto, & Shleifer, 2007).

Education promotes democracy in two ways as it enables a "culture of democracy" and it leads to greater prosperity, which ultimately brings political development. This argument is supported by the Modernization Theory, popularized by Seymour Martin Lipset (1959), which emphasizes therole of education as well as economic growth in promoting political development in general and democracy in particular (Acemoglu, Johnson, Robinson & Yared 2005).

According to the Economic Survey of Pakistan (2019), our country has the lowest literacy in the whole and more importantly only 68 percent student remain able to complete their elementary education. Although the literacy rate of Punjab province increased from 61.9% to 64.7% but due to COVID 19 it is expected to decrease in 2020.

Rule (2014) said that voting behaviours were certain actions of the citizens regarding participation in local, regional and national elections, while counting their voting behaviour either in support of parties or candidates or not voting and remaining away for the election process as an effect to the quality of their life in the form of good and bad choices as per their perceptions. However, Zaller (1992) said that people adopt certain behaviour or attitude on the basis of the information and ideas they are exposed to.

Media is an important mediator which along education complements the process of political participation educate the citizens regarding their vote decisions. In 2013 there were 121 TV channels including six state owned PTV channels, 89 private channels and 26 foreign TV channels with landing rights; 138 commercial FM radio channels; 64 Pakistan Broadcasting Corporation (PBC) stations, and 34 PBC-owned FM channels. In print media there are over 500 dailies and over 800 periodicals out of which 10 are largely circulated daily newspapers, while according to ABC and the Press Information Department there are 1500 regular dailies (PEMRA & APNS, 2016).

According to the Gallup Pakistan (2017) estimated number of TV viewers aged 10 and above reached to 86 million in 2009 from 63 million in 2004. In 2008 overall 79% men and 75% women used to watch TV, while this was 37% and 21% for radio, 42% and 13% for newspaper and 7% and 1% for Internet. In the year 2008 number of television sets were 3,100,000 whereas radio sets were 13,500,000 (Sarwar, 2018).

The main objective of this research was to analyse the relationship between media, education and voting behaviour of the registered voters of Punjab, Pakistan.

1.1. Research Questions

Following Research Questions guided this paper:

RQ1: Whether there is any relationship between Education, Media and voting behaviours in Punjab, Pakistan

RQ2: How media and other communication channels impacted voters having elementary education during General Election 2013

2.Method

This is a quantitative survey research and data was collected through a purpose built questionnaire comprised of 42 items from the 18 districts representing all 10 divisions of the largest populated Punjab province of Pakistan within two months after General Election 2013. According to the National Census of Pakistan 2017, the Punjab province's population was 110 million (Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, 2017). The Election Commission of Pakistan had registered 4,99,27,112 voters in General Election 2013 (57% of Pakistan's total votes) in the province out of which 28,064,284 (56.21%) were male and 21,862,830 (43.78%) were female (ECP, 2013).

Multistage cluster sampling technique was applied to collect data from respondents (n= 1704), the registered voters belonging to 18 districts of the province. Since the core idea this study was to measure impact of education and communication channels on voting behaviour of people in Punjab, the media and communication channels were operationally defined as:

- I. Electronic Media (EM): Television news channels, radio and Internet
- II. Print Media (PM): Newspapers and magazines
- III. Interpersonal Communication (IPC): Voters communication with their family members, friends, community fellows, political workers and candidates was termed as Interpersonal Communication
- IV. Outdoor Media (ODM): Election campaign through posters, banners, hoardings, pamphlets and advertisements on vehicles.

3. Data Analysis and Discussion

By using the technique of factor analysis the data was compressed to draw factors merging related variables. Factor comprised electronic media, print media, interpersonal communication and outdoor media. Later, logistic regression was performed to get the

study results. Also, chi-square tests were applied to measure the significance of association or impact.

Table 1Crosstab Education * Voting

			Voting		Total	
			No	Yes		
	TT 1 . 1	Count	39	143	182	
	Uneducated	% within Education	21.4%	78.6%	100.0%	
	M 1 F1	Count	33	37	70	
	Madrassa Edu.	% within Education	47.1%	52.9%	100.0%	
	D f 1 C	Count	3	22	25	
	Professional Certificate	% within Education	12.0%	88.0%	100.0%	
Education		Count	12	51	63	
	Elementary Education	% within Education	19.0%	81.0%	100.0%	
	NC 111 (G 1)	Count	24	103	127	
	Middle (Secondary)	% within Education	18.9%	81.1%	100.0%	
	No. 1 de la	Count	50	189	239	
	Matriculation	% within Education	20.9%	79.1%	100.0%	
	*	Count	82	202	284	
		Intermediate	% within Education	28.9%	71.1%	100.0%
		Count	51	261	312	
	Grad	Graduation	% within Education	16.3%	83.7%	100.0%
	M · III 1	Count	23	171	194	
	Masters or Higher	% within Education	11.9%	88.1%	100.0%	
T 1		Count	317	1179	1496	
Total		% within Education	21.2%	78.8%	100.0%	

Table 2 *Chi-Square Tests*

	Value	df Asymp. Sig. (2-sided)
Pearson Chi-Square	54.631 ^a	8 .000
Likelihood Ratio	50.795	8 .000
Linear-by-Linear Association	9.800	1 .002
N of Valid Cases	1496	

a. 0 cells (0.0%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is 5.30.

Table 3Symmetric Measures

•		Value Approx. Sig.
	Phi	.191 .000
Nominal by Nominal	Cramer's V	.191 .000
	Contingency Coefficient	.188 .000
N of Valid Cases		1496

This table depicted that there was a significant association between education and voting behavior as $\chi 2$ (8) = 54.631, p< .0005. Similarly, the strength of association, the value of Cramer's V = 0.191 which was also significant. Moreover, the Masters or higher education respondents were more likely to cast vote with a proportion of 88.1%.

Table 4 *Education and Impact of Communication channels on Voting (Variables in the Equation)*

Education			В	S.E.	Wald	df	Sig.	Exp(B)
Uneducated	Step 1 ^a	EM_Mean	.042	.413	.010	1	.919	1.043
		IPC_Mean	1.736	.357	23.576	1	.000	5.673
		OM_Mean	561	.288	3.785	1	.052	.571
		PM_Mean	908	.356	6.523	1	.011	.403
		Constant	.712	1.368	.271	1	.603	2.038
	Step 1 ^a	EM_Mean	-2.527	.823	9.421	1	.002	.080
Modrosso		IPC_Mean	.262	.354	.548	1	.459	1.300
Madrassa Education		OM_Mean	.065	.313	.044	1	.835	1.068
		PM_Mean	.832	.421	3.913	1	.048	2.299
		Constant	5.080	2.555	3.955	1	.047	160.798
Professional Certificate	Step 1 ^a	EM_Mean	-2.793	1.953	2.045	1	.153	.061
		IPC_Mean	3.119	3.360	.862	1	.353	22.63
		OM_Mean	-3.073	2.741	1.257	1	.262	.046
		PM_Mean	132	1.025	.017	1	.898	.877
		Constant	11.048	6.676	2.739	1	.098	62845.61
Elementary Education	Step 1 ^a	EM_Mean	359	.596	.364	1	.546	.698
		IPC_Mean	.331	.469	.497	1	.481	1.392
		OM_Mean	.211	.430	.240	1	.624	1.235
		PM_Mean	994	.524	3.593	1	.058	.370
		Constant	3.187	2.572	1.536	1	.215	24.223
Middle School	Step 1 ^a	EM_Mean	.453	.448	1.024	1	.312	1.573
		IPC_Mean	1.179	.330	12.743	1	.000	3.253

		OM_Mean	689	.300	5.273	1	.022	.502
		PM_Mean	-1.035	.402	6.631	1	.010	.355
		Constant	1.320	1.894	.486	1	.486	3.744
		EM_Mean	243	.314	.596	1	.440	.784
Matric Ster		IPC_Mean	.333	.189	3.087	1	.079	1.395
	Step 1 ^a	OM_Mean	159	.160	.992	1	.319	.853
	-	PM_Mean	479	.235	4.148	1	.042	.619
		Constant	2.683	1.205	4.962	1	.026	14.634
		EM_Mean	.105	.255	.170	1	.680	1.111
		IPC_Mean	.606	.172	12.368	1	.000	1.833
Intermediate	Step 1 ^a	OM_Mean	.084	.150	.314	1	.576	1.088
	-	PM_Mean	421	.171	6.053	1	.014	.656
		Constant	423	.839	.254	1	.614	.655
		EM_Mean	899	.297	9.194	1	.002	.407
Graduation Ste		IPC_Mean	.391	.193	4.099	1	.043	1.478
	Step 1 ^a	OM_Mean	.351	.170	4.264	1	.039	1.421
-		PM_Mean	272	.211	1.659	1	.198	.762
		Constant	2.659	1.004	7.015	1	.008	14.277
Masters or Higher	Step 1 ^a	EM_Mean	.097	.435	.050	1	.823	1.102
		IPC_Mean	.816	.351	5.421	1	.020	2.262
		OM_Mean	229	.289	.625	1	.429	.796
		PM_Mean	123	.315	.152	1	.697	.885
		Constant	.722	1.538	.221	1	.639	2.059

a. Variable(s) entered on step 1: EM_Mean_., IPC_Mean_., OM_Mean_., PM_Mean_..

This table reflects that uneducated voters were positively influenced by interpersonal communication (B=1.736, p<.0005) with an odd ratio of 5.673 while negatively by print media (B=-.908, p<.05) with an odd ratio of .403. Madrassa educated voters were positively influenced by print media (B=.83, p<.05) with an odd ratio of 2.30 while electronic media negatively influenced (B=-2.53, p<.005) with an odd ratio of .080. The voters having elementary education were positively influenced by the interpersonal communication while there was no strong relationship between electronic media, outdoor media or print media. The voters having only elementary education casted their vote in General Election 2013 after consultation/discussions with their family elders, family members, community fellows and work place colleagues, political works, and candidates. Secondary school educated voters were positively influenced by IPC (B=1.179, p<.0005) with an odd ratio of 3.25 and negatively influenced by outdoor media (B= -.159, p<.05) with an odd ratio of .502 and print media (B=.-1.035, p<.05) with odd ratio .355.

Matriculation pass voters were significantly negatively influenced by print media (B=.479, p<.05) with an odd ratio of .619. Intermediate degree qualified voters were positively influenced by IPC (B=.606, p<.0005) with an odd ratio of 1.09. and negatively influenced

print media (B=-.421, p<.05) with an odd ratio of 0.66. Bachelor's degree holder or Graduate voters were significantly positively influenced by IPC and outdoor media (B=.391, p<.05) with odd ratio 1.48 (B=.351, p<.05) with an odd ratio 1.42 respectively. Master's degree holder and higher qualified were only significantly positively influenced by the IPC (B=.816, p<.05) with an odd ratio of 2.26. Voters who were certified in various professions or who acquired education up to primary school education (class 5) level, they were not significantly influenced by any channel of communication in their vote decision in General Election 2013.

4. Conclusion and Recommendations

The study results reveal a significant relationship between citizens' education, their media exposure and vote decisions during general elections in Punjab, Pakistan. The voters with higher education were more independent of the influence of various media and communication channels during General Election 2013 as compared to the voters with lower education. Those who acquired elementary education and voted in general election in Punjab had a positive significant relationship with interpersonal communication i.e. communication with family, friends, locality and work fellows as well as political workers and election candidates. However, voters with elementary education had no significant impact of electronic media, print media, outdoor media and entertainment media. The study also found that people with low education mostly depends on the people around them during election for their vote decision.

The study recommends increasing literacy rate and education level of voters to implement democracy in true sense in the country as indicated from the study results that people with elementary education only could not decide for their vote at their own and they mostly remain dependent on other influential people around them. It is recommended that awareness on democracy and political participation especially importance of vote casting should be included in the curricula of elementary education.

References

Ahmed, M. (2012). Voting behaviour in rural and urban areas of Punjab. *Journal of Political Studies*, *14*, 45-56. Retrieved July 15, 2016 from: http://pu.edu.pk/images/journal/pols/Currentissue pdf/voting%20behaviour.pdf

"All provinces outshine Sindh in literacy rate" (2019). Retrieved April 09, 2020 from: https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2019/10/14/all-provinces-outshine-sindh-in-literacy-rate/

- Acemoglu, Daron; Johnson, Simon; Robinson, James & Yared, Pierre A. (2005). *From Education to Democracy*. Retrieved April 10, 2016 from: https://pubs.aeaweb.org/doi/pdf/10.1257/000282805774669916
- Election Commission of Pakistan. (2013). *Report on the General Elections 2013*. (Volume I). Retrieved July 2016 from:

 https://www.ecp.gov.pk/Documents/General%20Elections%202013%20report/Election%20Report%202013%20Volume-I.pdf
- Gallup Pakistan. (2017). Media: TV Viewership Habits. Retreived June 10, 2017. From: http://gallup.com.pk/wp-content/uploads/2017/06/TV-Viewership-Habits-1.pdf
- Glaeser, E.L., Ponzetto, G.A.M. & Shleifer, A. (2007). *Why does democracy need education?* J Econ Growth 12, 77–99. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10887-007-9015-1
- Pakistan Bureau of Statistics. (2017). *Province Wise Provisional Results of Census* 2017. Retrieved February 20, 2018 from: http://www.pbs.gov.pk/sites/default/files/PAKISTAN%20TEHSIL%20WISE%20FOR%20WEB%20CENSUS_2017.pdf
- Rule, S. (2014). Encyclopaedia of Quality of Life and Well-Being Research. (A. C. Michalos, Ed.) Dordrecht: Springer. Retrieved from https://link.springer.com/referenceworkentry/10.1007%2F978-94-007-0753
 5_3181
- Sarwar, M. Shabbir (2018). *Impact of Communication Channels on Voting Behaviour in Punjab, Pakistan: A Longitudinal Study of General Elections 2013* (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, Pakistan.
- Stuteville, Sarah (August 16, 2009: The Seattle Times). Education in Pakistan. Retrieved from:

 "seattletimes.nwsource.com/html/localnews/2009670134_pakistanschool16.html"
- Zaller, J. (1992). The Nature and Origins of Mass Opinion. New York: Cambridge University Press. Retrieved June 10, 2016 from: fromhttp://ebooks.cambridge.org/ebook.jsf?bid=CBO9780511818691