



## Ranking of Economic Issues of Pakistan: Print Media and Audience Perspective

Hayam Qayyoom<sup>1</sup> Qurat ul Ain Malik<sup>2</sup>

### Abstract

The purpose of the study is to analyze the opinion of audience and print media about ranking of economic issues of Pakistan. During the pandemic COVID-19 world faced economic crisis, inflation and set back in business. Therefore, the perspective regarding economic issue is changed and dire need to analyzing agenda of print media and audience agenda on economic issue of Pakistan for one year (March 2020 till March 2021). The research question of the study is, “whether and to what extent, the relation exists between print media and audience in ranking the economic issue of Pakistan.” For this purpose, content analysis of mainstream and high circulation newspapers were examined, quantitatively. The people of Islamabad is the population, from which the sample of 150 was drawn conveniently. Variables of this research was salience of issues and rank order. Statistical test, Spearman rank order correlation was opted to test the hypothesis H, “The more coverage of economic issues of Pakistan in the print media, more is importance for audience.” It revealed that there is very weak strength of association exists between print media agenda and audience agenda. It signifies that audience opinion and print media perspective are not the same. Audience give preference to the issue which media does not. Preference and importance of economic issue for both entities are different from one another.

**Keyword:** *Audience Agenda, Economic Issues of Pakistan, Print Media Agenda*

### Introduction

The postulate of the agenda setting theory was that media has the and Shaw’s seminal study provided the bedrock for the thought

---

<sup>1</sup> Assistant Professor, Department of Media Studies, Bahria University, Islamabad, Pakistan.

<sup>2</sup> Assistant Professor, Department of Media and Communication Studies, International Islamic University, Islamabad, Pakistan.

the ability to transfer its salience of issue to audience. McCombs that public attitude is influenced by media coverage (1972, p.176). That later becomes audience agenda (Freeland, 2012). Idid and Chang (2012, p.114) concluded that newspaper of China and audience of china are significantly correlated with same rank order on political leaders. According to Mun and Li the audience agenda and the issues raised by reports during 12th general elections are similar (2011, p.43). Hopmann suggested that TV influence the undecided voters to become the active voters (2010, p.401). Print media can effect voters and for media cannot influence the public on environmental and economic issue (Hannigan, 1995). Agenda reform the opinions as described by Abideen that issue covered are environmental and less economic (2010, p. 14). Dunlop expressed that government agenda is to highlight environment related issue. The relation exists between government policy and print media agenda on environmental issue instead of economic issues (1995).Chen proposed that agenda setting can influence public on limited issues. The political campaign and election are the issues which are covered drastically whereas economic issues needed to be focused (2017, p.31). Agenda is set to achieve the political objectives and economic issues are given less importance (Bennett, 2008, p.714).

Researches showed that the coverage of economic situation by media influenced the public perception about economy of the country beyond the real impact which the economy had (Boomgaarden, et al. 2011; Haller & Norpoth, 1997; Goidel & Langley, 1995; Sorok, et al. 2015; Quiring & Weber, 2012). Before the issues are being presented to the public they are

first shaped by the journalists in two principal ways: firstly, by the amount of attention which is given to an issue; and secondly, the tone with which an issue is presented before media. This then influences the public perception about an issue (Sheafer, 2007).

Studies also established that people update their economic expectations more in the times of crisis than in the times of peace (Carroll, 2003, p.291). Shoemaker and Reese (2013, p.250) that the content on media is a socially created product instead of reflection of an objective reality. Soroka (2015) argued that the difference between coverage of economy by media and real economic conditions of a country shows that content on media is a socially created product.

Keeping in view the above studies, this study is to find, if relationship exists between print media agenda and audience agenda on economic issues of Pakistan. Pakistan had gone through economic crisis various times involving the devaluation of Rupee, increase in the interest rate, increase in inflation, and decline in exports. Another great challenge before government is to overcome the fiscal deficit which is getting fueled due to increased foreign borrowing (Economic Survey 2018-19: Economy hits nine-year low at 3.3pc, n.d.). In this study economic issues like Inflation, Petrol Price Hike, Unemployment, Dollar Value Increase, Trade with India, Rupee Devaluation, Increase in GST, Stock Market Issues, Customs and Taxes, Welfare Schemes.

As described above, the relationship between the coverage of economic issues in the media and audience on economic issue are yet to be explored. It has been revealed from the literature that most of the researches focused on the political

and environmental issues to find the relation between public and media. The relation of media and audience with economic issues is considered to be a part of political science and economics discipline. As the agenda setting theory proposed that relation exists between public agenda and media agenda on political, social, health care and environmental issues. Different issues set varied agenda setting results. Economic issues need more focus (Brosius, 1990, p.183). Therefore, this article fulfills the gap literature related to agenda setting theory. The influence of media on audience in ranking the issues and salience transfer pre and post budget of Pakistan, is analyzed which is used as secondary data that would support the upcoming scholars. In the agenda setting theory the selection of issues is mainly on electoral campaigns, voting behavior, political leaders, environment and politicians' profile. The researchers conducted in developed countries more than in the developing countries.

The economic issues are important because developing countries are in severe economic crisis during COVID-19. Economic issues gained importance so this research is major contribution. In the agenda setting theory and also in the ranking of issue that examined the opinion of people of Pakistan and media perspective about the economic issues. For this purpose two newspapers have been selected. Daily DAWN, a part of Pakistan Herald Publications, started in 1941 as a weekly newspaper then daily one. Its political alignment is liberal, centrist and progressive. Its weekly circulation was 148,909 copies in 2019 (DAWN Newspaper, 2019). The second is The News International of Jang group's publication started in February 1991

an English version with the name of "The News". It is moderate political alignment and weekly circulation of 159,000 in year 2018 (Media of Pakistan, 2019).

The objective of the study is to find out the ranking between print media and audience on economic issues of Pakistan.

### **Literature Review**

McCombs and Shaw worked on agenda setting theory and discovered that media transfer its salience issue to public. (Aruguete, 2017, p.28). Panel study of Chapel Hill voters in 1968 elections times in New Hampshire, Indiana and Illinois voters nine times resulted correlation between TV and voters  $+0.63$ , whereas the relation between newspapers and the audience agenda was  $+0.34$  (1972, pp. 176,187). According to McCombs (2002) audience preference is related with the media (p. 1-18). The researcher analyzed that the highlighted issues become important for the public. (p. 1-18). McCombs and Shaw (1972) focused on transferring of an issue from media to the audience (pp.176-187).

Prior to Mc Combs and Shaw, Walter Lipmann's picture in hour heads has expressed that the audience behavior is not result of reality that exists but the image in mind that as they think, it exists (Lipmann, 1922, p. 29). Coleman, McCombs, Shaw and Weaver (2009) also suggested media focus on specific issue and repeatedly show to public and that issues also become important for the public (p. 147).Cohen's gatekeeping concept claimed that controlled content is presented to alter perception of audience (1963, p.609). Coleman, Weaver (2009) explored the most covered issue in media are considered important by audience (p. 147).

McCombs and Llamas (1997,p.703) worked on second level agenda setting for substantive or ideological and second is affective tone i.e. positive, negative and neutral that is called attribute agenda setting. According Kiouisis, Bantimaroudis and Ban substantive and affective dimensions as well causal relationship observed between attribute agenda and audience opinion about political leaders (1999, pp. 416-417). The ranking of issue discovered by Kim and McCombs (2007,p. 299).

Wu and Coleman (2009, p.775) while working on advancement of agenda setting found in 2nd level agenda setting about the characteristics have much stronger effect on audience than salience of issues. Guizlo (2012) positive mean correlation (+0.53) of media and audience agenda were found by Wanta and Ghanem in meta-analysis of 90 studies conducted in 2005. McCombs and Weaver (2014) found the relationship between salience transfers of media to audience, having strong correlation (p.781).

Moreover, Palmgreen and Clark (1977) examined relation of media agenda and audience on local economic problems. The research revealed that the influence on local level is very weak but strong at the national level (p.435). Hispanic Cable News by Ghanem and Wanta (2006, p.277) explored that “exposure” is most effecting determining factor in setting the agenda than the reliance and credibility. McCombs, Lopez-Escobar and Llamas (2000) described that the agenda of attributes because some attributes receive more attention and some very little whereas few are neglected (p.77). Mikami, Takeshita, Nakada, and Kawabata (1995) examined that agenda setting not meant to

portray image of political leader but also present issues effectively. Dunn (2009) examined that media has power to change perception of people (p.635). According to new dimensions, it has been revealed that there are seven faces of agenda setting theory (Kim, Kim & Zhou, 2017, p.5). Harris (2010, p.9) in analysis of agenda setting and press coverage in the 1999 Greek European elections of press releases party manifestos and audience opinion before campaign concluded that agendas influence perception of people. Golan and Wanta (2001) explored the attributes of advertisement of Kerry's and audience opinion of issues and they also discovered that positive negative or neutral tone shaped the opinions of the public.

Brubaker (2008) in finding the personal agenda determine the salient issue for the media coverage. This study failed to support agenda setting because results revealed that TV viewers, Internet users, and audience have same agendas but that are different from the media agenda. Coleman and Wu in 2nd level agenda supported that media do not set the audience agenda setting separating affective and substantive dimension (2010, p.327).

A research on media fragmentation of attribute agenda setting on political opinions of Iraq by Muddiman, Stroud and McCombs (2014) examined content of coverage of TV news and survey that user of one media outlet have the different perception than the two. Merrill, (1995) found pro and anti-picture of the world in minds. Wang, (2000, p.59) found relation between online newspaper and audience agenda on policy issues. Cuestas found no relation between media agenda and audience agenda in

comparing of local newspaper and issues of government affairs, there is strong correlation exists between media and audience perception on specific issue (2009, p.97).

RQ1. Whether and to what extent the relation exists between ranking of economic issue of Pakistan between print media and audience.

H1. The more coverage of economic issues of Pakistan in the media, more is importance for audience.

### **Methodology**

This study analyzed the relation of ranking of economic issues of Pakistani readers and the coverage of economic issues in the print media from 1st March 2020 till 30th March 2021. The study includes content analysis of two leading newspapers and survey of 150 respondents. Quantitative content analysis and Survey carried out on economic issues. Two mainstream newspapers of Pakistan selected due to wide circulated i.e. DAWN and The News International of period from 1st March 2020 till 30th March 2021. Content analysis of mainstream and high circulation newspapers examined, quantitatively. The people of Islamabad is the population, from which the sample of 150 was drawn conveniently. For Survey, total sample size comprised of 150 respondents selected purposively from G-8, G-9 and G-10 outlets. Variables of this research was salience of issues and rank order.

The database of 'LexisNexis' was used to collect the data of newspaper content (DAWN and The News International). For survey, structured questionnaire was developed and administered in person visits. Unit of analysis is the Paragraph of editorial and columns of two newspapers. In survey,

questionnaire was furnished and collect the data on economic issue. Issue of the study are; Inflation, Petrol Price Hike, Unemployment Issue , Dollar Increase, Trade with India Issue, Rupee Devaluation, Increase Utility Bills, Gold Price, Customs and Freight Charges and Income Support Programs Failure.

**Table 1:** Content Categorization Rules

| Variables         | Content Categories              | Rules   |
|-------------------|---------------------------------|---|
| Topics/<br>Issues | Inflation                       | News story containing information about increase in inflation rate in Pakistan coded as Inflation.                          |
|                   | Petrol Price Hike               | News story containing information about increase in Petrol Price in Pakistan coded as Petrol Price Hike.                    |
|                   | Unemployment Issue              | News story containing information about increase in <u>unemployment</u> in Pakistan coded as Unemployment Issue.            |
|                   | Dollar Increase                 | News story containing information about increase in Dollar coded as Dollar Increase.  |
|                   | Trade with India Issue          | News story containing information about trade with India coded as Trade with India Issue.                                   |
|                   | Rupee Devaluation               | News story containing information about devalue of Rupees coded as Rupee Devaluation.                                       |
|                   | Increase Utility Bills          | News story containing information about utility bills coded as Increase Utility Bills.                                      |
|                   | Gold Price                      | News story containing information about increase price of gold India coded as Gold Price.                                   |
|                   | Customs and Freight Charges     | News story containing information about increase in custom and freight coded as Customs and Freight Charges.                |
|                   | Income Support Programs Failure | News story containing information about failure to provide income support program coded as Income Support Programs failure. |

## Results

Holsti inter-coder reliability test: The Holsti Inter-coder reliability coefficient for the sampled Newspapers (columns and editorials related to economic issues) is as follows;

Inter-coder Reliability of Newspaper: 0.920 or 92%

**Salience and Rank Order on Economic Issues in Newspapers Content**

In total 169 (N=169) editorials and Columns published in both newspapers. Rank order of the issues related to economic issues of Pakistan. Whereas for salience of issues, related with frequency of the issue. Highest frequency is ranked as 1st, then 2nd and so on.

**Table 2:** *Salience and Rank Order on Economic Issues in Newspaper Content*

| Economic Issues                               | Newspaper Content |         | Number of Words | Frequency  | Salience of Issue of Scale | Rank Order       |
|---|-------------------|---------|-----------------|------------|----------------------------|------------------|
|   | Editorials        | Columns |                 |            |                            |                  |
| <b>Inflation</b>                              | 8                 | 21      | 102321          | 29(17%)    | 10                         | 1 <sup>st</sup>  |
| <b>Petrol Price Hike</b>                      | 5                 | 19      | 27321           | 24(14%)    | 9                          | 2 <sup>nd</sup>  |
| <b>Unemployment</b>                           | 4                 | 17      | 27201           | 21(12.4%)  | 8                          | 3 <sup>rd</sup>  |
| <b>Dollar Increase</b>                        | 3                 | 14      | 26111           | 17(10%)    | 7                          | 4 <sup>th</sup>  |
| <b>Trade with India</b>                       | 2                 | 13      | 24010           | 15(8.8%)   | 6                          | 5 <sup>th</sup>  |
| <b>Rupee Devaluation</b>                      | 3                 | 11      | 23122           | 14(8.2%)   | 5                          | 6 <sup>th</sup>  |
| <b>Increase Utility Bills</b>                 | 3                 | 11      | 20110           | 14(8.2%)   | 4                          | 7 <sup>th</sup>  |
| <b>Gold Price</b>                             | 2                 | 8       | 11925           | 10(5.9%)   | 3                          | 8 <sup>th</sup>  |
| <b>Customs and Freight Charges</b>            | 2                 | 7       | 9112            | 9(5.3%)    | 2                          | 9 <sup>th</sup>  |
| <b>Welfare Support Programs of Government</b> | 1                 | 5       | 6721            | 6(3.5%)    | 1                          | 10 <sup>th</sup> |
| <b>Total</b>                                  | 33                | 136     |                 | 169 (100%) |                            |                  |
|   | 227,954           |         |                 |            |                            |                  |

According to newspaper agenda, sustained development considered not important issue. The newspaper content comprised of total number of words by the selected newspapers (DAWN and The News International) were 227,954. Total 33 editorial and columns written whereas 8 and 21 comprised of Inflation of 102321 words. It is ranked at 1<sup>st</sup>. 2<sup>nd</sup> ranked issue is Petrol Price Hike comprised of words 27321 and coverage given by both newspapers were 5, 19 editorials and columns. Unemployment comprised of 27201 words and ranked 3<sup>rd</sup> due to less coverage in DAWN and the News International. Dollar Increase ranked 4<sup>th</sup> with 3 editorials and 14 columns comprised of 26111 words. Trade with India is ranked 5<sup>th</sup> due to 24010 number of words. On Rupee Devaluation number of words written are 23122 which 14(8.2%) of the total and ranked 6<sup>th</sup>. Increase Utility Bills comprised of 20110 words and 14(8.2%) of the total, ranked 7<sup>th</sup>. Gold Price ranked 8<sup>th</sup> with 11925 words count. Total number of words written on Customs and Freight Charges are 9112 and ranked 9<sup>th</sup>. Welfare Support Programs of Government words count is 6721 and ranked 10<sup>th</sup>.

### **Analysis**

Questionnaire was developed. Question number 1 examined the preference of respondents of Newspapers i.e. DAWN and The News International. Due to purposive sampling, 150 respondent of DAWN and The NEWS International, Both readers were selected. Three (3) choices were given in the first question. First option was DAWN, second option was The News International and the third option was Both of Them.

**Table 3: Newspaper Preference**

| Newspapers             | Frequency | Percentage |
|------------------------|-----------|------------|
| DAWN                   | 32        | 21.3%      |
| The News International | 24        | 16.7%      |
| Both Newspapers        | 94        | 62%        |
| Total                  | N=150     | 100%       |

Table 3 measured the preference of readers of newspapers. 32 responses were in favour of DAWN and 24 were in favour of The News International. Respondents who prefer to read both newspaper were 94. Total number of respondents were 150.

**Salience and Rank Order on Economic Issues of Respondents**

Salience of issue and ranking by the respondents were analyzed related with economic issues of readers of DAWN, The News International and Both of Them options on scale of 1-10 for salience of issue and ranking from 1<sup>st</sup>, 2<sup>nd</sup> and so on.

**Table 4: Salience and Rank Order on Economic Issues of Respondents**

| Economic Issues                           | Frequency (%)<br>N=150 | Salience<br>of Issue<br>of Scale | Rank Order       |
|---|------------------------|----------------------------------|------------------|
| Unemployment                              | 25(16%)                | 10                               | 1 <sup>st</sup>  |
| Increase Utility Bills                    | 21(14%)                | 9                                | 2 <sup>nd</sup>  |
| Petrol Price Hike                         | 19(12.6%)              | 8                                | 3 <sup>rd</sup>  |
| Inflation                                 | 18(12%)                | 7                                | 4 <sup>th</sup>  |
| Trade with India                          | 15(10%)                | 6                                | 5 <sup>th</sup>  |
| Rupee Devaluation                         | 13(8.6%)               | 5                                | 6 <sup>th</sup>  |
| Gold Price                                | 12(8%)                 | 4                                | 7 <sup>th</sup>  |
| Welfare Support Programs of<br>Government | 10(6.6%)               | 3                                | 8 <sup>th</sup>  |
| Customs and Freight Charges               | 9(6%)                  | 2                                | 9 <sup>th</sup>  |
| Dollar Increase                           | 8(5.3%)                | 1                                | 10 <sup>th</sup> |

According to data collected from respondents for salience and the ranking of economic issues revealed that the

Unemployment 25(16%) is ranked 1<sup>st</sup>, Increase Utility Bills 21(14%) ranked 2<sup>nd</sup>, Petrol Price Hike 19(12.6%) ranked 3<sup>rd</sup>, Inflation 18(12%) ranked 4<sup>th</sup>, Trade with India 15(10%) ranked 5<sup>th</sup>, Rupee Devaluation 13(8.6%) ranked 6<sup>th</sup>, Gold Price 12(8%) ranked 7<sup>th</sup>, Welfare Support Programs of Government 10(6.6%) ranked 8<sup>th</sup>, Customs and Freight Charges 9(6%) ranked 9<sup>th</sup> and Dollar Increase 8(5.3%) ranked 10<sup>th</sup>.

Rank Order on Economic Issue

Economic Issues ranked by Respondents and Print Media of Pakistan are given the table below.

**Table 5:** *Economic Issues ranked by Respondents and Print Media of Pakistan*

| Rank Order       | Economic Issues ranked by Respondents  | Economic Issues ranked by Print Media  |
|------------------|--|--|
| 1 <sup>st</sup>  | Unemployment                           | Inflation                              |
| 2 <sup>nd</sup>  | Increase Utility Bills                 | Petrol Price Hike                      |
| 3 <sup>rd</sup>  | Petrol Price Hike                      | Unemployment                           |
| 4 <sup>th</sup>  | Inflation                              | Dollar Increase                        |
| 5 <sup>th</sup>  | Trade with India                       | Trade with India                       |
| 6 <sup>th</sup>  | Rupee Devaluation                      | Rupee Devaluation                      |
| 7 <sup>th</sup>  | Gold Price                             | Increase Utility Bills                 |
| 8 <sup>th</sup>  | Welfare-Support Programs of Government | Gold Price                             |
| 9 <sup>th</sup>  | Customs and Freight Charges            | Customs and Freight Charges            |
| 10 <sup>th</sup> | Dollar Increase                        | Welfare-Support Programs of Government |

In the table 5 print media give top rank to inflation. Inflation effect media earnings and media business whereas respondents are very much suffering due to inflation. It means

inflation itself is not the priority for respondents but the outcome of inflation i.e. unemployment is ranked at the top. Moreover, Increase Utility Bills is related with the respondent house hold matters which has the 2<sup>nd</sup> priority while Petrol Price Hike is a priority of media industry as they have to move around to gather the news and other investigative purposes. Respondents and media both reacted towards the decision on trade with India which is in any case not acceptable for the whole country. Hence both are on the same page. On Pak Rupee devaluation both have the same stance. Rest of the economic issue are not ranked the same due to different economic status between media and respondents and perspective towards the issue. Like the dollar increase is a least concerned issue for the respondents and media showed least concern towards the Welfare Support Programs of Government.

**Table 6: Spearman's Rank Order Correlation**

| Sub-Hypotheses   | Spearman's Rho ( $\rho$ ) Correlation Coefficient ( $r_s$ ) | Sig. (2-tailed) (P) | Strength of Relationship     | Significant/ Not Significant   |
|--|---|---------------------|------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| H1 The more coverage of economic issues of Pakistan in the print media, more is the importance for audience. | -.211   | .571                | A Weak Negative Relationship | Correlation is not Significant |

Hypothesis tested by applying Spearman's Rank Order Correlation and strength of relationship was also examined.

Study examined the H1 by applying Spearman rank order correlation through SPSS to find out the correlation between media agenda on economic issues of Pakistan with audience agenda on the same issues.

The strength of relationship is weak negative in H1. Correlation between media agenda and audience agenda on economic issues is ( $r_s$ ) =.211 ; P=.571 which is not significant. Therefore, hypothesis of setting the agenda by the media on economic issues of Pakistan and its influence on the audience, is not supported. Hypothesis H1 strengthens the hypothesis of Harris, Fury and Lock that due to agenda-setting the effect of the press in selecting the topics and transferring from media to audiences of international and economic issues during political campaign, is not significant. Negative weak relationship revealed that the selected sample of respondents belongs to middle class with middle economic status whose priority is to seek job, pay utility bills and petrol price hike. For media the more coverage is given to Inflation as media's finances are directly link with it. Moreover, it is the priority issue of the Government, hence more coverage is given to inflation. Petrol Price Hike, Unemployment, Dollar Increase are ranked afterwards. The patronage behavior like trade with India and Pak Rupee devaluation ranked 5<sup>th</sup> and 6<sup>th</sup> respectively. Sample of the study and media, both belong to Pakistan had showed loyalty towards the country and due to their emotional affiliation they ranked the same.

The findings revealed that the ranking of respondents and media is like opposite to one another means if one is

increasing the other variable is decreasing. This study refutes the McCombs and Shaw's seminal study of public attitude is influenced by media coverage (1972, p.176). The result has evidenced that media cannot transfer salience of issue to the public. Therefore, public is not influenced by the media agenda. Public has its own agenda on economic issues and that is related with their socio-economic status.

### **Discussion**

It has been revealed from the findings of H1 of this study, "The more coverage of economic issues of Pakistan in the print media, more is the importance for audience," is not supported. Hypothesis H1 of the study revealed that there is very weak strength of association exists between print media agenda and audience agenda ( $r_s = -.211$ ;  $p=.571$ ).

In this study, issues were related with economy of Pakistan. In Pakistan, majority of population lies in the strata of lower middle class. The economy of Pakistan is in crisis phase due to high inflation rate, lack of foreign investments, international debts burden and security issues. The purchasing power is very low as compared to the previous few years as nowadays unemployment rate is also increasing drastically. Audience has become very practical and active and due to non-credible media practices, along with increased trust deficit. Audience is not media content dependent anymore as they are experiencing the collapsed economy situation every day. Hence, very weak relation is found between print media and the audience as one variable increases, the other decreases.

**Conclusion**

Print media of Pakistan has limited effect on audience. Issue ranked by both, print media and audience are not the same. Their ranking of issue is not the same except trade with India and Rupee devaluation. It shows that trade with India stance and Rupee devaluation against dollar stances are rated same whereas rest eight (8) issues are not ranked the same. The issue rated same because of the hatred towards India and dollar. To keep the same pace, newspapers of Pakistan support the hatred towards India.

The sample selection was from the middle class only, therefore the priority they give to the economic issues is linked with their everyday earning and spending. For middle class is three issues have the priority unemployment as they don't have various income sources, they have to pay bills on monthly basis, and if they are unemployed they would not meet the ends. And the last is petrol price which is linked with their employment. If the price of petrol increase, all the product and utility prices increase. Whereas, media cover the Government stance. The agenda behind is that the media want to avail the highest ads distribution by Press information department. Both are opposite to one another. This shows the weak relationship among audience and media.

Keeping in view the issue related to the developing country like Pakistan where there is middle class grew by an average of 16.2% per year are. Political unrest in Pakistan also leads to the instable economic growth. There is lack of economic management intellect in Pakistan. Beaucrates making the economic policies who are unaware of the middle and lower class'

problems and issues. Unemployment rate is increasing on daily basis. COVID-19 in another aspect that added to unemployment and economic chaos. The ruling class economic ideology differs from the public demands. Therefore, Print media agenda cannot become audience agenda and media is not able to transfer its salience to the audience.

Therefore, Print media agenda cannot become audience agenda as there is very weak negative relation exist between both. This study refuted the Mc Combs and Shaw's study of salience transfer from media to public and media agenda becomes audience agenda. In this regard, this study is contributing in the agenda setting theory by disproving the hypothesis of transfer of issue salience from media to public.

### **References**

- Abideen, U.Z. (2010). Effects of television advertising on children: with special reference to Pakistani urban children. Munich Personal RePEc Archive. Retrieved from [https://mpra.ub.uni-muenchen.de/22321/1/MPRA\\_paper\\_22321.pdf](https://mpra.ub.uni-muenchen.de/22321/1/MPRA_paper_22321.pdf), on 19 January, 2019
- Aruguete, N. (2017, April ). The agenda setting hypothesis in the new media environment. *Comunicacion y Sociedad (Mexico)*, 28, 35-58. doi:10.32870/cys.v0i28.2929
- Bennett, W. L., & Iyengar, S. (2008). A new era of minimal effects? The changing foundations of political communication. *Journal of Communication*, 58(4), 707-731.
- Brubaker, J. (2008). The Freedom to Choose a Personal Agenda: Removing Our Reliance on the Media Agenda. *American Communication Journal*, 10(3).
- Brosius, H., & Kepplinger, H.M. (1990). The Agenda-Setting Function of Television News. *Communication Research*, 17, 183 - 211.
- Chen, Ying, and Hülya Eraslan. 2017. "Dynamic Agenda Setting." *American Economic Journal: Microeconomics*, 9 (2): 1-32. DOI: 10.1257/mic.20150298

- Coleman, R., McCombs, M., Shaw, D. & Weaver, D. (2009). Agenda setting. In Wahl-Jogensen, K. and Hanitzsch, T. (Eds.), *The handbook of journalism studies* (pp. 147-160). New York: Routledge.
- Coleman, R., & Wu, H. D. (2010). Proposing Emotion as a Dimension of Affective Agenda Setting: Separating Affect into Two Components and Comparing Their Second-Level Effects. *Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly*, 315-327
- Cuestas Olivares, J., Freille, S., & O'Gorman, P. (2009). The Media and Public Agendas: Testing for Media Effects in Argentina During 2003-2008. *SSRN Electronic Journal*, 47(1), 97- 124.. doi: 10.2139/ssrn.1714034
- DAWN (2018). DAWN Newspaper. Retrieved May 13, 2018, from Wikipedia, The Free Encyclopedia.: [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Dawn\\_\(newspaper\)](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Dawn_(newspaper))
- Dunn, S. (2009). Candidate and Media Agenda Setting in the 2005 Virginia Gubernatorial Election. *Journal Of Communication*, 59(3), 635-652. doi: 10.1111/j.1460-2466.2009.01442.x
- Freeland, A. 2012. *An Overview of Agenda Setting Theory in Mass Communications*. Denton, TX: University of North Texas
- Ghanem, S., & Wanta, W. (2006). Agenda-Setting and Spanish Cable News. *Journal Of Broadcasting & Electronic Media*, 45(2), 277-289. doi: 10.1207/s15506878jobem4502\_5
- Golan, G., & Wanta, W. (2001). Second-Level Agenda Setting in the New Hampshire Primary: A Comparison of Coverage in Three Newspapers and Public Perceptions of Candidates. *Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly*, 78(2), 247-259. doi:10.1177/107769900107800203
- Guizlo, C. (2012). Dealing with Jell-O": How Framing and Agenda Setting Affected Public Opinion In the 2011 Debt Ceiling Debate. Retrieved January 12, 2018, from <http://www.american.edu/soc/communication/upload/Chris-Guizlo.pdf>
- Hannigan, J.A. (1995) *Environmental Sociology: A Social Constructionist Perspective*. Routledge Press, London.
- Harris, P., Kolovos, I., & Lock, A. (2001). Who sets the agenda? - An analysis of agenda setting and press coverage in the 1999 Greek European elections. *European Journal of Marketing*, 35 (9/10), 1117-1135. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1108/03090560110401947>

- Hopmann, D.N., Vliegenthartb, R., Vreeseb, C.D., & Albæka, E. 2010. Effects of election news coverage: How visibility and tone influence party choice. *Political Communication*, 27: 389-405.
- Idid, S. A., & Chang, P.K. (2012). The media and public agenda among the Malay and Chinese communities during the 2008 Malaysian General Elections. *Asian Social Science* 8(5): 107-115.
- Kiousis, S., Bantimaroudis, P., & Ban, H. (1999). Candidate Image Attributes: Experiments on the Substantive Dimension of Second Level Agenda Setting. *Communication Research*, 26, 414.
- Kim, Y., Kim, Y., & Zhou, S. (2017). Theoretical and methodological trends of agenda-setting theory. *The Agenda Setting Journal*, 1(1), p.84,5-22. doi: 10.1075/asj.1.1.03kim
- Lippmann, W. (1922). *Public opinion*. New York: Macmillan, p.29
- Mahan, A. T. (2003). The Interest of America in Sea Power-Present and Future. . In M. Yunus, *Foreign Policy: A Theoretical Introduction*. Karachi: Oxford University Press.
- McCombs, M., & Shaw, D. (1972). The Agenda-Setting Function of Mass Media. *Public Opinion Quarterly*, 36(2), 176-187. doi: 10.1086/267990
- McCombs, M., & Reynolds, A. (2002). News influence on our pictures of the world. In J. Bryant & D. Zillmann (Eds.), *LEA's communication series. Media effects: Advances in theory and research* (p. 1-18). Lawrence Erlbaum Associates Publishers
- McCombs, M. E.; Llamas, J. P.; Lopez-Escobar, E.; Rey, F. (1997). "Candidate's images in Spanish elections: Second-level agenda-setting effects". *Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly*. 74 (4): 703-717. doi:10.1177/107769909707400404.Pdf.
- McCombs, M. & Estrada, G. (1997). The news media and the pictures in our heads. In S. Iyengar & R. Reeves (Eds.). *Do the Media Govern? Politicians, Voters, and Reporters in America*. (237-247). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- McCombs, M., Shaw, D , Weaver, David H. (November 2014). "New Directions in Agenda-Setting Theory and Research". *Mass Communication & Society*. 17 (6): 781-802. doi:10.1080/15205436.2014.964871.

- McCombs, M., Lopez-Escobar, E., & Llamas, J. (2000). Setting the Agenda of Attributes in the 1996 Spanish General Election. *Journal Of Communication*, 50(2), 77-92. doi: 10.1111/j.1460-2466.2000.tb02842.x
- Media of Pakistan, W. (2018). Media of Pakistan. Retrieved February 10 , 2018, from Wikipedia, The Free Encyclopedia.:  
[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Media\\_of\\_Pakistan#History](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Media_of_Pakistan#History)
- Merrill, J. C. (1995). Global journalism. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- Mikami, S., Takeshita, T., Nakada, M., & Kawabata, M. (1995). The media coverage and public awareness of environmental issues in Japan. *Gazette (Leiden, Netherlands)*, 54(3), 209-226. doi: 10.1177/001654929505400302
- MoFA. Ministry of Foreign Affairs. Government of Pakistan, <<http://www.mofa.gov.pk/content.php?pageID=Foreign%20Policy>>, accessed 5 November 2015b.
- Muddiman, A., Stroud, N. J., & McCombs, M. (2014). Media Fragmentation, Attribute Agenda Setting, and Political Opinions About Iraq. *Journal of Broadcasting & Electronic Media*, 215-233.
- Mun, W. F., & Li, L. M. 2011. "Vote for me!": A content analysis of news reports leading to the 12th general election. *Political Communication*, 3(1): 31-47.
- Palmgreen, P. & Clarke, P. (1977). Agenda setting with local and national issues. *Communication Research*, 4. (pp. 435-452) In McCombs, Maxwell & Bell, Tamara. (1996) "The Agenda Setting Role of Mass Communication" article published in "An Integrated Approach to Communication Theory and Research, New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates Publishers.
- Timeline of U.S. Aid to Pakistan. (2009). Retrieved January 20 , 2019 , from Newsweek:  
<https://www.newsweek.com/timeline-us-aid-pakistan-81153>
- Wang, T. L. (2000). Agenda-setting online: An experiment testing the effects of hyperlinks in online newspapers. *Southwestern Mass Communication Journal*, 15(2), 59-70. Retrieved on 23 June 2019.  
[https://books.google.com.pk/books?id=3Je3AwAAQBAJ&pg=PA394&lpg=PA394&dq=Wang,+T.+L.+\(2000\)](https://books.google.com.pk/books?id=3Je3AwAAQBAJ&pg=PA394&lpg=PA394&dq=Wang,+T.+L.+(2000)).

Wu, H. D., & Coleman, R. (2009). Advancing Agenda-Setting Theory: The Comparative Strength and New Contingent Conditions of the Two Levels of Agenda-Setting Effects. *Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly*, 775-789.