

An Analysis of Refugee Rights and Human Security: A Case Study of Germany

Tabita Victor

Lecturer,

Political Science Department

Kinnaird College for Women, Lahore

Correspondence: tabita.victor@kinnaird.edu.pk

Mubina Masood

Student, Political Science Department

Kinnaird College for Women Lahore

ABSTRACT

Refugees have been recognized as people who have fled from wars, conflicts and crossed international borders to seek safe havens. With the rapid rise in conflicts and displaced people, many countries have played prominent figures in trying to safeguard the rights of refugees. Germany is considered one of the most considerate and welcoming countries towards the huge inflow of refugees. It enacts as a safe harbour for refugees mostly pouring in from Syria, Iraq and Afghanistan, annually, and has its constitution catering the preservation of fundamental rights of refugees. The objective of this search was to recognize the status of refugees in Germany, analyze its role in proving human security, and then propose efficient remedies that can be implemented. It is a qualitative study, and data was collected from secondary resources, ranging from the time period 2011-2017. Also, Securitization theory was used to analyze the findings. The results of the study showed that the right to be employed, seek residence, attain education, asylum, enjoy health facilities and be granted human security are the fundamental refugee rights recognized by German while racism, language barriers, educational restraints, limited job opportunities, limited basic resources and family enact as major challenges for refugees. Moreover, the German government has faced the challenges of providing equal opportunities to all refugees, dealing with opposition pressure, catering the needs of a huge inflow of people, maintaining budget, keeping documentation, and introduced policies such as the Open Door Policy, Deportation Policy, Asylum Policy, Quota Policy, New Immigration Policy, Subsidiary Policy, and Education Integration Policy in an attempt to safeguard the rights of refugees.

Keywords: *Refugee Rights, Challenges, Human security, Germany.*

Introduction

Refugees are people who have escaped war, suppression, conflict, violence and moved across international borders, in an attempt to search for a safe place. According to International Refugees Convention of 1951, article 1(A) (2) has defined refugee as “an individual who is outside his or her country of nationality or habitual residence who is unable or unwilling to return due to a well-founded fear of persecution based on his or her race, religion, nationality, political opinion, or membership in a particular social group (Center, 2012).

Refugee Rights

In the year 2017, around 25.4 million people, which include men, women and children, have been recorded as refugees all around the world. Internationally, the rights of these refugees have been defined by the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and safeguarded with the help of conventions which include the International Convention of 1951, Optional Protocol of 1967, and the Geneva conventions. These conventions, along with the UDHR, have established that refugees are meant to enjoy all basic fundamental rights (Center, 2012).

Human Security

Human security is one of the most essential human rights. It has been stated that it is the duty of the government to ensure that its civilians are provided with full security against military oppression, poverty, diseases, communal hate, etc. Since refugees are people who flee from their nations due to facing a threat, it is essential for the host country to provide these people with a secure environment (Gregoratti, 2018).

Refugee Crisis

The refugee crisis, defined as a huge displacement of people, emerged as a phenomenal issue in 2001 when wars started taking place in the world. These wars include US-Afghan war, Iraq-USA war, etc taking place, and they displaced many humans causing them to seek for safer havens. The Arab spring issue also sprung during this time, which included civilians of many Middle-Eastern countries rebelling against their governments and demanding for democracy and the Syrian war that started in 2012 increased the ratio of these displaced people, resulting in many nations dealing with a huge inflow of people asking permission to be granted asylum. The nations known to be most welcoming towards refugees include Scandinavian, European nations, etc. Pakistan was considered a favourable haven for refugees, too, until it started experiencing incidences of terrorism. It received around 1.6 million Afghan refugees and had to tackle the burden of providing these people with basic necessities. Most of these people are still deprived of the privilege of enjoying their basic necessities. However, after Pakistan started its war against terrorism, the flow of refugees shifted towards Europe. Germany was recognized as one of the most welcoming nations towards refugees. In 2015, its chancellor 'Angela Merkel' played a significant role in safeguarding the rights of refugees and introduced several crucial refugee laws. Yet, the conservative mindsets observed on the Eastern side of Germany and its right-wing parties made Angela Merkel adopt a rather restrictive approach towards refugees.

Universal Declaration of Human Rights

In the year 1946, a newly established Economic and Social Council drafted a bill. This council was set up by the commission of Human rights, and its bill was primarily meant for only 3 states and later stretching to incorporate 8 states. After essential fundamental human rights were defined, this bill finally included the clause that every person has to escape political oppression and to be granted asylum (Kapfere, 2008). After this draft, the United Nations Assembly was established, and this assembly produced the Universal Declaration of Human Rights in 1948. The clauses of this declaration included safeguarding the rights of refugees. Example, Article 14 of this declaration stated that enjoying asylum was

An Analysis of Refugee Rights and Human Security: A Case Study of Germany

every person's right. Also, since refugees are to enjoy basic human fundamental rights, the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees was later set up to deal with the emerging refugee crisis (Kapfere, 2008). Universally, the fundamental rights recognized by the Universal Declaration of Human Rights include the right to leave a country, education, movement, freedom of speech, being provided security, life, nationality, health facilities, etc. Also, the social, economic and cultural rights are also recognized by this declaration. The International Bill of Human rights is actually formed by combining the clauses of UNHCR, International Covenant regarding both civil and political rights, Covenant on the Economic and social crisis (Alveng, 2013).

Germany's role in safeguarding Refugee rights

Germany has been observed to receive a huge inflow of refugees. It is known as the second most welcoming nation towards refugees, and article 16a of its constitution states that Germany should give asylum to those who are fleeing from political threat and oppression. Also, Germany follows the clauses of the Geneva Convention that states that anyone escaping from a war is a refugee (Achakzai, 2018).

The right to being given asylum was actually included in Germany's constitution after World War II. The consequences of that deadly war led to Germany playing a pivotal role for refugees and giving asylum to every politically oppressed civilian, yet after 1930, this clause was limited by adding in some terms and conditions, and many parties supported this amendment. It basically takes 2/3 of parliament votes for making an amendment to the German constitution. Furthermore, German has worked to make the integration process, which is essential for refugees to act as functional members of the society, easier for refugees by establishing health camps, schools, providing special education to refugee children and adults, trying to provide everyone with shelter, dealing with legal age issues, etc. Yet, catering the demands of the huge number of refugees still proves to be challenging for Germany (Trines, 2019). Angela Merkel, the German Chancellor elected in 2015, also played a huge part in trying to adopt a liberal approach towards refugees. Her policies were considered to be extremely lenient towards refugees, and she offers solutions that managed to make Germany one of the most favourable choices for refugees. Yet, due to certain obstacles and political pressure, Angela had to adopt a restrictive attitude towards refugees (Mohdin, 2017). Studies show that between the years 2011-2017, 2015 was the year when Germany received the highest inflow of refugees, due to Angela Merkel's pro-refugee policies. Many stated this liberal attitude was resultant of a personal agenda, too. However, at the start of 2017, Angela Merkel established a rather restrictive approach towards refugees which limited their flow into the country (Trines, 2019).

Angela Merkel's shift from leniency to adopting a lenient approach towards refugees can be shown by the reports presented by the Federal Office of Migration in 2015. During the months between January and November, Germany received 425,035 applications demanding for asylum. The applicants mostly included people from Syria, Afghanistan, Iran, Albanians, etc. These statistics were doubled the number of applications submitted in 2014 (Gesley, 2016). Furthermore, Germany is known to provide mandatory benefits to refugees. These people have been granted the right to be given houses, food, jobs, shelter, medical care,

monthly allowance, etc. (Gesley, 2016). In the year 2015, Angela Merkel's refugee policy gave more than 306, 574 jobs to refugees to make the integration process quick for them. (Petzinger, 2018). But her recent policies dealt with developed a restrictive approach towards refugees. Also, with the arrival of Angela Merkel hate slightly decreased (Barigazii, 2018). Thus, with the need to safeguard the rights of a refugee by the German constitution, Germany is working to establish a safe haven for refugees. It has been dealing with several obstacles on the way and political biases. Yet, it is still considered as an approachable choice by the refugees.

The significance of this study is that it is focusing on several dimensions that focus on safeguarding the rights of refugees. Unlike other studies, it is giving an in-depth analysis of the refugee's rights and provision of human security in Germany.

Problem Statement

A huge ratio of refugees is moving to Europe; pouring into countries which are welcoming their arrival. These nations include Germany, Canada, Turkey, Greece, Switzerland, Spain, Australia, UK, etc. Germany is recognized as to be the second most accommodating nation with regards to refugees. Yet, refugee rights, matters of human security and the obstacles faced by those refugees are still undermined in that nation. This study attempted to identify and analyze the provision of human security, rights of refugees and policies in Germany which are undermined and not well-known.

Research Objectives

- To identify the rights of refugees recognized by the Universal Declaration of Human Rights
- To analyze the rights and human security granted to refugees in Germany.
- To explore the policies introduced by the German government for safeguarding refugee rights and providing them with security.
- To propose solutions that should be employed to preserve refugee rights and provide them with security in Germany.

Research Questions

1. What are the rights granted to refugees recognized by the Universal Declaration of Human Rights?
2. What are the rights and secure facilities granted to refugees in Germany?
3. What are the challenges faced by refugees in Germany?
4. What are the policies pioneered by the German government for safeguarding the rights of refugees and providing them with human security?
5. What remedies can be adopted to preserve refugee rights in Germany?

Theoretical Framework

This research analyzes the rights of refugees and human security conditions in Germany. It explores refugee rights, how Germany is working towards

An Analysis of Refugee Rights and Human Security: A Case Study of Germany

safeguarding these rights, the difficulties faced by its refugees and government and what type of policies it has adopted to safeguard refugee rights. Furthermore, Securitisation theory has been employed to study the results of this research. This theory states that very often laws are rejected due to them being a threat to a nation's security. Such is the case in Germany. the nation has its right-wing parties been rejecting many laws and policies, which are essential for safeguarding refugee rights, by stating that these laws are a threat to security. These ring-wing parties follow a conservative school of thought, so are not in favour of showing leniency and welcoming attitudes towards refugees. Their claim is that the huge inflow of refugees causes the crime rate to increase and terror-attacks to occur more frequently.

The United Nations Charter clauses, which are meant for safeguarding the rights of refugees, have also been incorporated in this study. These rights include the right to provide nationality to whoever enters one state, right to freedom of speech, right to enjoy the health facilities, get educated, find a residence, right to mobility, etc, and are meant to be followed on both international and national level, indirectly safeguarding the rights of refugees. However, the rights that are more specifically defined by the Universal Declaration of Human Rights for safeguarding the rights of refugees include the following: "Everyone has the right to freedom of movement and residence within the borders of each State. Everyone has the right to leave any country, including his own, and to return to his country." This is the 13th clause of the UDHR, and it states that every person can move and take asylum in a nation. Regardless of the status, everyone has the right to leave a nation or return back to it. "Everyone has the right to seek and to enjoy in other countries asylum from persecution." This right may not be invoked in the case of prosecutions genuinely arising from non-political crimes or from acts contrary to the purposes and principles of the United Nations." This 14th clause of the UDHR defines enjoying asylum as a defined right for everyone. It doesn't matter if the reasons behind seeking asylum are political or not. The UDHR states that everyone can seek and enjoy asylum in different states (UNHCR, 2018). "Everyone has the right to a nationality. No one shall be arbitrarily deprived of his nationality nor denied the right to change his nationality". The 15th clause of UDHR facilitates the integration process by declaring that everyone is allowed to change nationalities. This right is essential for settling down in many countries (UNHCR, 2018).

Variable Selection Criteria

The variables selected are meant to ensure completing the objectives of this study. These variables include

- **Refugee Rights:** Refugees are people who have been given the right to attain or seek asylum. Internationally, their rights, which include providing them with full human security, are recognized and preserved.
- **Human Security:** Human security is one of the fundamental human rights and represents the concept that every person is to be provided security by its state whether this security includes protecting them from military oppression, poverty, etc.

- **Challenges faced by refugees:** The challenges faced by refugees are the distinct obstacles faced by refugees while attempting to enjoy their fundamental rights. These obstacles usually include being oppressed by racist mindsets, unable to fight against political biases, etc.
- **Challenges faced by the Government:** The obstacles faced by governments are the distinct barriers that hinder governments from safeguarding the right of refugees. These barriers/obstacles can include being dominated by their opposition parties, dealing with a massive inflow of civilians, etc.
- **Policies adopted to safeguard refugee rights;** The policies adopted to safeguard refugee rights are the tools employed to ensure that refugees are able to enjoy their rights. These strategies can include New Immigration policy, etc.

Dependent Variable

Rights of Refugee

The 'refugee rights' recognized by Germany is the dependent variable in this research study. These rights have been defined by its constitution and are meant to be safeguarded. Germany provides a flexible environment to ensure a welcoming attitude towards refugees and works to ensure safeguarding rights that have been defined by the Universal Charter of Human Rights.

Human Security

The provision of security in Germany is taken as a variable in this study. Human security is one of the fundamental human rights and its fulfilment is essential for safeguarding the rights of refugees. Refugees are people who have actually fled from their nations due to fear of oppression, so granting them security is essential.

Independent Variables

a) Challenges faced by the refugees

The challenges experienced by refugees in Germany include becoming targets of hate-attacks, gang-crimes and dealing with language barriers. Also, the right-wing parties of Germany are fairly conservative so observe a restrictive attitude towards refugees. Due to Germany receiving a huge number of refugees, it is observed that refugees living there have to deal with being unable to enjoy health and educational facilities, struggle getting jobs and becoming legal residents. Also, the process of integration is slow which leads to many refugees struggling to fit in with their society. These challenges have been catered by this study because of their relevance and have a negative effect on the safeguarding of refugee rights in Germany.

Challenges faced by the Government

The challenges faced by the government of Germany are the obstacles that are preventing Germany from safeguarding the rights of refugees. These challenges include dealing the pressure received from the right-wing and anti-refugee parties, countering the severity of hate-crimes against refugees, providing basic necessities health to a huge number of refugees, among which many are in need for immediate

An Analysis of Refugee Rights and Human Security: A Case Study of Germany

assistance and making the integration progress efficient enough to ensure that refugees are able to become productive members of the society. These challenges are included in this study because of their relevance, and they hinder the German government from completely safeguarding the rights of refugees.

Policies regarding the rights of Refugees

The policies pioneered by the government of Germany for safeguarding refugee rights are techniques and strategies introduced to ensure that refugees are able to enjoy their rights. These policies include Open Door Policy, Deportation Policy, etc, and are included in this study to analyze their efficiency with regards to the safeguarding of refugee rights.

Research Methodology

This research has been carried out by employing an explanatory research design. It is a qualitative study, and data was collected by using secondary resources. This study employed qualitative means to explore and investigate the trends mandatory for analyzing the rights of refugees in Germany. Data has been retrieved from secondary resources such as journals, books and published studies in order to analyze refugee rights from a new perspective.

Also, Germany has been selected as a case study because it has been recognized as one of the most eager nations to welcome refugees. It has accepted refugees mostly from Afghanistan, Pakistan, Syria, etc, which makes it a favourable choice to be selected for a case study. Also, while many nations all over the world are favouring refugees from Libya, Darfur, Mexico, Germany is favouring refugees from Syria, Afghanistan and Pakistan over the others. The time period chosen for this research is from 2011-2017. It had been selected due to this period being essential to explore the distinct shift in a number of refugees entering Germany. At the beginning of 2017, it was observed that the rapid inflow of refugees pouring into Germany reached its peak due to Germany's chancellor, Angela Merkel, adopting lenient policies and playing a trivial role for safeguarding the rights of refugees. Yet, the year 2017 experienced a decrease in the flow of refugees pouring into Germany due to the restrictive measures taken. For data collection, books, published reports and journals were studied. These publishing reports included United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees, Universal Declaration of Human Rights, Asylum Information Database, European council of refugees and exile, Info Migrant, Bundesamt fur Migration and Fluctlinge, Working group of European Nurse Researchers, Federation Office for Migration and Refugees, etc. Content analysis is a technique used to derive a conclusion from written documentaries. This method is used for collecting qualitative conclusions from quantitative results. In order to get the results, this study analyzed the collected data through content analysis technique which aided in interpreting quantitative content and reaching to qualitative conclusions.

Findings

Since the beginning of 2001, wars began in nations including Iran, Afghanistan, Syria, etc. These wars were mostly civil wars led by US-Coalition meant for overthrowing the state government. And along with these wars, the events of Arab spring took place which was basically an uprising of civilians to support democracy. These uprisings took place in countries including Tunisia, Egypt,

Morocco, Libya, Syria, etc (Black, 2001). The result of these wars and uprisings led to 1.5 million people becoming displaced and fleeing to take refuge in other countries. Germany was quickly acknowledged as one of the favoured choices of refugees because it was favouring refugees from Afghanistan, Syria, etc, over others. Also, it has its constitution recognizing the basic rights of refugees. Furthermore, poverty was not considered as a factor for granting asylum by Germany, and it took time to grant asylum to refugees fleeing from civil wars. In 2011, it was observed that a huge ratio of refugees began eyeing Germany as a preferred choice. This inflow reached its peak in the year 2015 when Angela Merkel was able to get re-elected (Connolly & Henley, 2018). Angela Merkel adopted liberal policies to facilitate and safeguard the rights of refugees. Her liberal policies were eyed with scepticism, with the right-wing claiming that she had a personal agenda behind her lenient approach. Yet, it was observed that one of the reasons Angela Merkel adopted a lenient approach towards refugees included having previously witnessed the successful integration of refugees. Thus, whatever the case, Angela worked to safeguard the rights of refugees by adopting a welcoming attitude, opening borders, etc, yet these lenient ways were admonished by Germany's right-wing parties who pressurized Angela into adopting a restrictive approach.

Provision of Human Security in Germany

The basic human rights are distinguished to be violated all over the world. Although recognized, these rights haven't been safeguarded in an efficient manner. Such is the case in Germany where despite attempts being made to ensure that basic human rights are preserved and civilians are given enough provision to feel secure, there have been incidences of gang crimes and hate attacks reported (Kessier, 2015). Refugees have been reported to face immense security crisis in Germany. Because of their huge number, many of them are kept deprived of basic rights and have to deal with an insecure environment. For example, in East Germany, where conservative mindsets are prevailing, there have been several hate crimes reported (Bencek & Strasheim, 2016). Muslims and Jews are reported to be among those who are often targeted by gangs and racist people. Also, scepticism towards refugees arose because when Angela Merkel tried to employ a lenient approach towards refugees.

Also, the health of many refugees in Germany has been threatened due to lack of facilities and budget constraints. So despite Germany being a non-permanent member of the Security Council and having its constitution safeguard human rights, it still has to take some measures that will help the nation ensure a friendly and safe environment for everyone.

Policies regarding Refugees in Germany

Since the increased inflows of refugees in Germany, there have been several policies and laws introduced to facilitate these people. These policies and laws include the following:

- **Open-door Refugee Policy**

Angela Merkel established the open-door refugee policy in 2015 which basically included building transit centres for refugees near the borders of the country and opening borders to welcome a huge inflow of refugees. However, in early 2016

An Analysis of Refugee Rights and Human Security: A Case Study of Germany and 2017; it was rebuked because of receiving extreme retaliation from the right-wing parties and neighbouring nations (Pinkerton, 2018).

- **Integration Policy**

The integration policy was introduced by Germany in early 2006 for regulating a law meant of incorporating refugees into the system. In 2012, this policy was further improvised by having it include the clause of accepting the foreign degrees of refugees. The policy worked on methods that worked on the process of monitoring, focusing on demand and supply, the heterogeneous elements, etc (Brenner, 2018).

- **New Immigration Law**

In order to incorporate refugees into their system and promote the acceptance of workforce into their country, the German government introduced a new law in 2017, known as immigrant law, which claimed that anyone with training could come to Germany and spend a six-month-long tenure in an attempt for finding a job. The effect of this policy was proven by the fact that around 650000 workers have poured into the nation because of this policy (Dernbach & Starzmann, 2018).

- **Asylum Law**

The Asylum law has been known to reflect the constitutional beliefs of Germany. According to it, refugees can attain residence in Germany with regards to a clause of 1951's convention. The enactment of this law was taken place during the regime of Angela Merkel in 2015. Yet, due to facing immense opposition from the right-wing parties, she had to adopt restrictive measures against refugees in the year 2017 (Petzinger, 2018).

- **Ban on Deportation**

The German Government has the authority to ban people. Yet, with the arrival of Angela Merkel, this act was banned in order to make the process of integration easy for refugees (Refugees, 2016).

- **Acceptance of Refugees**

One of the policies that have made the opposition parties protest against the government was that Angela allowed the refugees, who have applied to any other EU nation, to still have a chance in attaining residence in Germany (AFP, 2015).

- **Subsidiary Law**

Subsidiary Law is known as a protection program which is provided to those immigrants entering Germany on the claim that they are in severe danger in their home country (Refugees, 2019).

- **Quota Policy**

The Quota policy was recommended in the year 2015. It consisted of accepting a set number of refugees and setting a specific budget for them, funded by the European Union. However, in early 2016, the right-wing parties asked for the abolishment of this policy, given that they considered this policy a burden on the economy (Brunsdon, Barker, Peel, & Khan, 2018).

- **Educational Integration Policy**

In order to integrate refugees into their society, the German government introduced the policy of making all refugees attend the same school. This was to aid them in being able to integrate on a more comfortable level. Research shows that this policy wasn't that effective, given that many refugees weren't able to even pass the basic German courses

Refugee Rights in Germany

Today, Germany is known to receive a huge amount of refugees. These can be categorized into four groups; expellees, displaced people, political refugees, and neo-refugees. The monthly reports submitted by the Federal Office for Migration showed that, in 2015, during the months between January and November, Germany received 425,035 applications demanding for asylum. The applicants mostly included people from Syria, Afghanistan, Iran, Albanians, etc (Congress, 2016).

- **Right to be given Asylum**

Being given asylum from other countries is registered as one of the clauses of the United Declaration of Human rights, and Germany, too, now grants refugees the right to attain an asylum status. Previously, this right wasn't granted until 2007 because of political scenarios (Congress, 2016).

- **Right of Residence**

Germany has also incorporated some building plans and an energy law that is meant for facilitating and accelerating the process of arranging homes for refugees. Also, jobs are given in Germany on the basis of securing a permanent residence, so Germany has set a specific tenure for providing its refugees with permanent residence (Congress, 2016).

- **Right to enjoy Basic Necessities of Life**

It is a fundamental right of all refugees, in fact, all human, to be able to enjoy the basic necessities of life. These include the ability to be able to purchase a house, clothes, food, etc. Germany has granted this right to its refugees. Previously, refugees residing in Germany were given benefits in the form of different commodities, along with cash money. However, there were some amendments made to this rule, and now refugees only enjoy necessary items like food, heat, clothing, etc, and are only given cash if necessary (Congress, 2016).

- **Right to be granted Nationality**

Germany has a whole set of conditions and terms meant to be met if a person wants to become a citizen of Germany. These conditions include that the person must have been residing in Germany for eight years, must be committed to the constitution, must have given up the previous nationality, have no criminal record, can communicate fluently in the German language, must be aware of the legal system, along with the living conditions, of Germany (Refugees, 2019).

An Analysis of Refugee Rights and Human Security: A Case Study of Germany

- **Right to Health Care**

Germany has granted the refugees the right to attain health care to a restricted limit. It provides basic needs along with monthly allowance to facilitate its recipient's health demands. However, refugees in the first 15 months of stay are not granted the privilege to enjoy health insurance, given that their status is still ambiguous (Munz & Melcop, 2018).

- **Right to Education**

Education is a fundamental right for all humans. Germany, too, has made it mandatory for all children to attend school regardless of their status, yet there are some loopholes in this. Given that in some states mandatory education is completed by the age of 16, these children do not have the right to attain education, so Germany has to make the integration process possible for such citizens (Brenner, 2016).

- **Right to Employment**

Germany has given limited access for refugees to enjoy their right to work. There is a time limit set that actually grants refugees access to participate in the Labor Market. This is until the time period refugees have to stay in the Reception centre. This time period can actually range from 12 to 24 months and is so prolonged because BAMF needs to decide whether it is accepting the refugee's application, or not. However, despite this presenting a biased treatment, Germany does provide its refugees with employment opportunities, whereas other communities do not (Mehta, 2018)

Challenges Faced by Refugees in Germany

Despite Germany receiving a huge inflow of refugees on an annual basis and having its constitution actually incorporate the rights of Refugee, there are certain restrictions and problems faced by the Refugees living in Germany which are as follows:

- **Racist Attitudes**

There have been a series of racist and violent acts against refugees being observed in Germany. These crimes are the resultant of Merkel's lax policies and show the existence of traditional mindsets still prominent in Eastern Germany (Hindy, 2016). Example of such a case is of Somi, a Syrian refugee residing in Germany, who was not given a flat because he didn't know the German language (Alhamdo, 2018). The increasing flow of refugees also burdens the economy, causing some German natives to get infuriated by the provision of limited resources. In 2017, 2200 refugees were said to be attacked at their homes. Angela Merkel accused the far-right wing Germany party of spreading this amount of hatred (Dambach, 2018), and in the year 2016, there were 3500 attacks on refugees which included arson and physical attacks. 1380 amount of verbal abuse was also observed (News, Germany hate crime: Nearly 10 attacks a day on migrants in 2016, 2017).

- **Missing Refugee Children**

In 2017, 8991 children below the age of 14 in Germany were reported missing. It was claimed that these children, given their vulnerable situation, easily become

victims of human-trafficking gangs, criminals (Finsely, 2018). This data has been provided by Germany's national security force, also known as Bundeskriminalam, and it made the authorities reach the conclusion that local gangs are probably responsible for this. Although, it has also been suggested that these missing children could probably be staying with their parents (UNICEF, 2017). Furthermore, due to the high increase in the number of missing refugee children in 2016, from 4749 to 8911, an analysis was conducted, and it was established by the BKA that many refugee children were not missing; they simply went to stay with their relatives. Yet, the German child protection programs showed cynicism to these results.

- **Limited Education Facilities**

The language barrier and certain other measures enact as obstacles for refugees to attain education in Germany. People above the age of 16 are not given the privilege of attaining education, which causes them to not attain a degree (WENR, 2016). Also, there are several schools that do not cater to the needs of refugee children, and vocal training is only for those who have secured residence in the states. In 2017/2016, 172 institutes supported the education of 6806 refugees, and several cases have since come forward which mentioned the struggle of refugees in attaining education in Germany. Furthermore, Statistics showed that from 2011-2015, around 284000 gave applications to be granted refugee in Germany (Vogel & Stock, 2017). Yet, many of these refugees are unable to get an education because the government are facing the problem of finding space for schools and teachers meant to allow refugee students to integrate into the German system. 14000 teachers have been hired, yet 2.3 billion Euros are still required to support the refugees (Brenner, 2016).

- **Limited Access to the Labor Market**

There is limited access given to refugees in Germany. They have to firstly surpass the time period of 24 months and gain a job permit for entering the Labor Market. Furthermore, after the refugees have surpassed the waiting time of 24 months, they need a job permit for entering the market, this permit is only granted when refugees have attained a solid job (University, 2018) Statistics showed that by January 2016, 129000 refugees were given jobs in Germany, which is an obvious raise from the previous year 2015 when the federal government allotted 10000 to give language training skills. In the years 2011 and 2012, it was observed that extremely qualified refugees were not being given a chance to proceed in the labour industry (Ott, 2013).

- **Separation of Families**

While taking refugee from German, many people have been reported to get separated from their family. While fathers are not permitted to bring their children and wife along to the new state, some families are separated at the borders (Young, 2017) Previously, in the years 2010 and 2013, 55,000 refugees were granted permission to be reunited with their families. 67, 677 were granted permission in 2014, and 82 400 were given permission in the year 2015. Yet, in 2016, Angela Merkel introduced a policy that started restricting the reunification of families. This was due to the pressure imposed by the right-wing parties (Brenner, 2018). In 2017, a poll took place which showed that only 23% of German natives were in

An Analysis of Refugee Rights and Human Security: A Case Study of Germany

favour of the reunification of families. Studies showed that most traditional and conservative views were found in Eastern Germany that led to there being a mutual dislike shown towards the refugees (VARA, 2018).

- **Difficulty in Health Facilities**

Due to the refugees entering Germany on a large scale, they found it incredibly difficult to have the government deal with their health issues. Mostly belonging to war-zone, such as Syria, etc, these refugees were mainly suffering from both mental and emotional issues (Bozorgmehr & Razum, 2016). Statistics show that in the year 2015, out of only 2205 refugees, mostly male, spent observation time in the nation's emergency wards, while 984 patients were officially registered which made it extremely difficult to treat all refugees and cater their needs, causing many of the vulnerable victims to remain left untreated and suffer from the side-effects of trauma (Borgschulte, Wiesmüller, Bunte, & Neuhann, 2018). Till the year 2017, there is still lack of data, computerization facilities available to cater the health facilities of refugees, help the vulnerable ones especially women and children, and provide them with appropriate therapies that would help the vulnerable ones escape their scars left behind by deep trauma (Borgschulte, Wiesmüller, Bunte & Neuhann, 2018).

Lack of Transparency

Another issue that refugees face is being unable to communicate with the German Government. Most of them are not sure about the refugee laws established in Germany. For example, the leniency in the banking system for refugees is not known by many, causing there to be ambiguity and confusion (Mehta, 2018).

Budget Constraints

Due to budget constraints, one of the major issues that refugees faced was the German Government failing to invest in different fields, which were mandatory for the integration of refugees. It was analyzed that Germany spent around 0.5% of its saving on refugees, while this investment increased from 244m Euros to 610m Euros in 2017, there was still lack of funding found when it came to the establishment of schools, shelters, for refugees (Detter & Reierman, 2016).

Challenges faced by the German Government

While having to cater the refugees, there were several challenges by the German government that have enacted as obstacles in the fulfilment of refugee rights in Germany. These obstacles include the following:

- i. Pressure from Right-Wing Parties**

While establishing refugee laws in Germany, there has been constant pressure from the right-wing parties who demand restrictive refugee laws. In 2015, Seehofer, an interior minister, legally protested against Angela Merkel's open-door policy. In fact, the German Chancellor found herself in severe troubles because of this policy and had to later sign a draft that restricted the limit of refugees entering the country. Only 200, 000 refugees can now enter Germany because of this law (Eddy, 2017).

ii. Pressure from the neighboring Countries

In 2015, Angela Merkel wanted to establish transition centres near the borders of Germany, in order to accommodate the refugees. Yet nations, such as Italy, believed that this would endanger their security so did not support this idea. This led to the idea of establishing transition centres get abolished (Connolly & Henley, 2018).

iii. Legal Age Problems

Due to the existence of different legal ages existing all over the world, the German Government faced the dilemma of providing degrees to those civilians who, according to their nation's legal age, passed the age of having the Government provide them with education (Trines, 2017).

iv. Health Facilities

Due to the increased flow of refugees, the German Government found it extremely challenging to deal with providing health facilities to all the refugees (Schaer, 2018). The CEO of a German Hospital claimed that mostly at the times refugees were brought to the hospitals, many of them required advanced facilities such as translators, etc, yet native authorities and insurers refrained from spending money on this, given that the additional facilities required a budget of around 100 Euros. In 2017, work is being done to allow refugees to attain jobs as nurses, doctors, hospital staff and two-year residency grants are being given to those who want to be established as refugees, yet there is still a long way to go for overcoming this challenging issue (Schaer, 2018).

v. Eastern Conservative Mindsets

The conservative and traditional existing on the Eastern side of Germany has enacted as a dilemma for the German government in establishing refugee laws. A poll showed that until 2017 only a total of 20% native Germans supported the fulfilment of refugee laws (Luyken, 2017).

vi. Language Issues

Almost 95% of the refugees entering Germany were not able to speak in Germany language, leading to Germany investing almost 1.2 billion Euros on language courses. Yet, it was analyzed in 2017 only half of these immigrants was able to give the test meant to make jobs accessible for them. In fact, it was only 37% of people who managed to pass the test. A study showed that the Audit office claimed that this was because of barely any students managing to attend the classes, leading to a lot of money being wasted and the courses failing in their attempts to integrate refugees into their system (Schaer, 2018).

vii. Employment

When welcoming refugees, it's essential to provide these people with jobs so that their maintenance will be made easy. Yet, out of these millions (1.4 million, to be exact) of refugees, only around 202,000 are provided with jobs in Germany that make them socially secure and add their contributions to society (Schaer, 2018). A recent survey of the German Chambers of Commerce exposed that companies taking part in 'Integrating Businesses in Refugees' found language barrier, illegal migration as one of the major constraints in hiring refugees. Also, the year-long

An Analysis of Refugee Rights and Human Security: A Case Study of Germany

tenure, rules, and processes linked with residency issues became a huge issue in being hired refugees (WENR, 2016).

viii. Challenging Bureaucracy

Bureaucracy only provoked the problems existing with the integration of refugees into the system. In cases of deportation, authorities had to wait for receiving proper documents from the refugee's nations before deporting people. The best cases of failing to deport an asylum seeker included the case of 'Anis Amri' who killed around 12 men in 2016 (Schaer, 2018).

ix. Educational Constraints

Dealing with young refugees, many German teachers have established new methods of teaching. German Educational System has claimed that this has caused a huge amount of improvement. Statistics showed that from 2015 to 2016, around half a million refugees entering the nation were around the age of 6 and 25 (Schaer, 2018). Since the 25-year-old refugees were meant to be considered old enough to leave, the government faced the dilemma of integrating these people in society. Example of such a case showed that in Bremen around 850 refugees didn't have the diploma or couldn't speak German language, so couldn't be integrated into different courses, etc. Because of this issue, the government was facing the threatening issue of gaining a forgotten generation.

Conclusion

In conclusion, the refugee crisis resultant of Afghan, Syrian, Iran wars, etc, led to a huge number of people looking for safe havens. Germany was analyzed to play a huge part in fulfilling the refugee rights. Due to it being focused on providing asylum to mostly war-zone countries, with Afghani refugees and Syrian refugees being favoured over others, it became a crucial pivot for these nations. The German chancellor, Angela Merkel, also played a pivotal role in safeguarding the rights of refugees. This qualitative research was carried out to analyze the rights of refugees and security conditions in Germany during the time period 2011-2017. It employed secondary resources for data collection and explored the rights of refugees and the policies adopted to safeguard them. The research analyzed that in Germany, refugees had to right to education, health, nationality, security, residence, employment, and basic necessities. Yet, for the safeguarding of these rights, it was observed that both the refugees and the government had to face many challenges; the refugees had to deal with the problem of facing racism, ambiguity, separation from families, treated as burdens, lack of opportunities, becoming victims of gang crimes, lack of proper health facilities, while the German government had to deal with the conventional right-wing parties, legal age problems limited resources, language barriers, and hardened Bureaucracy. Albeit, there were policies such as Asylum law, Immigration Law, Open-door policies, Subsidiary law, Educational integration law, Ban Deportation, Quota Policy, introduced to facilitate the refugees, yet most of these policies were abolished due to immense pressure, and it was analyzed that Germany still has some work to do in order to completely integrate refugees into its system.

Recommendations

Following are some of the recommendations that Germany can employ for safeguarding the rights of its refugees.

- The German government should fasten their procedure to grant permanent residence to the refugees.
- Additional Budget should be allocated for providing educational facilities to the refugee.
- Severe punishments must be given to those who are inducing hate attacks on refugees.
- Germany should strengthen its internal and external security and not let it be a barrier in establishing new laws.
- Open-door Policy should be introduced again, using a more strategic technique and keeping in view the humanitarian crisis.
- More job opportunities and easy methods of earning jobs should be provided.
- Contracts should be signed with neighbouring nations in order to support the living standards of refugees.
- The residential permit should be granted to refugees on easier terms in order to allow them to get good jobs.
- The ambiguous banking system available for refugees should be more concrete.
- Being a part of the European Union, the German Government should encourage the regulation of refugees among other states to reduce some of its burdens.
- Rehabilitation and trauma centres should be built to cater the health needs of refugees.
- The financial pros of how refugees can actually boost the economy should be promoted immensely.
- Being part of the European Union, it can raise the issue of the equal regulation of refugees among countries in order to lessen the burden of accommodating so many refugees all on its own.
- Social networking of the refugee must be encouraged. Cultural festivals should take place to help refugees in socializing with others.

References

- [1] Achakzai, A. W. (2018, November 23). *What's the right to asylum as stated in the German constitution?* Retrieved February 22, 2019, from IFOMIGRANTS: <https://www.infomigrants.net/en/post/13525/what-s-the-right-to-asylum-as-stated-in-the-german-constitution>
- [2] AFP. (2015, December 5). *Germany on course to accept 1 million refugees in 2015.* Retrieved February 2, 2019, from Guardian: <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/dec/08/germany-on-course-to-accept-one-million-refugees-in-2015>
- [3] Alhamdo, B. (2018, July 18). *Racism in German housing market drives Syrian refugees to scammers and con-artists.* Retrieved January 1, 2019, from The News Arab: <https://www.alaraby.co.uk/english/indepth/2018/7/18/racism-in-german-housing-market-drives-refugees-to-scammers>
- [4] Alveng, K. D. (2013). *International Recommendations on Refugee Statistics.* Scandinavia: University of Osloensis.
- [5] Barigazii, J. (2018, September 12). *Slight decrease in attacks against refugees in Germany.* Retrieved September 20, 2018, from Politico: <https://www.politico.eu/article/migration-germany-slight-decrease-in-attacks-against-refugees-in-germany/>
- [6] Black, R. (2001). Fifty Years of Refugee Studies: From Theory to Policy. *The International Migration Review*, 35(1), 57-78.
- [7] Bencek, D., & Strasheim, J. (2016, December 5). *Are refugees welcome? A dataset on anti-refugee violence in Germany.* Retrieved January 2, 2019, from Research & Politics: <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/10.1177/2053168016679590#articleCitationDownloadContainer>
- [8] Borgschulte, H. S., Wiesmuller, G. A., Bunte, A., & Neuhann, F. (2017, November 28). *Health care provision for refugees in Germany – one-year evaluation of an outpatient clinic in an urban emergency accommodation.* Retrieved January 4, 2019, from BMC Health Services Research: <https://bmchealthservres.biomedcentral.com/articles/10.1186/s12913-018-3174-y>
- [9] Borgschulte, H. S., Wiesmüller, G. A., Bunte, A., & Neuhann, F. (2018, July 25). *Health care provision for refugees in Germany – one-year evaluation of an outpatient clinic in an urban emergency accommodation.* Retrieved February 22, 2019, from BMC Health Service: <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC6016127/>

- [10] Bozorgmehr, K., & Razum, O. (2016). Refugees in Germany—untenable restrictions to health care. *Lancet*, 2351-2352.
- [11] Brenner, Y. (2016, August 12). *Germany Seeks to Integrate Refugees Through Education*. Retrieved March 1, 2019, from Refugees Deeply: <https://www.newsdeeply.com/refugees/articles/2016/08/16/germany-seeks-to-integrate-refugees-through-education>
- [12] Brenner, Y. (2016, August 16). *Germany Seeks to Integrate Refugees Through Education*. Retrieved November 1, 2019, from Refugees Deeply: <https://www.newsdeeply.com/refugees/articles/2016/08/16/germany-seeks-to-integrate-refugees-through-education>
- [13] Brenner, Y. (2018, July 12). *Refugees in Germany fight to unite with their families: 'They destroyed my life'*. Retrieved February 1, 2019, from Middle East Eye: <https://www.middleeasteye.net/news/refugees-germany-fight-unite-their-families-they-destroyed-my-life>
- [14] Centre, I. J. (2012). *Asylum and Refugee Rights*. Retrieved March 28, 2019, from International Justice Resource Centre: <https://ijrcenter.org/refugee-law/>
- [15] Congress, T. L. (2016, 6 21). *Refugee Law and Policy: Germany*. Retrieved December 22, 2018, from The Law Library of Congress: <https://www.loc.gov/law/help/refugee-law/germany.php>
- [16] Connolly, K., & Henley, J. (2018, June 22). *Angela Merkel stands firm as Germany's refugee row intensifies*. Retrieved December 1, 2018, from Guardian: <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2018/jun/15/angela-merkel-precarious-as-germany-refugee-row-intensifies>
- [17] Dambach, K. (2018, 2 28). *More than 2,200 attacks on refugees in Germany in 2017*. Retrieved January 2, 2019, from INFOMIGRANTS: <https://www.infomigrants.net/en/post/7797/more-than-2-200-attacks-on-refugees-in-germany-in-2017>
- [18] Dernbach, A., & Starzmann, P. (2018, October 8). *What's in the new German immigration law?* Retrieved January 2, 2019, from Euroactiv: <https://www.euractiv.com/section/central-europe/news/was-steht-im-neuen-einwanderungsgesetz/>
- [19] Detter, M., & Reierman, C. (2016, February 29). <https://www.spiegel.de/international/germany/budget-battle-begins-over-refugees-in-germany-a-1079864.html>. Retrieved April 1, 2019, from Spiegel Online: <https://www.spiegel.de/international/germany/budget-battle-begins-over-refugees-in-germany-a-1079864.html>

An Analysis of Refugee Rights and Human Security: A Case Study of Germany

- [20] Dettmer, M., & Reiermann, C. (2019, February 29). *Budget Battle Begins over Germany's New Residents*. Retrieved March 1, 2019, from Spiegel: <http://www.spiegel.de/international/germany/budget-battle-begins-over-refugees-in-germany-a-1079864.html>
- [21] Eddy, M. (2017, October 9). *Germany's Angela Merkel Agrees to Limits on Accepting Refugees*. Retrieved January 9, 2018, from The New York Times: <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/10/09/world/europe/germany-merkel-refugees.html>
- [22] Eurostat. (2018, May 22). *Migrant integration statistics – labour market indicators*. Retrieved January 22, 2019, from Eurostat: https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/statistics-explained/index.php/Migrant_integration_statistics_%E2%80%93_labour_market_indicators
- [23] Eurostat. (2019, March 12). *Asylum Statistics*. Retrieved April 2, 2019, from Eurostat: https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/statistics-explained/index.php/Asylum_statistics
- [24] Finsely, K. (2018, January 2). *Germany looks into ultrasound age tests on unaccompanied minor refugees*. Retrieved January 2, 2019, from DW: <https://www.dw.com/en/germany-looks-into-ultrasound-age-tests-on-unaccompanied-minor-refugees/a-47161360>
- [25] Gesley, J. (2016, March). *Refugee Law and Policy: Germany*. Retrieved August 28, 2018, from The Library of Congress: <https://www.loc.gov/law/help/refugee-law/germany.php>
- [26] Gregoratti, C. (14, December 2018). *Human Security*. Retrieved November 1, 2019, from Encyclopædia Britannica: <https://www.britannica.com/topic/human-security>
- [27] Gregoratti, C. (2018, December 14). *Human security*. Retrieved November 1, 2019, from Encyclopædia Britannica: <https://www.britannica.com/topic/human-security>
- [28] Hindy, L. (2016, September 6). *Germany's Syrian Refugee Integration Experiment*. Retrieved December 22, 2018, from The Century Foundation: <https://tcf.org/content/report/germanys-syrian-refugee-integration-experiment/>
- [29] Holmes, S., & Castande, H. (2016). Representing the “European refugee crisis” in Germany and beyond: Deservingness and difference, life and death. *American Ethnologist*, 43(1), 12-24. *American Ethnologist*, 43(1), 12-24.

- [30] Infomigrants. (2018, August 1). *Separation from family weighs hard on refugees*. Retrieved January 1, 2019, from Infomigrants: <https://www.infomigrants.net/en/post/12725/separation-from-family-weighs-hard-on-refugees>
- [31] International, S. (2016, 4 22). *Almost 6,000 Refugee Minors Missing in Germany in 2015*. Retrieved December 21, 2018, from Sputnik: <https://sputniknews.com/europe/201604111037799114-thousands->
- [32] Kapfere, S. (2008). Article 14(2) of the Universal Declaration Of Human Rights and Exclusion From Internation Refugee Protection. *Refugee Survey Quarterly*, 27(3), 54-74.
- [33] Kapferer, S. (2008, September 8). *Article 14(2) of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and Exclusion from International Refugee Protection*. Retrieved December 8, 2018, from Refugee Survey Quarterly: <https://academic.oup.com/rsq/article/27/3/53/1515102>
- [34] Kessler, A. (2015, June 3). *Germany: Human Rights Issues You Should Care About*. Retrieved November 1, 2019, from Liberties: <https://www.liberties.eu/en/news/human-rights-in-germany/4088>
- [35] Llgit, A., & Klotz, A. (2018, August 1). Refugee rights or refugees as threats? Germany's new Asylum policy. *The British Journal of Politics and International Relations*, 20(3), 613-631.
- [36] Luyken, J. (2017, September 1). *10 things you should know about refugees*. Retrieved December 1, 2018, from Local: <https://www.thelocal.de/20170901/10-things-to-know-about-refugees-and-asylum-in-germany>
- [37] Mehta, S. (2018, October 24). *How Integration Is Actually Working in Germany*. Retrieved February 19, 2019, from Refugee Deeply: <https://www.newsdeeply.com/refugees/community/2018/10/24/how-integration-is-actually-working-in-germany>
- [38] Mireku, O. (2002). South African Refugee Protection System: An Analysis of Refugee Status, Rights and Duties. *Law and Politics in Africa, Asia and Latin America*, 35(3), 399-413.
- [39] Mohdin, A. (2017, September 22). *How Germany took in one million refugees but dodged a populist uprising*. Retrieved November 1, 2019, from Quartz: <https://qz.com/1076820/german-election-how-angela-merkel-took-in-one-million-refugees-and-avoided-a-populist-upset/>
- [40] Munz, D., & Melcop, N. (2018, June 25). The psychotherapeutic care of refugees in Europe: treatment needs, delivery reality and recommendations for action. *European Journal of Psychotraumatol*, 9(1), 147-163.

An Analysis of Refugee Rights and Human Security: A Case Study of Germany

- [41] Nations, U. (2015). *United Declaration of Human Rights*. Europe: United Nation.
- [42] News, B. (2017, February 26). *Germany hate crime: Nearly 10 attacks a day on migrants in 2016*. Retrieved January 19, 2019, from BBC News: <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-39096833>
- [43] Ott, E. (2013). The labour market integration of resettled refugees. *UNHCR*, 1-64.
- [44] Petzinger, J. (2018, July 3). *Angela Merkel has ditched her open-door refugee policy to save her government*. Retrieved January 1, 2019, from Quartz: <https://qz.com/1319399/angela-merkel-agrees-to-abandon-germanys-open-door-refugee-policy-to-save-her-government/>
- [45] Petzinger, J. (2018, August 21). *More than 300,000 refugees have now found jobs in Germany*. Retrieved January 2, 2019, from Quartz: <https://qz.com/1364947/more-than-300000-refugees-have-now-found-jobs-in-germany/>
- [46] Petzinger, J. (2018, August 21). *More than 30000 refugees have now found jobs in Germany*. Retrieved September 27, 2018, from Quartz: <https://qz.com/1364947/more-than-300000-refugees-have-now-found-jobs-in-germany/>
- [47] Pinkerton, P. (2018, December 27). Governing Potential: Biopolitical Incorporation and the German 'Open-Door' Refugee and Migration Policy. *International Political Sociology*, 1-23.
- [48] Refugees, F. O. (2016, October 1). *National Ban on Deportation*. Retrieved March 1, 2019, from Federal Office for Migration and Refugees: <http://www.bamf.de/EN/Fluechtlingsschutz/AblaufAsylv/Schutzformen/AbschiebungsV/abschiebungsverbot-node.html>
- [49] Refugees, F. O. (2019, February 1). *Subsidiary Protection*. Retrieved March 1, 2019, from Federal Office for Migration and Refugees: www.bamf.de/EN/Fluennchtlingsschutz/AblaufAslyv/Schutzformen/SubsidiarerS/subsidiarer-schutz-node.html
- [50] Refugees, F. O. (2019, January). *Welcome to Refugees: Nationalization of Refugees*. Retrieved February 2019, from Federal Office for Migration and Refugees: <http://www.bamf.de/EN/Willkommen/Einbuengerung/InDeutschland/indeutschland-node.html>
- [51] Rights, G. I. (2015). *Parallel Report by the German Institute for Human Rights to the UN Committee on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination*. Berlin: German Institute for Human Rights.

- [52] Schaer, C. (2018, 1 26). *Five ways Germany is failing refugees*. Retrieved 4 22, 2019, from Handelsblatt: <https://www.handelsblatt.com/today/politics/immigration-issues-five-ways-germany-is-failing-refugees/23580886.html?ticket=ST-3938236-4GjyYAwOefjpHKLserWd-ap1>
- [53] Times, F. (2017, August 21). <https://www.ft.com/content/bea8507e-64cb-11e8-90c2-9563a0613e56>. Retrieved August 1, 2018, from Financial Times: <https://www.ft.com/content/bea8507e-64cb-11e8-90c2-9563a0613e56>
- [54] Trines, S. (2017, May 2). *Lessons From Germany's Refugee Crisis: Integration, Costs, and Benefits*. Retrieved April 2, 2019, from World Education News and Reviews: <https://wenr.wes.org/2017/05/lessons-germanys-refugee-crisis-integration-costs-benefits>
- [55] Trines, S. (2019, August 8). *The State of Refugee Integration in Germany in 2019*. Retrieved November 1, 2019, from World Education News + Reviews: <https://wenr.wes.org/2019/08/the-state-of-refugee-integration-in-germany-in-2019>
- [56] UNHCR. (2010). *Convention and Protocol Relating to the Status of Refugee*. Geneva, Switzerland: UNHCR.
- [57] UNICEF. (2017, 5 18). *Number of unaccompanied refugee children reaches 'record high'*. Retrieved 5 22, 2018, from DW: <https://m.dw.com/en/unicef-number-of-unaccompanied-refugee-children-reaches-record-high/a-38881924>
- [58] University, S. (2018, September 19). *When refugees are barred from working, long-term integration suffers*. Retrieved November 1, 2019, from Phys.org: <https://phys.org/news/2018-09-refugees-barred-long-term.html>
- [59] VARA, V. (2018, April 9). *Germany's Family Feud*. Retrieved February 2, 2019, from FP: <https://foreignpolicy.com/2018/04/09/germanys-family-feud-refugees-syria-reunification/>
- [60] Vogel, D., & Stock, E. (2017, November). Opportunities and Hope Through Education: How German Schools Include Refugees. *Educational International Research*, 1-39.
- [61] WENR. (2016, November 8). *Education in Germany*. Retrieved January 2 2018, 2019, from World Education News and Reviews: <https://wenr.wes.org/2016/11/education-in-germany>
- [62] Young, H. (2017, October 3). *What impact is family separation having on refugees in Germany?*